# Report on Findings of 

 Operational Efficiency Audit PD17-18-CC24-119Keith Balla and Richard Corcoran

Monday October 28, 2019

1. Initial Scope of Project
2. Financial History of State Aid
3. Historical Waste of Resources
4. Capital Outlay versus SDA Project
5. IDEA Grant Analysis
6. Dickinson High School Analysis
7. PILOT Program Analysis
8. Procedures Performed
9. Findings:
A. Facilities
B. Food Service Department
C. Departmental Re-organization
D. Vendor Relationships
E. Other Items
10.Pending items
11.Conclusions

OCONNOR

## INITIAL SCOPE OF PROJ ECT

 DAVIES
## INITIAL SCOPE OF PROJ ECI

Pursuant to the request for proposal ("RFP") and the final resolution authorizing by the Members of the Board of Education, PKF O'Connor Davies, LLP (the "Firm") was retained to review documents, analyze available data and interview personnel as part of an Operational Efficiency Audit. The purpose of the operational study was to review specifically identified areas and disciplines within the Jersey City Public Schools (the "District" of "JCBOE") in order to determine whether the various departments are appropriately staffed to meet the service delivery, compliance and technology needs of the District and whether the various systems (Payroll, Budget, Personnel, Purchasing, Student Data and other areas) are meeting the current and foreseeable future needs of the District. The RFP identified 13 key areas that were to be considered during our engagement.

## INITIAL SCOPE OF PROJ ECI

1. District Organization, Management \& Staffing
2. Financial Management, Reporting \& Staffing
3. Human Resources

Management, Reporting \& Staffing, including Payroll and Benefits
4. Professional Development
5. Procurement
6. Transportation
7. Food Service
8. Technology
9. Facilities Management \& Staffing
10. Energy Conservation
11. Safety And Security
12. Risk Management
13. Records Management \& Retention

PKF
O'CONNOR
DAVIES

## FINANCIAL HISTORY OF STATE AID

Cores
oconnor DAVIES.
ACCOUNTANTS AND ADVISORS
ESTAELSHEDIN Tg99

## Financial History of J CBOE Student Enrollment



DAVIES



## Source of Revenue

## 2017-2018



■ Local Tax Levy

- State Revenue
- Federal Revenue
$\square$ Other Revenue


## Source of Revenue Continu d

## 1995-1996



- Local Tax Levy
- State Revenue
- Federal Revenue
- Other Revenue


## KNOW <br> GREATER <br> VALUE <br> Expenditures 2005 to 2018

## Governmental Activities

Instruction- Regular
Instruction - Special Education
Instruction - Other Special
Instruction - Other
Support Services - Tuition
Support Services - Student and Instruction
Support Services - General Admin.
Support Services - School Admin.
Support Services - Business and Other
Support Services - Plaint Operations and Maintenance
Support Services - Pupil Transportation
Charter Schools
Other

Total Governmental Activities

Average Daily Enrollment
Average Cost per Pupil

29,897
\$ 19,008

27,911
\$ 23,200

29,052
\$ 25,717
$\mathrm{PR}^{2} \mathrm{~F}^{2}$

| 2005 |  | 2011 |  | 2015 |  |  | 2018 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \$ 583,275,289 |  | \$ 663,456,079 |  | \$ | 764,870,703 |  | \$ 886,478,164 |  |
| \$ 257,734,539 | 44.19\% | \$ 258,080,502 | 38.90\% | \$ | 274,875,443 | 35.94\% | \$ 327,754,684 | 36.97\% |
| 70,285,199 | 12.05\% | 66,697,110 | 10.05\% |  | 84,862,892 | 11.10\% | 110,641,883 | 12.48\% |
| - | 0.00\% | 16,705,830 | 2.52\% |  | 18,385,246 | 2.40\% | 25,441,834 | 2.87\% |
| 21,165,442 | 3.63\% | 2,741,850 | 0.41\% |  | 4,728,266 | 0.62\% | 5,368,147 | 0.61\% |
| - | 0.00\% | 20,097,146 | 3.03\% |  | 20,477,666 | 2.68\% | 19,538,228 | 2.20\% |
| $\mathbf{9 8 , 1 5 4 , 3 3 7}$ | 16.83\% | 113,507,244 | 17.11\% |  | 130,737,973 | 17.09\% | 140,682,963 | 15.87\% |
| 10,094,054 | 1.73\% | 10,473,250 | 1.58\% |  | 12,429,322 | 1.63\% | 14,388,243 | 1.62\% |
| 20,389,384 | 3.50\% | 26,049,149 | 3.93\% |  | 27,732,450 | 3.63\% | 35,686,684 | 4.03\% |
| 9,039,803 | 1.55\% | 10,379,652 | 1.56\% |  | 14,326,910 | 1.87\% | 16,546,655 | 1.87\% |
| 67,966,650 | 11.65\% | 68,427,800 | 10.31\% |  | 85,539,359 | 11.18\% | 71,175,170 | 8.03\% |
| 13,446,259 | 2.31\% | 20,958,215 | 3.16\% |  | 18,544,381 | 2.42\% | 40,473,528 | 4.57\% |
| - | 0.00\% | 32,616,692 | 4.92\% |  | 53,200,925 | 6.96\% | 58,737,756 | 6.63\% |
| - | 0.00\% | 801,184 | 0.12\% |  | 1,281,897 | 0.17\% | 2,806,996 | 0.32\% |
| \$ 568,275,667 | 97.44\% | \$ 647,535,624 | 97.60\% | \$ | 747,122,730 | 97.7\% | \$ 869,242,771 | 98.1\% |

nceountalis min Amploed

| 2005 |  |  | 2011 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \$ | 583,275,289 |  | \$ | 663,456,079 |  |
| \$ | 257,734,539 | 44.19\% | \$ | 258,080,502 | 38.90\% |
|  | 70,285,199 | 12.05\% |  | 66,697,110 | 10.05\% |
|  | 21,165,442 | 3.63\% |  | 2,741,850 | 0.41\% |
|  | - | 0.00\% |  | 20,097,146 | 3.03\% |
|  | 98,154,337 | 16.83\% |  | 113,507,244 | 17.11\% |
|  | 10,094,054 | 1.73\% |  | 10,473,250 | 1.58\% |
|  | 20,389,384 | 3.50\% |  | 26,049,149 | 3.93\% |
|  | 9,039,803 | 1.55\% |  | 10,379,652 | 1.56\% |
|  | 67,966,650 | 11.65\% |  | 68,427,800 | 10.31\% |
|  | 13,446,259 | 2.31\% |  | 20,958,215 | 3.16\% |
|  | - | 0.00\% |  | 32,616,692 | 4.92\% |
|  | - | 0.00\% |  | 801,184 | 0.12\% |
| \$ | 568,275,667 | 97.44\% | \$ | 647,535,624 | 97.60\% |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |


|  | 2015 |  |  | 2018 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Total Expenditures | \$ | 764,870,703 |  | \$ | 886,478,164 |  |
| Governmental Activities |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Instruction - Regular | \$ | 274,875,443 | 35.94\% | \$ | 327,754,684 | 36.97\% |
| Instruction-Special Education |  | 84,862,892 | 11.10\% |  | 110,641,883 | 12.48\% |
| Instruction-Other |  | 4,728,266 | 0.62\% |  | 5,368,147 | 0.61\% |
| Support Services - Tuition |  | 20,477,666 | 2.68\% |  | 19,538,228 | 2.20\% |
| Support Services - Student and Instruction |  | 130,737,973 | 17.09\% |  | 140,682,963 | 15.87\% |
| Support Services - General Admin. |  | 12,429,322 | 1.63\% |  | 14,388,243 | 1.62\% |
| Support Services - School Admin. |  | 27,732,450 | 3.63\% |  | 35,686,684 | 4.03\% |
| Support Services - Business and Other |  | 14,326,910 | 1.87\% |  | 16,546,655 | 1.87\% |
| Support Services - Plaint Operations and Maintenance |  | 85,539,359 | 11.18\% |  | 71,175,170 | 8.03\% |
| Support Services - Pupil Transportation |  | 18,544,381 | 2.42\% |  | 40,473,528 | 4.57\% |
| Charter Schools |  | 53,200,925 | 6.96\% |  | 58,737,756 | 6.63\% |
| Other |  | 1,281,897 | 0.17\% |  | 2,806,996 | 0.32\% |
| Total Governmental Activities | \$ | 747,122,730 | 97.7\% | \$ | 869,242,771 | 98.1\% |

# Compounded Annual Growth Rate Expenditures from 2005 through 

2005 to 2018 CAGR ${ }^{(1)}$

## Total Expenditures

Governmental Activities
Instruction- Regular $\quad \mathbf{1 . 8 7 \%}$
Instruction - Special Education $\mathbf{3 . 5 5 \%}$
Instruction - Other $\quad$ 2.93\%
Support Services - Tuition $\quad \mathbf{1 0 0 . 0 0 \%}$
Support Services - Student and Instruction $\mathbf{2 . 8 1 \%}$
$\begin{array}{ll}\text { Support Services - General Admin. } & \mathbf{2 . 7 6 \%}\end{array}$
Support Services - School Admin. $\mathbf{4 . 4 0 \%}$
$\begin{array}{ll}\text { Support Services - Business and Other } & \mathbf{4 . 7 6 \%}\end{array}$
Support Services - Plaint Operations and Maintenance $\mathbf{0 . 3 6 \%}$
Support Services - Pupil Transportation 8.85\%
Charter Schools $\quad \mathbf{1 0 0 . 0 0 \%}$
Other
$100.00 \%$

Total Governmental Activities
$3.32 \%$

## Notes

(1) Compounded Annual Growth Rate

## HISTORICAL WASTE

Corgs oconnor DAVIES ACCOUNTANTS AND ADVISORS
ESTARUSHEDIN TE99

# know <br> SUMMARY OF HISTORICAI WASTE 

Historical Waste

## Category

Years Amount

SDA Projects paid for through General Fund 2013-2018 \$ 32,573,000

Overtime of Facilities (Custodial and Trades) 2015-2016 \$ 5,000,000
$\xlongequal{\$ \quad 37,573,000}$

- Total funds spent during the time period of July 1, 2013 through March 1, 2019 from the general account that were "capital expenditures" in nature and should have been part of the SDA process equaled approximately $\$ 32,573,007$. Information was provided in a March 22, 2019 memo to outside counsel.
- This analysis did not include the overtime paid to the facility staff (trade and custodial) to complete capital projects during the 2015/2016 school year. Which exceed approximately $\$ \mathbf{5 , 0 0 0}, \mathbf{0 0 0}$.


## Background

On Monday, March 18, 2019 PKF 0'Commor Davies, LLP (the "Firm") was asked by the Business Admimistrator (Regina Robinson), Board President (Suldan Thomas), Chief School Administrator (Franklin Walker), Michael Gross (Legal Counsel), Matthew S. Oorbeek and Jeminifer Borek from the law firm of Genova Burnns, LLC to assist the Business Administrator with compiling financial information to potentially be used by Jersey City Public Schools (the "District") in preparation of a complaint to be filed against various goveriment agencies and individuals associated with the State of New Jersey.

OCONNOR
DAVIES

## IDEA GRANT ANALYSIS

## IDEA Grant Analysis

- As part of our central office review we reviewed the 2015/2016 Grant Application.
- The grant is approximately $\$ 8.4$ million, of which approximately $63 \%$ is for tuition (approximately $\$ 5.4$ million).
- The grant budgeted for instructional and non-instructional (aka Support Services).
- A review of the purchases and the use of the items purchased (furniture and fixtures) lead us to the conclusion over $\$ 220,000$ was purchased inappropriately and exposed the district to the potential to have to repay those funds.
- This is furniture that was purchased as if it was going to be used for direct instruction and instead is in the Special Education Department at 346 Claremont.


## WILLIAM L. DICKINSON HIGH SCHOOL GREEN CONSTRUCTION PROGRAM

Cops
oconnor DAVIES ACCOUNTANTS AND ADVISORS ESTAELSHHEDIN Tgor

- During our Operational Efficiency Audit we drilled deeper into certain purchases made in support of the Wood Shop Program at William L. Dickinson High School ("Dickinson") located at 2 Palisade Avenue.
- Multiple pieces of equipment that was paid for by the district was unaccounted for and not on premise.
- In addition - equipment had been purchased that was sitting in a storage closet unused for over 12 months.
- Teachers were frustrated that equipment was purchased that did not meet the defined goals of the program.
- Lowe's Credit Cards used by Vice-Principal and staff to make purchases.


## TIMELINE

- On Thursday February 21, 2019 we did a surprise physical inventory count at Dickinson.
- On March 7, 2019 Firm inquired of Security access to review specific security cameras at Dickinson.
- March 8, 2019 access was provided to some of the security cameras. Staff person told Security personnel that we would need access to additional cameras in order to complete our analysis.
- March 12, 2019 no security personnel available to assist with review of additional cameras.


## TIMELINE CONTINUED

- March 14, 2019 our staff person was denied access to access video tapes from Dickinson.
- March 15, 2019 manager and partner on engagement correspond and drafted email to JCBOE council.
- March 20, 2019 notification was provided from appropriate authorities to provide the firm with access.
- March 20, 2019 staff and manger from PKF OD went to Security office at 346 Claremont to review the video tape. Footage was "no longer available for review"


## PILOT PROGRAM ANALYSIS

## PILOT PROGRAM ANAL SIS

- On October 2, 2019 a Letter was issued to the President and the Members of the Board of Education on the findings from the PILOT Program analysis.
- "We obtained .... 19 Pilot Agreements in effect in Jersey City... There were 179 Pilot Agreements in total ... We then prepared a chart of the 19 ... calculated the difference between the PILOT Billing and the fully assessed tax. ... Full assessed tax as if applying the City's regular tax rates to identify the properties ... the regular tax levy exceeds the PILOT billings by $\$ \mathbf{6 5 , 4 4 2 , 0 0 0}$ per year."
"We selected to investigate the top 19 Jersey City properties under tax abatement programs (PILOTs) which represented the largest difference between the PILOT Billing and the fully assessed tax. ...The variance for the top 19 properties selected indicated that the PILOT billing was below the fully assessed tax by \$41,395,000 per year which represented 63\% of the total variances for all 179 PILOTs. ... Jersey City Board of Education would receive approximately 25\% of the fully assessed tax on properties in Jersey City. Therefore the potential lost school funding attributable to the top 19 PILOT‘s was \$10,348,000 per year."
"We selected to investigate the top 19 Jersey City properties under tax abatement programs (PILOTs) which represented the largest difference between the PILOT Billing and the fully assessed tax. ...The variance for the top 19 properties selected indicated that the PILOT billing was below the fully assessed tax by \$41,395,000 per year which represented 63\% of the total variances for all 179 PILOTs. ... Jersey City Board of Education would receive approximately 25\% of the fully assessed tax on properties in Jersey City. Therefore the potential lost school funding attributable to the top 19 PILOT‘s was $\mathbf{\$ 1 0 , 3 4 8 , 0 0 0}$ per year."


## PILOT PROGRAM ANALYS CONTINUED

"One of the properties in our selection was Provost Square I Urban Renewal (The Morgan) at 160 Morgan St a rental property, which the PILOT agreement states that the annual service charge is $14 \%$ of rental revenue. There is no auditor's report on file, so there is no way to know what the figure to bill pursuant to the agreement."

## PILOT PROGRAM ANALYS CONTINUED

"One of the properties in our selection was Provost Square I Urban Renewal (The Morgan) at 160 Morgan St a rental property, which the PILOT agreement states that the annual service charge is $14 \%$ of rental revenue. There is no auditor's report on file, so there is no way to know what the figure to bill pursuant to the agreement."
"Our review of the audit reports revealed that GSJC 30 Hudson Urban Renewal, LLC property reported for 2016 Rental Income of $\$ 52$ million and Expense reimbursements of $\$ 43$ million for Total Revenue of $\$ 95$ million. The Operating Expenses were reported as $\$ 43$ million by the entity. Since the Reimbursed Expense Revenue for 2016 exceeded the total Operating Expenses of the entity for 2016, we recommend that the City perform its own audit of the books and records and leases of the subject property to determine if any of the Reimbursed Expense Revenue of $\$ 43$ million is actually revenue for use of the square footage of the retail and other tenants rather than the classified Reimbursed Expense. Any revenue for use of the space for retail and other space would be included in the computation for the Annual Service Charges at 15\%...."

## PROCEDURES PERFORMED

cops
oconnor DAVIES ACCOUNTANTS AND ADVISORS
ESTAELSHEDIN TE99

- Interviews with numerous personnel in departments identified as high risk (in excess of 50 individuals)
- Access to System 3000 accounting software for the current year through 2015 to review account transaction details, purchase orders and general ledger detail
- Vendor Payment and Vendor Invoice documentation system SoftDocs®
- Access to security logs for selected period of time
- Limited access to security tapes, see William L. Dickinson High School section
- Overtime excel files for Custodial and Trade staff for 2016/2017 and 2017/2018 fiscal years
- Employee Roster with salary and job titles as of September 2019
- Union Contracts in effect
- Accumulated unused sick and vacation time
- PILOT records at City Hall


## FINDINGS

OCONNOR DAVIES accountants and ainisors Celebrating 725 Years

## KNOW GREATER VALUE <br> FINDINGS

|  | Going Forward Cost Savings |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Category: |  |  |
| Re-organization of Facilities Department | \$ | 1,327,000 |
| Overtime controls and attendance hardware implementation |  | 1,210,000 |
| Outsourcing of Food Service |  | 1,117,300 |
| Inventory Control Software for Trades |  | Unknown |
| Re-organziation of following departments: |  |  |
| Curriculum |  | 1,681,455 |
| Finance and others |  | 1,716,066 |
| Human Resources |  | 385,011 |
| Legal |  | - |
| Special Education |  | 2,028,702 |
| Student Life \& Services |  | 505,528 |
| Superintendent's Office |  | 334,950 |
| Transportation Office |  | 293,335 |
| Waste in Supplies and Materials |  | 3,783,595 |
| Elimination of Health Insurance Opt-Out |  | Unknown |
| Early Childhood Program Transportation |  | 1,000,000 |
| Use of Facilities by Outside Entities |  | 128,000 |
| Estimated future savings from conversion to self-insured |  | 15,000,000 |
| Buy Back of Sick Days |  | 1,150,000 |

# FINDINGS - FACILITIES 

OCONNOR DAVIES nCCOUNTANTS AND ainvisors Celebraing 725 Years

## FINDINGS - FACILITTIES

- On June 26, 2019 letter issued to Board President and Members of the Board of Education outline findings and recommendations on the Facilities Department.


## FINDINGS

- Under the present organizational structure there are 12 supervisors reporting directly to the executive director, along with one management assistant and one real estate manager.
- Over time a flat organizational structure developed where a disproportionate number of employees were promoted to supervisors.
- In addition, there was a migration away from using the internal employees in the facility department for repairs and maintenance and instead utilizing outside vendors.
- Inconsistent with the migration to using outside vendors was an excessive amount of overtime incurred by both the custodial staff and trades.
- Overtime incurred in fiscal years ending June 30th, 2017 and 2018 was approximately $\$ 4.2$ million and $\$ 2$ million, respectively.


## Recommendations:

- The operation activities can be best divided between custodial services and facility improvements and repairs.
- We propose a more efficient and traditional organization structure with, one Supervisor of Custodial Services, one Supervisor of Facility and one Management Assistant who report directly to the Executive Director and eliminating the other ten supervisory positions.
- Based on the following assumptions from the restructuring we estimated an annual savings
- of approximately $\$ 1,327,000$.
- The seven trade supervisory positions will be reduced to one facility supervisor position. The remaining six supervisory trade position will become the highest paid trade position.
- The five maintenance supervisory positions will be reduced to one supervisor of custodial services. The remaining four maintenance supervisor will become head custodians.
- The real estate manager position and one Clerk/Billing position will be eliminated.
- When the ten supervisory positions are eliminated we have assumed that these positions will be repositioned in subordinated roles which would result in the termination of the most junior employee at each position.
- We have assumed a full loaded fringe benefit rate of $55 \%$ of gross salaries
- Institute a new hand scan reader for time entry.
- Change overtime policy to require assessment of needs, time estimate, cost estimate, and approval before overtime is incurred. Potential savings available through the effective time management of staff approximately equal to the most recent overtime expense. $\frac{\mathcal{P K F}}{\mathbf{O C}}$ ONNOR


# FINDINGS - FOOD SERVICE DEPARTMENT 

C PKF
OCONNOR DAVIES

- Currently the District offers and provides a Food Service (aka Cafeteria) to all the students in the district. We are proposing the Board considers at a minimum the process of asking for proposals from outside third party vendors to manage and run the Food Service Department. This is not an uncommon practice and many districts throughout the state of New Jersey are currently using third party vendors to provide this service. Below are excerpts from a existing contract (2017/2018 Fiscal Year).


## B. LOCAL EDUCATION AGENCY RESPONSIBILITIES

1) The LEA shall ensure that the food service operation is in conformance with the Agreement for School Nutrition Programs between the LEA and the State Agency (the "Program Agreement") and shall monitor the food service operation through periodic onsite visits. [7 CFR 210.16(a) (2), (3)].
2) The LEA shall retain control of the quality, extent and general nature of its food service, and the prices charged to the children for meals. [7 CFR 210.16(a) (4)].
3) The LEA shall retain signature authority on the Program Agreement, the LEA's Free and Reduced Price Policy Statement, and Claims for Reimbursement. [7 CFR 210.16(a)(5)].

Contract Continued with LEA Responsibilities
4) The LEA shall ensure that all federally donated foods received by the LEA and made available to the FSMC accrue only to the benefit of the LEA's nonprofit school food service and are fully utilized therein. [7 CFR 210.16(a) (6)].
5) The LEA shall maintain applicable health certification and assure that all State and local regulations are being met by the FSMC preparing or serving meals at a LEA facility. [7 CFR 210.16(a) (7)].
6) The LEA shall establish an advisory board composed of parents, teachers and students to assist in menu planning. [7 CFR 210.16(a) (8)].
7) The LEA shall retain control of the nonprofit school food service account and overall financial responsibility for the School Nutrition Programs, and shall make expenditures of nonprofit school food service revenues in accordance with the financial management system established by the State Agency. [7 CFR 210.14(a)].

Below is the language the deals with one of the primary drivers of using an outside vendor. The economic benefit.
2) GUARANTEE BREAK EVEN: guarantees that the bottom line on the operational financial report for the school year will be at break even or no subsidy to the bottom line of the If the actual bottom line is a loss, will subsidize the bottom line of the up to $100 \%$ of our management fee. The guarantee is contingent upon the following conditions.

The Management Fee that this provided will be paid is:

1) FLAT MANAGEMENT FEE: NSFM shall be paid from the Cafeteria Account for the services to be rendered based upon $\$ 33,902.44$ per annum per one school calendar year. Payments will be calculated on the basis of a 10 -month calendar year. This will be divided into 42 weekly payments at $\$ 807.20$ per week. The contract term shall commence on September 1, 2017 and end on June 30, 2018. Payments are to begin and end in that same period, whereupon the total sum of $\$ 33,902.44$ shall have been paid to NSFM at the end of the term. This fee is based on providing services in the schools for the School Nutrition Programs now in existence.

## Below is a summary of the June 30, 2018 Audited Food Service Profit and Loss Statement As Reported <br> As Reported

For the Fiscal Year

## Revenue:

Sales - reimbursable \& non-rembursable programs
State Aid - State School Lunch Program
Federal Aid - All Programs
Total Revenue All Sources

## Operating Expenses:

Cost of Sales - reimbursable programs
Cost of Sales - non-reimbursable programs
Salaries and wages
Employee benefits
Post - retirement benefits
Professional and technical services
Other services
Supplies and materials
Depreciation expense

Total Operating Expenses

Excess Cost over Revenue

$$
\text { Ended June 30, } 2018
$$

| $\$$ | 901,806 |
| ---: | ---: |
| 118,688 |  |
| $13,020,452$ |  |

$$
7,143,571
$$

206,908
4,857,611
1,398,805
235,225
73,039

| 53,443 |
| ---: |
| 92,455 |

14,061,057

Before we make any adjustments the there is a loss

OCONNOR

## FINDINGS - FOOD SERVICE DEPARIIN CONTINUED

The Employee Benefit Expense is only for health care costs and does not include the post-retirement benefits. The District and through-out NJ districts are not required to allocate post-retirement benefits to Food Service. We did in this example to see the impact of a fully-loaded salary.


# FINDINGS - DEPARTMENTAL RE-ORGANIZATION 

- We interviewed and reviewed the employee roster as of September 2019 for the following departments that are located at 346 Claremont Avenue (aka Central Office). Currently the District and the Board are having a vendor preform a civil service audit. There may be redundancy is some of our findings.
- We determined the following:
- Core competency tests for all "accounting" related job descriptions should be administrated with specific focus on use of the current accounting system (System 3000). Those with titles that have "Accounting" in them should be able to prepare journal entries, print reports, understand school based accounting.
- Technology has advanced for communications that certain employee functions have become outdated and unnecessary.
- Employees were unable to adequately explain their job duties without the aid of a print out from the NJ Civil Service web page.
- Even after our interviews and discussions there are certain employee job titles/duties we are not sure what value they provide to the District.

DAVIES

We are presenting findings and recommendations on the following departments:

- Curriculum
- Finance
- Human Resources
- Legal
-Special Education
- Student Life \& Services
- Superintendent's Office
- Transportation Office


## Curriculum

- Our review of the structure of this department raised concerns on the over reliance of the job title "supervisor" when many of the job function are not in fact supervisory.
- We believe that the Supervisor role should eliminated and replaced with Teacher MA. Much of the function appears to be on the evaluation of the teachers at the various schools. Other districts are staffing this position with "Teachers" and not "Supervisors". The table on the next slide shows the head count reduction and job reclassification.
- We created a role of "Supervisor" to supervise the "Teacher MA" staff. The net headcount change is 6 . We eliminated 7 positions and added 1 .
- Prior to the adjustment the Department had 27 employees with gross wages of approximately $\$ 2.439$ million.
- After adjustments 21 employees with gross wages of $\$ 1.483$ million.


## KNOW <br> GREATER FINDINGS - DEPARTIMENTAL REVALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED



[^0]
## Finance

- The payroll roster provided by the District has co-mingled various departments in "Finance". To keep the analysis consistent in case there is a need to re-create our approach we did not reclassify certain positions, such as the Coordinate School Transportation Supervisor, etc.
- Certain position are terminated because it was difficult to understand or justify what value they provided to the district. Especially in light of the technology advances.
- Prior to adjustments this department according to the payroll roster has 48 employees and approximately $\$ 3.453$ million in gross wages. After our suggested reductions there are 30 employees with gross wages of approximately $\$ 2.2$ million.


# KNOW <br> greater FINDINGS - DEPARTMIENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED 

Finance

| Count | Current Job Title | Current Salary |  | New Job Title | Revised Salary | Savings |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Accountant | \$ | 64,969 |  |  | \$ | 64,969 |
| 2 | Accountant |  | 51,580 |  |  |  | 51,580 |
| 3 | Accountant |  | 81,275 | Accountant | 81,275 |  | - |
| 4 | Accountant |  | 80,325 | Accountant | 80,325 |  | - |
| 5 | Accountant |  | 80,325 | Accountant | 80,325 |  | - |
| 6 | Administr Analyst |  | 96,895 |  |  |  | 96,895 |
| 7 | Asst Budget Officer |  | 123,874 | Asst Budget Officer | 123,874 |  | - |
| 8 | Asst Sup of Accts |  | 76,385 | Asst Sup of Accts | 76,385 |  | - |
| 9 | Budget Officer |  | 131,228 | Budget Officer | 131,228 |  | - |
| 10 | Chief of Admin Srvcs |  | 88,317 | Chief of Admin Srvcs | 88,317 |  | - |
| 11 | Clerk 1A |  | 38,185 |  |  |  | 38,185 |
| 12 | Clerk 1A |  | 37,255 |  |  |  | 37,255 |
| 13 | Clerk 2A |  | 64,685 |  |  |  | 64,685 |
| 14 | Clerk 3A |  | 67,050 | Clerk 2A | 64,685 |  | 2,365 |
| 15 | Clerk 3A |  | 40,160 | Clerk 2A | 64,685 |  | $(24,525)$ |
| 16 | Clerk 3A |  | 66,300 | Clerk 2A | 64,685 |  | 1,615 |
| 17 | Clerk 3A |  | 68,000 | Clerk 2A | 64,685 |  | 3,315 |
| 18 | Clerk Driver |  | 67,050 | Clerk Driver | 67,050 |  | - |
| 19 | Clerk Driver |  | 54,940 |  |  |  | 54,940 |

## KNOW <br> greater FINDINGS - DEPARTIMENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED

Finance continued

| Count | Current Job Title | Current Salary | New Job Title | Revised Salary | Savings |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 20 | Coord Sch Transp Srv | 121,952 | Teacher MA | 80,503 | 41,450 |
| 21 | Data Proc Progr Sys | 88,670 |  |  | 88,670 |
| 22 | Dir Security Srycs | 137,490 | Dir Security Srvcs | 137,490 | - |
| 23 | Equipment Operator | 60,104 |  |  | 60,104 |
| 24 | Keyboarding Clerk 3A | 66,300 |  |  | 66,300 |
| 25 | Laborer | 58,116 | Laborer | 58,116 | - |
| 26 | Laborer | 57,916 | Laborer | 57,916 | - |
| 27 | Laborer | 50,023 |  |  | 50,023 |
| 28 | Laborer | 58,616 | Laborer | 58,616 | - |
| 29 | Laborer | 47,135 |  |  | 47,135 |
| 30 | Mail Clerk | 73,020 |  |  | 73,020 |
| 31 | Management Assistant | 77,375 |  |  | 77,375 |
| 32 | Princ Purchasing Ast | 76,180 | Princ Purchasing Ast | 76,180 | - |
| 33 | Purchasing Assistant | 70,635 | Purchasing Assistant | 70,635 | - |
| 34 | Record Support Tech1 | 40,030 | Record Support Tech1 | 40,030 | - |
| 35 | Safety \& Ins Coord | 57,370 | Safety \& Ins Coord | 57,370 | - |
| 36 | Senior Accountant | 85,920 | Senior Accountant | 85,920 | - |
| 37 | Senior Clerk Driver | 57,605 | Clerk Driver | 57,605 | - |
| 38 | Senior Data Contr C1 | 67,050 |  |  | 67,050 |
| 39 | Senior Mgmt Asst | 108,668 |  |  | 108,668 |
| 40 | Senior Office App Op | 76,385 | Senior Office App Op | 76,385 | - |
| 41 | Senior Office App Op | 49,405 |  |  | 49,405 |
| 42 | Supervising Acct. | 120,874 | Supervising Acct. | 120,874 | - |
| 43 | Supervising Acct. | 119,374 | Supervising Acct. | 119,374 | - |
| 44 | Supervising Laborer | 67,978 | Supervising Laborer | 67,978 | - |
| 45 | Supv Telephone System | 89,720 | Supv Telephone System | 89,720 | - |
| 46 | Teacher Asst (CS) | 63,015 |  |  | 63,015 |
| 47 | Treasurer Sch Monies | 14,100 | Treasurer Sch Monies | 14,100 | - |
| 48 | Treasurer Sch Monies | 14,000 | Treasurer Sch Monies | 14,000 | - |
|  |  |  |  | Gross Wage Savings | 1,183,494 |
|  | Fringe Benefits Factor (Health Insurance and Retirement Benefits at a Rateof 45\% |  |  |  | 532,572 |
|  | Total Projected Savings |  |  |  | 1,716,066 |

## KNOW <br> GREATER FINDINGS - DEPARTMENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED

## Human Resources



## Legal

The legal department currently has only two employees devoted to it per the employee roster. We did interview and discuss with the employees the legal departments approach to case management and we were assured that the economics of each case are considered at every point in the decision making process.

The current combined gross salary of the legal department is approximately $\$ 175,000$.

# KNOW <br> greater FINDINGS - DEPARTMIENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED 

## Special Education



## KNOW <br> greater FINDINGS - DEPARTIMIENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED

## Special Education

| Count | Current Job Title | Current Salary | New Job Title | Revised Salary | Savings |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 21 | Psychologist MA+32 | 104,390 | Psychologist MA+32 | 104,390 | - |
| 22 | Psychologist MA+32 | 75,600 |  |  | 75,600 |
| 23 | Psychologist MA+32 | 111,550 | Psychologist MA+32 | 111,550 | - |
| 24 | Psychologist PHD/DOC | 84,600 | Psychologist PHD/DOC | 84,600 | - |
| 25 | Senior Data Contr Cl | 67,050 | Senior Data Contr Cl | 67,050 | - |
| 26 | Spv ComplianceOff 32 | 111,930 | Spv ComplianceOff 32 | 111,930 | - |
| 27 | Spv ComplianceOff 32 | 128,800 | Spv ComplianceOff 32 | 128,800 | - |
| 28 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 138,800 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 138,800 | - |
| 29 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 138,800 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 138,800 | - |
| 30 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 120,800 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 120,800 | - |
| 31 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 148,200 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 148,200 | - |
| 32 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 135,300 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 135,300 | - |
| 33 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 145,900 | Spv Special Educ 32 | 145,900 | - |
| 34 | Spv Special Educ MA | 125,500 | Spv Special Educ MA | 125,500 | - |
| 35 | Spv Support Srvcs DR | 150,500 | Spv Support Srvcs DR | 150,500 | - |
| 36 | Teacher BA | 104,280 | Teacher BA | 104,280 | - |
| 37 | Teacher BA | 104,280 | Teacher BA | 104,280 | - |
| 38 | Teacher BA | 55,340 |  |  | 55,340 |
| 39 | Teacher BA | 73,030 | Teacher BA | 73,030 | - |
| 40 | Teacher BA | 55,040 |  |  | 55,040 |

## KNOW <br> GREATER FINDINGS - DEPARTIMIENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED

## Special Education



## KNOW <br> Greater FINDINGS - DEPARTIMIENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED

## Student Life and Services



# KNOW <br> grearer FINDINGS - DEPARTMENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED 

## Superintendent's Office



Transportation Office

| Count | Current Job Title | Current Salary |  | New Job Title | Revised Salary |  | Savings |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Asst Supv Motor Pool | \$ | 103,283 | Asst Supv Motor Pool | \$ | 103,283 | \$ | - |  |
| 2 | Clerk Driver |  | 68,000 |  |  |  |  | 68,000 |  |
| 3 | Keyboarding Clerk 3A |  | 66,300 |  |  |  |  | 66,300 |  |
| 4 | Management Assistant |  | 79,375 | Management Assistant |  | 79,375 |  | - |  |
| 5 | Prin Account Clerk |  | 67,050 | Prin Account Clerk |  | 67,050 |  | - |  |
| 6 | Radio Dispatcher |  | 70,680 | Radio Dispatcher |  | 70,680 |  | - |  |
| 7 | School Trans Inspect |  | 60,730 | School Trans Inspect |  | 60,730 |  | - |  |
| 8 | School Trans Inspect |  | 49,442 | School Trans Inspect |  | 49,442 |  |  |  |
| 9 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 50,528 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 50,528 |  | - |  |
| 10 | Schoollus Driver |  | 44,792 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 44,792 |  | - |  |
| 11 | Schoollus Diver |  | 42,917 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 42,917 |  | - |  |
| 12 | Schoollus Driver |  | 50,328 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 50,328 |  | - |  |
| 13 | Schoollus Diver |  | 42,917 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 42,917 |  | - |  |
| 14 | Schoollus Driver |  | 41,504 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 41,504 |  | - |  |
| 15 | Schoollus Driver |  | 44,792 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 44,792 |  | - |  |
| 16 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 44,792 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 44,792 |  | - |  |
| 17 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 40,141 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 40,141 |  | - |  |
| 18 | Schoolbus Diver |  | 50,528 | Schoolbus Diver |  | 50,528 |  | - |  |
| 19 | Schoolbus Diver |  | 50,528 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 50,528 |  | - |  |
| 20 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 50,328 | Schoolbus Driver |  | 50,328 |  | - | DAVIES <br> ACCOUNTANTS AND ADMSORS |

## Transportation Office Continued

| Count | Current Job Title | Current Salary | New Job Title | Revised Salary | Savings |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 21 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,528 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,528 | - |
| 22 | Schoolbus Driver | 41,504 | Schoolbus Driver | 41,504 | - |
| 23 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,528 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,528 | - |
| 24 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,328 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,328 | - |
| 25 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,328 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,328 | - |
| 26 | Schoolbus Driver | 41,504 | Schoolbus Driver | 41,504 | - |
| 27 | Schoolbus Driver | 40,919 | Schoolbus Driver | 40,919 | - |
| 28 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,328 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,328 | - |
| 29 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,528 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,528 | - |
| 30 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,328 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,328 | - |
| 31 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,528 | Schoolbus Driver | 50,528 | - |
| 32 | Schoolbus Driver | 42,917 | Schoolbus Driver | 42,917 | - |
| 33 | Senior Data Contr Cl | 68,000 |  |  | 68,000 |
| 34 | Senior Transp Insp. | 89,617 | Senior Transp Insp. | 89,617 | - |
| 35 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 36 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 37 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 38 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 39 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 40 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |

## Transportation Office Continued



# KNOW <br> greater FINDINGS - DEPARTMIENTAL RE- <br> VALUE ORGANIZATION CONTINUED 

## Transportation Office Continued

| Count | Current Job Title | Current Salary | New Job Title | Revised Salary | Savings |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 61 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 62 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 63 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 64 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 65 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 66 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 67 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 68 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 69 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 70 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 71 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 72 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 73 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 74 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 75 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 76 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 77 | Per Diem | 13,200 | Per Diem | 13,200 | - |
| 78 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |
| 79 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 | - |

OCONNOR
DAVIES
nCCOUNTANTS AND aIVISORS
Celebraing $/ 25$ Years

## Transportation Office Continued

| Count | Current Job Title | Current Salary | New Job Title | Revised Salary | Savings |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 80 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 |  | - |
| 81 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 |  | - |
| 82 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 |  | - |
| 83 | Per Diem | 8,400 | Per Diem | 8,400 |  | - |
| 84 | Per Diem | 7,764 | Per Diem | 7,764 |  | - |

$$
\xlongequal{\$ 2,241,112} \quad \xlongequal{\$ \quad 2,038,812}
$$

Total Gross Wage Savings

Fringe Benefits Factor (Health Insurance and Retirement Benefits at a Rate of $45 \%$ $\qquad$

Total Projected Savings \$

## FINDINGS - VENDOR RELATIONSHIPS

Cops OCONNOR DAVIES nCCOUNTANTS AND airvisors Celebrating 725 Years

- During the course of our engagement we reviewed the timing and pattern of purchases of supplies and materials.
- We discussed ordering/purchasing with the custodial staff, trades, vice-principals and teachers. The overall consensus is if it is in Budget they will spend it.
- In 2018 the supplies and materials for the entire district was approximately $\$ 18,918,000$. We reduced this $20 \%$ which is consist with our findings of who was being spent in the last quarter of the fiscal year (April, May and June). The estimated savings on an annual basis would be approximately $\$ 3,783,000$.


# FINDINGS - OTHER ITEMS 

OCONNOR DAVIES accountants and andisors Celebrating 125 years

## FINDINGS - OTHER ITEMS

- Transportation - District maybe providing transportation to the Early Childhood Program to move students from their "home school" to facility that has the space for the program that they are not required too. Administrative code discusses such things as distance (2-mile radius) and safety but not age of student. Annual savings are approximately between $\$ 750 \mathrm{~K}$ to $\$ 1$ million per year.
- Use of Facilities - District policy of allowing outside entities to use facilities maybe costing District money in overtime salaries for custodial staff. At the point in time cost is estimated.
- Fixed Asset Inventory -District is paying for periodic inventory of assets that is unnecessary. Cost savings are not included in findings.
- Elimination of health insurance opt-out payments. Estimated savings approximately $\$ 500 \mathrm{k}$ per annum. Cost savings are not included in findings.


## PENDING ITEMS

## O $\frac{P K F}{O C}$

OCONNOR DAVIES nCCOUNTANTS AND ADNISORS Celebraing 725 Years

These are items that we have open and have not finished our investigation because we have run out of time and resources. We wanted to make the board aware if there appears to be any merit in investigating them:

- Annual Sick Pay By Back - annual amount in 2017/2018 was approximately $\$ 1.8$ million. The District current has a policy of buying back unused sick days from the various collective bargaining units. This maybe contractual and a requirement of the current contract but it appears to circumvent the spirit of the overall reduction in the amount of unused vacation pay an employee can receive upon termination.


## CONCLUSIONS

OCONNOR DAVIES nccountants and anvisors Celebrating 725 Years

- We would like to thank the following District Employees who provided considerable help:
- Mrs. Regina Robinson
- Debasis Gupta

OCONNOR


[^0]:    (1) Used the average of the Teacher MA. This may change on individual profile of employe.

