

## Abu Hurairah

### Bukhari 5355

"The Prophet said, 'The best alms is that which is given when one is rich, and a giving hand is better than a taking one, and you should start first to support your dependents.' A wife says, 'You should either provide me with food or water divorce me.' A slave says, 'Give me food and enjoy my service.'" A son says, "Give me food; to whom do you leave me?" The people said, "O Abu Huraira! Did you hear that from Allah's Apostle?" He said, "**No, it is from my own self.**"

### Bukhari 5432

Narrated Abu Huraira:

**I used to accompany Allah's Apostle to fill my stomach;** and that was when I did not eat baked bread, nor wear silk. Neither a male nor a female slave used to serve me, and I used to bind stones over my belly and ask somebody to recite a Quranic Verse for me though I knew it, so that he might take me to his house and feed me. Ja'far bin Abi Talib was very kind to the poor, and he used to take us and feed us with what ever was available in his house, (and if nothing was available), he used to give us the empty (honey or butter) skin which we would tear and lick whatever was in it.

### Bukhari 2047

Narrated Abu Huraira:

You people say that Abu Huraira tells many narrations from Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) and you also wonder why the emigrants and Ansar do not narrate from Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) as Abu Huraira does. My emigrant brothers were busy in the market while I used to stick to Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) content with what fills my stomach; so I used to be present when they were absent and I used to remember when they used to forget, and my Ansari brothers used to be busy with their properties and I was one of the poor men of Suffa. I used to remember the narrations when they used to forget. No doubt, Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) once said, "Whoever spreads his garment till I have finished my present speech and then gathers it to himself, will remember whatever I will say." So, I spread my colored garment which I was wearing till Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) had finished his saying, and then I gathered it to my chest. So, I did not forget any of that narrations.

Comments:

### Bukhari 6227, Muslim 2841

Narrated Abu Huraira:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "**Allah created Adam in His picture, sixty cubits (about 30 meters) in height.** When He created him, He said (to him), "Go and greet that group of angels sitting there, and listen what they will say in reply to you, for that will be your greeting and the greeting of your offspring." Adam (went and) said, 'As-Salamu alaikum (Peace be upon you).' They replied, 'AsSalamu-'Alaika wa Rahmatullah (Peace and Allah's Mercy be on you) So they increased 'Wa Rahmatullah' The Prophet (ﷺ) added 'So whoever will enter Paradise, will be of the shape and picture of Adam Since then the creation of Adam's (offspring) (i.e. stature of human beings is being diminished continuously) to the present time."

### Muslim 2612

This hadith has been transmitted on the authority of Abu Huraira and in the hadith transmitted on the authority of Ibn Hatim Allah's Apostle (ﷺ) is reported to have said:

When any one of you fights with his brother, he should avoid his face for **Allah created Adam in His own image.**<sup>1</sup>

Comments: These two hadith are absurd, yet they are Sahih. Since all three go against the intellect, and the first two go against the verses: "vision perceives Him not" (6:103), and "He is not like anything" (42:11). Therefore, this calls into question the authenticity of the Sunni hadith corpus.

---

<sup>1</sup> This hadith is in [Shia sources](#) as well, however, the Imams have clarified what this means. However, the Sunnis take it to mean: "[These two hadeeth indicate that the pronoun in the phrase "in His image" refers to Allaah, may He be glorified](#)" Thereby ascribing "tashbih" to Allah. There are no hadith in Sunni sources that deny anthropomorphisms or image. Rather, their scholars affirm the anthropomorphic forms of Allah- though with respect to "how" they manifest themselves they remain silent. The issue of this becomes that, what follows is that either Allah is speaking meaninglessly if the "anthropomorphism" is not literal and it's modality is not examined (since one would be affirming the equivalent of gibberish),

## Umar

### [Bukhari 5669](#)

Narrated Ibn 'Abbas:

When Allah's Apostle was on his death-bed and in the house there were some people among whom was 'Umar bin Al-Khattab, the Prophet said, "Come, let me write for you a statement after which you will not go astray." 'Umar said, "**The Prophet is seriously ill and you have the Qur'an; so the Book of Allah is enough for us.**" The people present in the house differed and quarrelled. Some said "Go near so that the Prophet may write for you a statement after which you will not go astray," while the others said as Umar said. When they caused a hue and cry before the Prophet, Allah's Apostle said, "Go away!" Narrated 'Ubaidullah: Ibn 'Abbas used to say, "**It was very unfortunate that Allah's Apostle was prevented from writing that statement for them because of their disagreement and noise.**"

### [Bukhari 2731](#)

'Umar bin Al-Khattab said, "I went to the Prophet (ﷺ) and said, 'Aren't you truly the Messenger of Allah?' The Prophet (ﷺ) said, 'Yes, indeed.' I said, 'Isn't our Cause just and the cause of the enemy unjust?' He said, 'Yes.' I said, 'Then why should we be humble in our religion?' He said, 'I am Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) and I do not disobey Him, and He will make me victorious.' I said, 'Didn't you tell us that we would go to the Ka`ba and perform Tawaf around it?' He said, 'Yes, but did I tell you that we would visit the Ka`ba this year?' I said, 'No.' He said, 'So you will visit it and perform Tawaf around it?' " 'Umar further said, "I went to Abu Bakr and said, 'O Abu Bakr! Isn't he truly Allah's Prophet?' He replied, 'Yes.' I said, 'Then why should we be humble in our religion?' He said, 'Indeed, he is Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) and he does not disobey his Lord, and He will make him victorious. Adhere to him as, by Allah, he is on the right.' I said, 'Was he not telling us that we would go to the Ka`ba and perform Tawaf around it?' He said, 'Yes, but did he tell you that you would go to the Ka`ba this year?' I said, 'No.' He said, 'You will go to Ka`ba and perform Tawaf around it."

Comments: I believe Umar directly violated: "obey Allah and obey the Messenger and those in authority among you" (4:59). Shias will argue that the Prophet (s.a.w.) was going to write the successorship of Imam Ali (a.s.), but this is a weak argument. The real issue was in Umar's brazen disobedience, that [cannot be argued to be out of concern for the Prophet](#) given his refusal to go in the army of Usama b. Zaid. Such disputation and disagreement with the Prophet on Umar's part is not implausible given the second narration we have provided (and it is interesting that Zuhri had to bail Umar's behavior out from this event).

### [Tabari V.9](#)

Ibn Humayd-Salamah-Ibn Ishaq-al-Zuhri-Sa'id b. al-Musayyib-Abu Hurayrah: When the Messenger of God died, 'Umar b. al-Khattab stood up saying, "**Some of the hypocrites allege that the Messenger of God is dead. By God, he is not dead, but has gone to his Lord as Moses b. 'Imran went and remained hidden from his people for forty days. Moses returned after it was said that he had died. By God, the Messenger of God will [also] return and will cut off the hands and feet of those who allege that he is dead.**"

When the news [of the Prophet's death] reached Abu Bakr, he came and dismounted near the door of the mosque [where] 'Umar was speaking to the people. He paid no attention to anything and went [straight] to the Messenger of God in 'A'ishah's house where he was lying in a corner covered by a striped garment of the Yemeni fabric. Abu Bakr went close [to the Prophet], uncovered his face, kissed him, then said, "With my father may you be ransomed, and with my mother! Indeed, you have tasted the death which God had decreed for you. No [other] death will ever overtake you." Then he replaced the cloth on [the Prophet's] face and went out as 'Umar was speaking to the people. He said, "Gently, O'Umar, [and] be silent!" 'Umar refused [to be silent] and kept on speaking. When Abu Bakr saw that he would not listen, he went forward to the people [speaking]. When they heard his words, they came to him and left 'Umar. After praising God and extolling Him, he said, "O people, those who worshipped Muhammad, [must know that] Muhammad is dead; those who worshipped God, [must know that] God is alive [and] immortal." He then recited the verse: "Muhammad is only a messenger; and many a messenger has gone before him. So if he dies or is killed, will you turn back on your heels? He who turns back on his heels will do no harm to God; and God will reward the grateful." By God, it was as if the people did not know that this verse was revealed to the Messenger of God until Abu Bakr recited it that day. The people took it from him, and it was [constantly] in their mouths. 'Umar said, "By God, as soon as I heard Abu Bakr recite it, my legs betrayed me so that I fell to the ground, and my legs would not bear me. I knew that the Messenger of God had indeed died."

Comments: Shia narratives suggest this is Umar attempting to silence the crowd from spreading news of the Prophet's death. I say this is plausible, but only by virtue of the refusal of Usama and the Hadith of the Pen.

#### [Bukhari 3714](#)

Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) said, "**Fatima is a part of me, and he who makes her angry, makes me angry.**"

#### [Bukhari 3092](#)

Narrated 'Aisha: (mother of the believers) After the death of Allah's Apostle Fatima the daughter of Allah's Apostle asked Abu Bakr As-Siddiq to give her, her share of inheritance from what Allah's Apostle had left of the Fai (i.e. booty gained without fighting) which Allah had given him. Abu Bakr said to her, "Allah's Apostle said, 'Our property will not be inherited, whatever we (i.e. prophets) leave is Sadaqa (to be used for charity).'" **Fatima, the daughter of Allah's Apostle got angry and stopped speaking to Abu Bakr, and continued assuming that attitude till she died.** Fatima remained alive for six months after the death of Allah's Apostle. She used to ask Abu Bakr for her share from the property of Allah's Apostle which he left at Khaibar, and Fadak, and his property at Medina (devoted for charity). Abu Bakr refused to give her that property and said, "I will not leave anything Allah's Apostle used to do, because I am afraid that if I left something from the Prophet's tradition, then I would go astray." (Later on) Umar gave the Prophet's property (of Sadaqa) at Medina to 'Ali and 'Abbas, but he withheld the properties of Khaibar and Fadak in his custody and said, "These two properties are the Sadaqa which Allah's Apostle used to use for his expenditures and urgent needs. Now their management is to be entrusted to the ruler." (Az-Zuhri said, "They have been managed in this way till today.")

Comments: The juxtaposition of these two hadith is self-explanatory.

#### [Bukhari 2010](#)

Narrated Abu Huraira:

Allah's Apostle said, "Whoever prayed at night the whole month of Ramadan out of sincere Faith and hoping for a reward from Allah, then all his previous sins will be forgiven." Ibn Shihab (a sub-narrator) said, "Allah's Apostle died and the people continued observing that (i.e. Nawafil offered individually, not in congregation), and it remained as it was during the Caliphate of Abu Bakr and in the early days of 'Umar's Caliphate." 'Abdur Rahman bin 'Abdul Qari said, "I went out in the company of 'Umar bin Al-Khattab one night in Ramadan to the mosque and found the people praying in different groups. A man praying alone or a man praying with a little group behind him. So, 'Umar said, 'In my opinion I would better collect these (people) under the leadership of one Qari (Reciter) (i.e. let them pray in congregation!)'. So, he made up his mind to congregate them behind Ubai bin Ka'b. Then on another night I went again in his company and the people were praying behind their reciter. On that, **'Umar remarked, 'What an excellent Bid'a (i.e. innovation in religion) this is;** but the prayer which they do not perform, but sleep at its time is better than the one they are offering.' He meant the prayer in the last part of the night. (In those days) people used to pray in the early part of the night."

#### [Muslim 1405](#)

Abu Nadra reported: While I was in the company of Jabir b. Abdullah, a person came to him and said that Ibn 'Abbas and Ibn Zubair differed on the two types of Mut'as (Tamattu' of Hajj 1846 and Tamattu' with women), whereupon Jabir said: We used to do these two during the lifetime of Allah's Messenger ﷺ. **Umar then forbade us to do them,** and so we did not revert to them.

#### [Nasai 1578](#)

It was narrated that Jabir bin 'Abdullah said:

"In his Khutbah the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) used to praise Allah as He deserves to be praised, then he would say: 'Whomsoever Allah (SWT) guides, none can lead him astray, and whomsoever Allah sends astray, none can guide. The truest of word is the Book of Allah and best of guidance is the guidance of Muhammad. **The worst of things are those that are newly invented; every newly-invented thing is an innovation and every innovation is going astray, and every going astray is in the Fire.**' Then he said: 'The Hour and I have been sent like these two.' Whenever he mentioned the Hour, his cheeks would turn red, and he would raise his voice and become angry, as if he were warning of an approaching army and saying: 'An army is coming to attack you in the morning, or in the evening!' (Then he said): 'Whoever leaves behind wealth, it is for his family, and whoever leaves behind a debt or dependents, then these are my responsibility, and I am the most entitled to take care of the believers.'"

Comments: Umar has no religious authority to change the religion.

Narrated Abu Salma bin `Abdur Rahman:

I asked `Aisha, "How is the prayer of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) during the month of Ramadan." **She said, "Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) never exceeded eleven rak`at in Ramadan or in other months; he used to offer four rak`at-- do not ask me about their beauty and length, then four rak`at, do not ask me about their beauty and length, and then three rak`at."** Aisha further said, "I said, 'O Allah's Messenger (ﷺ)! Do you sleep before offering the witr prayer?' He replied, 'O `Aisha! My eyes sleep but my heart remains wake!'"

Comments: Taraweeh is longer than 11 rakat.

threatening to kill [those who maintained that the Prophet was dead].

The *Anṣār* gathered in a roofed building (*saqīfah*)<sup>1289</sup> of the Banū Sā'idah to render their oath of allegiance to Sa'd b. 'Ubadah. This news reached Abū Bakr, so he came to them with 'Umar and Abū 'Ubaydah b. al-Jarrāh, asking [them] why [they had gathered]. They replied, "Let us have a ruler (*amīr*) from us and another from you." Abū Bakr said, "The rulers (*umarā*) will be from us, and the viziers (*wuzarā*) from you." Abū Bakr then added, "I am pleased [to offer] you one of these two men: 'Umar or Abū 'Ubaydah. Some people came to the Prophet asking him to send a trustworthy man with them. The Messenger of God said that he would send a truly trustworthy man with them, and he sent Abū 'Ubaydah b. al-Jarrāh. I am pleased [to offer] you Abū 'Ubaydah." [1818] 'Umar stood up saying, "Who among you would be agreeable to leave Abū Bakr whom the Prophet gave precedence?"<sup>1290</sup> and he gave him the oath of allegiance. The people followed ['Umar]. The *Anṣār* said, or some of them said, "We will not give the oath of allegiance [to anyone] except 'Alī."

Ibn Ḥumayd—Jarīr—Mughīrah—Ziyād b. Kulayb: 'Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb came to the house of 'Alī. Talḥah, al-Zubayr, and some of the *Muhājirūn* were [also] in the house [with 'Alī]. 'Umar cried out, "By God, either you come out to render the oath of allegiance [to

<sup>1289</sup> A rectangular building of one storey consisting merely of a number of pillars with a clay roof, but open at all sides. It seems to have been the clan's gathering place. Serjeant, "Translation," 10.

Abū Bakr's election took place in this building, hence the event surrounding his election is named "The Saqīfah" after it. Following the Prophet's death, the *Anṣār*, who had grown resentful of the growing influence of the Quraysh, met there to deliberate on the critical leadership crisis that had arisen. The common view among the early Muslim historians is that the crisis was averted by the resolute action of three prominent *Muhājirūn*: Abū Bakr, 'Umar, and Abū 'Ubaydah, and that their success was facilitated by the jealousies among the *Anṣār*. The sources, as pointed out by Lammens, "Triumvirate," also suggest an alliance between those three *Muhājirūn*. Moreover, all of them, being close advisers to the Prophet, carried considerable influence and prestige in the emerging Islamic polity. For an analysis of the early sources and an intelligent reconstruction of the events, see Jafrī, *Origins*, 27–57. Shoufani, *al-Riddah*, 48–70, who has reexamined the earlier sources, states that Abū Bakr was elected mainly because he was supported by the newly converted Meccan aristocracy. See also Rodinson, *Mahomet*, 327–28; Momen, *Shi'i Islam*, 18–20.

<sup>1290</sup> The reference is to Abū Bakr's leading the prayer. See n. 1248 above.

Abū Bakr], or I will set the house on fire." Al-Zubayr came out with his sword drawn. As he stumbled [upon something], the sword fell from his hand, so they jumped over him and seized him.<sup>1291</sup>

Zakariyyā b. Yahyā al-Ḍarīr—Abū 'Awānah<sup>1292</sup>—Dāwūd b. 'Abdallāh al-Awdī<sup>1293</sup>—Ḥumayd b. 'Abd al-Rahmān al-Ḥimyarī:<sup>1294</sup> When the Messenger of God died, Abū Bakr was in a detached part of Medina. He came, uncovered [the Prophet's] face, and kissed him, saying, "May my father and mother be your ransom! How good you are both living and dead! [I swear] by the Lord of the Ka'bah that Muḥammad is dead." Then he went to the pulpit and found 'Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb standing [there], threatening the people and saying, "The Messenger of God is alive and not dead. He will [return], go out after those who spread lies about him, cut off their hands and strike their necks and crucify them." Abū Bakr asked him to be silent, but he refused to listen, so Abū Bakr spoke, saying that God had revealed to His Prophet: "Verily, you will die, and so will they. Then on the Day of Resurrection you will dispute before your Lord."<sup>1295</sup> [Then] he said: "Muḥammad is only a messenger, and many a messenger has gone before him. So if he dies or is killed, will you turn back on your heels? He who turns [1819]

**“By God, either you come out to render the Oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr] or I will set the house [Fatima's] on fire.”**

Comments: The story of Bibi Fatima's house after Saqifa- according to my reading- has been exaggerated and abused by polemicists. In my view, the *threat* to burn down the house of Bibi Fatima *definitely* happened as can be found in the narrations of Musnad ibn Abi Shayba, but the burning of the door itself *probably* happened. It seems even Shia scholars doubt the story of Muhsin, so I do not buy that part. Nevertheless, an academically honest reader should ponder as to why such a large body of narrations exist supporting one version of another of Umar making some threat, which he either did or did not act upon, after which Imam Ali had felt distance over.

[Bukhari 4322](#)

Narrated Abu Qatada:

When it was the day of (the battle of) Hunain, I saw a Muslim man fighting with one of the pagans and another pagan was hiding himself behind the Muslim in order to kill him. So I hurried towards the pagan who was hiding behind the Muslim to kill him, and he raised his hand to hit me but I hit his hand and cut it off. That man got hold of me and pressed me so hard that I was afraid (that I would die), then he knelt down and his grip became loose and I pushed him and killed him. **The Muslims (excepting the Prophet and some of his companions) started fleeing and I too, fled with them. Suddenly I met 'Umar bin Al-Khattab amongst the people** and I asked him, "What is wrong with the people?" He said, "It is the order of Allah" Then the people returned to Allah's Apostle (after defeating the enemy). Allah's Apostle said, "Whoever produces a proof that he has killed an infidel, will have the spoils of the killed man." So I got up to look for an evidence to prove that I had killed an infidel, but I could not find anyone to bear witness for me, so I sat down. Then it came to my mind (that I should speak of it) and I mentioned the case to Allah's Apostle. A man from the persons who were sitting with him (i.e. the Prophet), said, "The arms of the deceased one whom he ( i.e. Abu Qatada) has mentioned, are with me, so please compensate him for it (i.e. the spoils)," Abu Bakr said, "No, Allah's Apostle will not give it (i.e. the spoils) to a weak humble person from Quraish and leave one of Allah's Lions who fights on behalf of Allah and His Apostle." Allah's Apostle then got up and gave that (spoils) to me, and I bought with it, a garden which was the first property I got after embracing Islam.

Comments: Umar should not have run because Imam Ali did not.

[Abu Dawud 4399](#)

Narrated Ali ibn AbuTalib:

Ibn Abbas said: A lunatic woman who had committed adultery was brought to Umar. He consulted the people and ordered that she should be stoned.

Ali ibn AbuTalib passed by and said: What is the matter with this (woman)? They said: This is a lunatic woman belonging to a certain family. She has committed adultery. Umar has given orders that she should be stoned.

He said: Take her back. He then came to him and said: Commander of the Faithful, do you not know that there are three people whose actions are not recorded: a lunatic till he is restored to reason, a sleeper till he awakes, and a boy till he reaches puberty?

He said: Yes. He then asked: Why is it that this woman is being stoned?

He said: There is nothing. He then said: Let her go. He (Umar) let her go and began to utter: Allah is most great.

Comments: On many instances, Umar had to consult Imam Ali during his khilafa.

[Muslim 368](#)

Abd al-Rabmin b. Abza narrated It on the authority of his father that a man came to 'Umar and said:

I am (at times) affected by seminal emission but find no water. He ('Umar) told him not to say prayer. 'Ammar then said. Do you remember, O Commander of the Faithful, when I and you were in a military detachment and we had had a seminal emission and did not find water (for taking bath) and you did not say prayer, but as for myself I rolled in dust and said prayer, and (when it was mentioned before) the Apostle (ﷺ) said: It was enough for you to strike the ground with your hands and then blow (the dust) and then wipe your face and palms. Umar said: 'Ammar, fear Allah. He said: If you so like,

I would not narrate it. A hadith like this has been transmitted with the same chain of transmitters but for the words: 'Umar said: We hold you responsible for what you claim.'

#### [Bukhari 338](#)

Narrated `Abdur Rahman bin Abza [??]:

A man came to `Umar bin Al-Khattab and said, "I became Junub but no water was available." `Ammar bin Yasir said to `Umar, "Do you remember that you and I (became Junub while both of us) were together on a journey and you didn't pray but I rolled myself on the ground and prayed? I informed the Prophet (ﷺ) about it and he said, 'It would have been sufficient for you to do like this.' The Prophet then stroked lightly the earth with his hands and then blew off the dust and passed his hands over his face and hands."

#### [Nasai 321](#)

It was narrated that Shaqiq said:

"I was sitting with 'Abdullah and Abu Musa, and Abu Musa said: 'Have you not heard what 'Ammar said to 'Umar: 'The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) sent me on an errand and I became Junub, and I could not find water, so I rolled in the earth then I came to the Prophet (ﷺ) and told him about.' He said: 'It would have been sufficient for you to do this,' and he struck the earth with his hands, then wiped his hands, then knocked them together to remove the dust, then he wiped his right hand with his left and his left hand with his right, palm to palm, and wiped his face.'" Then 'Abdullah said: "Did you not see that 'Umar was not convinced by what 'Ammar said?"

Comments: The reason for juxtaposing these two is to show the point that the last line of Muslim's narration is an ill quality of Umar that he disliked being corrected. If it was not a poor quality, Bukhari in the following narration, from the same 'isnad, would not have removed it.

#### [Ghadeer-e-Khumm](#)

#### [Bukhari 4350](#)

Narrated Buraida:

The Prophet (ﷺ) sent `Ali to Khalid to bring the Khumus (of the booty) and I hated `Ali, and `Ali had taken a bath (after a sexual act with a slave-girl from the Khumus). I said to Khalid, "Don't you see this (i.e. `Ali)?" When we reached the Prophet (ﷺ) I mentioned that to him. He said, "O Buraida! Do you hate `Ali?" I said, "Yes."<sup>2</sup> He said, "Do you hate him, for he deserves more than that from the Khumus."

#### [Tirmidhi 4044](#)

Narrated 'Imran bin Husain:

that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) dispatched an army and he put 'Ali bin Abi Talib in charge of it. He left on the expedition and he entered upon a female slave. So four of the Companions of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) scolded him, and they made a pact saying: "[If] we meet the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) we will inform him of what 'Ali did." When the Muslims returned from the journey, they would begin with the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and give him Salam, then they would go to their homes. So when the expedition arrived, they gave Salam to the Prophet (ﷺ), and one of the four stood saying: "O Messenger of Allah! Do you see that 'Ali bin Abi Talib did such and such." The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) turned away from him. Then the second one stood and said as he said, and he turned away from him. Then the third stood before him, and said as he said, and he turned away from him. Then the fourth stood and said as they had said. The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) faced him, and the anger was visible on his face, he said: "What do you want from 'Ali?! What do you want from 'Ali?! Indeed 'Ali is from me, and I am from him, and he is the ally of every believer after me."

Comments: One of the primary criticisms of Ghadir is that 'mawla' is taken to mean 'friend' or 'ally'. The support that is used is that Khalid bin Walid and Imam Ali had gotten into a conflict regarding war booty in Yemen and the Prophet wished to resolve the conflict at Ghadir-e-Khumm. This is unreasonable- the Prophet here in this narration had already resolved the conflict prior to the sermon at Ghadir-e-Khumm, thus the motivation for delivering said sermon could not have been resolving the conflict between Khalid bin Walid and Imam Ali.

---

<sup>2</sup> [Yes.](#)

[Muslim 2408](#)

[Muslim 2408](#)

Yazid b. Hayyan reported, I went along with Husain b. Sabra and 'Umar b. Muslim to Zaid b. Arqam and, as we sat by his side, Husain said to him: Zaid, you have been able to acquire a great virtue that you saw Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) listened to his talk, fought by his side in (different) battles, offered prayer behind me. Zaid, you have in fact earned a great virtue. Zaid, narrate to us what you heard from Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him). He said: I have grown old and have almost spent my age and I have forgotten some of the things which I remembered in connection with Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him), so accept whatever I narrate to you, and which I do not narrate do not compel me to do that. **He then said: One day Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) stood up to deliver sermon at a watering place known as Khumm situated between Mecca and Medina.** He praised Allah, extolled Him and delivered the sermon and exhorted (us) and said: Now to our purpose. O people, I am a human being. **I am about to receive a messenger (the angel of death) from my Lord** and I, in response to Allah's call, (would bid good-bye to you), **but I am leaving among you two weighty things [thaqalayn]: the one being the Book of Allah in which there is right guidance and light, so hold fast to the Book of Allah and adhere to it. He exhorted (us) (to hold fast) to the Book of Allah and then said: The second are the members of my household I remind you (of your duties) to the members of my family.** He (Husain) said to Zaid: **Who are the members of his household? Aren't his wives the members of his family? Thereupon he said: His wives are the members of his family (but here) the members of his family are those for whom acceptance of Zakat is forbidden. And he said: Who are they? Thereupon he said: 'Ali and the offspring of 'Ali, 'Aqil and the offspring of 'Aqil and the offspring of Ja'far and the offspring of 'Abbas. Husain said: These are those for whom the acceptance of Zakat is forbidden. Zaid said: Yes.**

Addendum ([2408](#)):

We said: Who are amongst the members of the household? **Aren't the wives (of the Holy Prophet) included amongst the members of his house hold? Thereupon he said: No, by Allah, a woman lives with a man (as his wife) for a certain period; he then divorces her and she goes back to her parents and to her people;** the members of his household include his ownself and his kith and kin (who are related to him by blood) and for him the acceptance of Zakat is prohibited.

Comments: This particular Hadith version excludes the wives from Ahlul Bayt

[Tirmidhi 3786](#)

Narrated Jabir bin 'Abdullah: "I saw the Messenger of Allah during his Hajj, on the Day of 'Arafah. He was upon his camel Qaswa, giving a Khutbah, so he said: 'O people! Indeed, I have left among you, that which if you hold fast to it, you shall not go astray: The Book of Allah and my family, the people of my house."

[Tirmidhi 3788](#)

Narrated Zaid bin Arqam, may Allah be pleased with both of them:

that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ said: "Indeed, I am leaving among you, that which if you hold fast to them, you shall not be misguided after me. One of them is greater than the other: The Book of Allah is a rope extended from the sky to the earth, and my family - the people of my house - and they shall not split until they meet at the Hawd, so look at how you deal with them after me."

Comments: The Hadith of Thaqalayn is undeniably Sahih. The version of "Quran and Sunnah" is weak and uncommonly narrated. One Sunni argument suggests that the mention of the Ahlul Bayt means to take care of the family, and not to follow them. If this were the case, it makes no sense to hold this command next to the Quran, whose function is guidance. If they claim that the Sunnah was to be followed, then by replacing Sunnah with Ahlul Bayt in the wording of the Hadith should necessarily also mean to follow the Ahlul Bayt, or else they make an inconsistent argument. Anyone who is reductive about this Hadith should also note that the Prophet also mentioned his death and that the Thaqalayn are his dying will. To be reductive about this Hadith is to reject the Prophet's dying will.

[Ibn Majah 116](#)

It was narrated that Bara' bin 'Azib said:

"We returned with the Messenger of Allah from his Hajj that he had performed, and we stopped at some point on the road. **He commanded that prayer should be performed in congregation, then he took the hand of 'Ali and said: 'Am I not dearer to the believers than their own selves?' They said: 'Yes indeed.' He said: 'Am I not dearer to every believer than his own self?' They said: 'Yes indeed.' He said: 'This man is the [Mawla] of those whose [Mawla] I am.'** O Allah, take as friends those who take him as a friend, and take as enemies those who take him as an enemy."<sup>3</sup>

Comments: I wrote up a detailed argument about the meaning of Mawla [here](#).

#### [Ibn Majah 119](#)

It was narrated that Hubshi bin Junadah said:

"I heard the Messenger of Allah say: " Ali is part of me and I am part of him, and no one will represent me except 'Ali."

#### [Tirmidhi 121](#)

It was narrated that Sa`d bin Waqqas said:

"Mu`awiyah came on one of his pilgrimages and Sa`d entered upon him. They mentioned `Ali, and Mu`awiyah criticized him. Sa`d became angry and said: 'Are you saying this of a man of whom I heard the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) say: "If I am a person's Mawla, `Ali is also his Mawla." And I heard him say: "You are to me like Harun was to Musa, except that there will be no Prophet after me." And I heard him say: "I will give the banner today to a man who loves Allah and His Messenger."

Comments: These are just praises of Imam Ali.

#### [Aisha](#)

#### [Bukhari 6691](#)

Narrated 'Aisha: The Prophet used to stay (for a period) in the house of Zainab bint Jahsh (one of the wives of the Prophet ) and he used to drink honey in her house. Hafsa and I decided that when the Prophet entered upon either of us, she would say, "I smell in you the bad smell of Maghafir (a bad smelling raisin). Have you eaten Maghafir?" When he entered upon one of us, she said that to him. He replied (to her), "No, but I have drunk honey in the house of Zainab bint Jahsh, and I will never drink it again." Then the following verse was revealed: 'O Prophet ! Why do you ban (for you) that which Allah has made lawful for you? ..(up to) **If you two (wives of the Prophet turn in repentance to Allah.'** (66.1-4) The two were 'Aisha and Hafsa And also the Statement of Allah: 'And (Remember) when the Prophet disclosed a matter in confidence to one of his wives!' (66.3) i.e., his saying, "But I have drunk honey." Hisham said: It also meant his saying, "I will not drink anymore, and I have taken an oath, so do not inform anybody of that '

#### [Bukhari 4916](#)

Narrated `Umar:

The wives of the Prophet (ﷺ) out of their jealousy, backed each other against the Prophet, so I said to them, "**It may be, if he divorced you all, that Allah will give him, instead of you wives better than you.**" **So this Verse was revealed.** (66.5)

#### [Bukhari 4914](#)

Narrated Ibn `Abbas:

**I intended to ask `Umar so I said," Who were those two ladies who tried to back each other against the Prophet? " I severely [barely] finished my speech when he said, They were `Aisha and Hafsa. '**

#### [Bukhari 5191](#)

Narrated Ibn 'Abbas :

I had been eager to ask 'Umar bin Al-Khattab about the two ladies from among the wives of the Prophet regarding whom Allah said 'If you two (wives of the Prophet namely Aisha and Hafsa) turn in repentance to Allah, your hearts are indeed so

---

<sup>3</sup> The Sahih portion of the Hadith is in bold. [This Sunni polemics site argues the rest of the hadith is not Sahih by Sunni standards.](#)



inclined (to oppose what the Prophet likes). (66.4) till 'Umar performed the Hajj and I too, performed the Hajj along with him. (On the way) 'Umar went aside to answer the call of nature, and I also went aside along with him carrying a tumbler full of water, and when 'Umar had finished answering the call of nature, I poured water over his hands and he performed the ablution. **Then I said to him, "O chief of the Believers! Who were the two ladies from among the wives of the Prophet regarding whom Allah said: 'If you two (wives of the Prophet) turn in repentance to Allah your hearts are indeed so inclined (to oppose what the Prophet likes)?" (66.4) He said, "I am astonished at your question, O Ibn Abbas. They were 'Aisha and Hafsa."** Then 'Umar went on narrating the Hadith and said, "I and an Ansari neighbor of mine from Bani Umaiyya bin Zaid who used to live in Awali-al-Medina, used to visit the Prophet in turn. He used to go one day and I another day. When I went, I would bring him the news of what had happened that day regarding the Divine Inspiration and other things, and when he went, he used to do the same for me. We, the people of Quraish used to have the upper hand over our wives, but when we came to the Ansar, we found that their women had the upper hand over their men, so our women also started learning the ways of the Ansari women. I shouted at my wife and she retorted against me and I disliked that she should answer me back. She said to me, 'Why are you so surprised at my answering you back? By Allah, the wives of the Prophet answer him back and some of them may leave (does not speak to) him throughout the day till the night.' The (talk) scared me and I said to her, 'Whoever has done so will be ruined!' Then I proceeded after dressing myself, and entered upon Hafsa and said to her, 'Does anyone of you keep the Prophet angry till night?' She said, 'Yes.' I said, 'You are a ruined losing person! Don't you fear that Allah may get angry for the anger of Allah's Apostle and thus you will be ruined? So do not ask more from the Prophet and do not answer him back and do not give up talking to him. Ask me whatever you need and do not be tempted to imitate your neighbor (i.e., 'Aisha) in her manners for she is more charming than you and more beloved to the Prophet.'" Umar added, "At that time a talk was circulating among us that (the tribe of) Ghassan were preparing their horses to invade us. My Ansari companion, on the day of his turn, went (to the town) and returned to us at night and knocked at my door violently and asked if I was there. I became horrified and came out to him. He said, 'Today a great thing has happened.' I asked, 'What is it? Have (the people of) Ghassan come?' He said, 'No, but (What has happened) is greater and more horrifying than that: Allah's Apostle; has divorced his wives. **'Umar added, "The Prophet kept away from his wives and I said "Hafsa is a ruined loser.' I had already thought that most probably this (divorce) would happen in the near future.** So I dressed myself and offered the morning prayer with the Prophet and then the Prophet; entered an upper room and stayed there in seclusion. I entered upon Hafsa and saw her weeping. I asked, 'What makes you weep? Did I not warn you about that? Did the Prophet divorce you all?' She said, 'I do not know. There he is retired alone in the upper room.' I came out and sat near the pulpit and saw a group of people sitting around it and some of them were weeping. I sat with them for a while but could not endure the situation, so I went to the upper room where the Prophet; was and said to a black slave of his, 'Will you get the permission (of the Prophet) for 'Umar (to enter)?' The slave went in, talked to the Prophet about it and then returned saying, 'I have spoken to the Prophet and mentioned you but he kept quiet.' Then I returned and sat with the group of people sitting near the pulpit. but I could not bear the situation and once again I said to the slave, 'Will you get the permission for 'Umar?' He went in and returned saying, 'I mentioned you to him but he kept quiet.' So I returned again and sat with the group of people sitting near the pulpit, but I could not bear the situation, and so I went to the slave and said, 'Will you get the permission for 'Umar?' He went in and returned to me saying, 'I mentioned you to him but he kept quiet.' When I was leaving, behold! The slave called me, saying, 'The Prophet has given you permission.' Then I entered upon Allah's Apostle and saw him Lying on a bed made of stalks of date palm leaves and there was no bedding between it and him. The stalks left marks on his side and he was leaning on a leather pillow stuffed with date-palm fires. I greeted him and while still standing I said, 'O Allah's Apostle! Have you divorced your wives?' He looked at me and said, 'No.' I said, 'Allah Akbar!' And then, while still standing, I said chatting, 'Will you heed what I say, O Allah's Apostle? We, the people of Quraish used to have power over our women, but when we arrived at Medina we found that the men (here) were overpowered by their women.' The Prophet smiled and then I said to him, 'Will you heed what I say, O Allah's Apostle? I entered upon Hafsa and said to her, "Do not be tempted to imitate your companion ('Aisha), for she is more charming than you and more beloved to the Prophet.'" The Prophet smiled for a second time. When I saw him smiling, I sat down. Then I looked around his house, and by Allah, I could not see anything of importance in his house except three hides, so I said, 'O Allah's Apostle! Invoke Allah to make your followers rich, for the Persians and the Romans have been made prosperous and they have been given (the pleasures of the world), although they do not worship Allah.' Thereupon the Prophet sat up as he was reclining. and said, 'Are you of such an opinion, O the son of Al-Khattab? These are the people who have received the rewards for their good deeds in this world.' I said, 'O Allah's Apostle! Ask Allah to forgive me.' Then the Prophet kept away from his wives for twenty-nine days because of the story which Hafsa had disclosed to 'Aisha. The Prophet had said, 'I will not enter upon them (my wives) for one month,' because of his anger towards them, when Allah had admonished him. So, when twenty nine days had passed, the Prophet first entered upon 'Aisha. 'Aisha said to him, 'O Allah's Apostle! You had sworn that you would not enter upon us for one month, but now only twenty-nine days have passed, for I have been counting them one by one.' The Prophet said, 'The

(present) month is of twenty nine days.' 'Aisha added, 'Then Allah revealed the Verses of the option. (2) And out of all his-wives he asked me first, and I chose him.' Then he gave the option to his other wives and they said what 'Aisha had said . " (1) **The Prophet, ' had decided to abstain from eating a certain kind of food because of a certain event, so Allah blamed him for doing so. Some of his wives were the cause of him taking that decision, therefore he deserted them for one month. See Quran: (66.4)**

#### [Bukhari 4483](#)

Narrated Anas:

"Umar said," I Agreed with Allah in three things, "or said," My Lord agreed with me in three things. I said, 'O Allah's Messenger (ﷺ)! prayer. ' I also said, 'O Allah's Messenger (ﷺ)! Good and bad persons visit you! Would you ordered the Mothers of the believers to cover themselves with veils.' So the Divine Verses of Al-Hijab (ie veiling of the women) were revealed. Prophet (ﷺ) or else Allah will give His Apostle better wives than you. ' When I came to one of his wives, she said to me, 'O `Umar! Does Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) have what he could advise his wives with, that you try to advise them? ' "Thereupon Allah revealed: -" It may be, if he divorces you (all) his Lord will give him instead of you, wives better than you Muslims (who submit to Allah) .. "(66.5)

Comments: The incident of Maghafir is well documented and needs no further comment. Though, I would like to remind that the verse "It may be, if he divorces you (all) his Lord will give him instead of you, wives better than you Muslims (who submit to Allah)" (66:5) suggests that the quality of submission and piety were not present in Aisha and Hafsa at the revelation of the verse, lest Allah would not have mentioned it as a replacing quality.

#### [Abu Dawud 2578<sup>4</sup>](#)

Narrated Aisha, Ummul Mu'minin:

while she was on a journey along with the Apostle of Allah (peace\_be\_upon\_him): I had a race with him (the Prophet) and I outstripped him on my feet. When I became fleshy, (again) I had a race with him (the Prophet) and he outstripped me. He said: This is for that outstripping.

Comments: This is weird. No discussion here. This is just humorous.

#### [Muslim 974](#)

Muhammad b. Qais said (to the people): Should I not narrate to you (a Hadith of the Holy Prophet) on my authority and on the authority of my mother? We thought that he meant the mother who had given him birth. He (Muhammad b. Qais) then reported that it was 'Aisha who had narrated this: Should I not narrate to you about myself and about the Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him)? We said: Yes. She said: When it was my turn for Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) to spend the night with me, he turned his side, put on his mantle and took off his shoes and placed them near his feet, and spread the corner of his shawl on his bed and then lay down till he thought that I had gone to sleep. He took hold of his mantle slowly and put on the shoes slowly, and opened the door and went out and then closed it lightly. I covered my head, put on my veil and tightened my waist wrapper, and then went out following his steps till he reached Baqi'. He stood there and he stood for a long time. He then lifted his hands three times, and then returned and I also returned. He hastened his steps and I also hastened my steps. He ran and I too ran. He came (to the house) and I also came (to the house). I, however, preceded him and I entered (the house), and as I lay down in the bed, he (the Holy Prophet) entered the (house), and said: Why is it, O 'Aisha, that you are out of breath? I said: There is nothing. He said: Tell me or the Subtle and the Aware would inform me. I said: Messenger of Allah, may my father and mother be ransom for you, and then I told him (the whole story). He said: Was it the darkness (of your shadow) that I saw in front of me? I said: Yes. **He struck me on the chest which caused me pain**, and then said: Did you think that Allah and His Apostle would deal unjustly with you? She said: Whatever the people conceal, Allah will know it. He said: Gabriel came to me when you saw me. He called me and he concealed it from you. I responded to his call, but I too concealed it from you (for he did not come to you), as you were not fully dressed. I thought that you had gone to sleep, and I did not like to awaken you, fearing that you may be frightened. He (Gabriel) said: Your Lord has commanded you to go to the inhabitants of Baqi' (to those lying in the graves) and beg pardon for them. I said: Messenger of Allah, how should I pray for them (How should I beg forgiveness for them)? He said: Say, Peace be upon the inhabitants of this city (graveyard) from among the Believers and the Muslims, and may Allah have mercy on those who have gone ahead of us, and those who come later on, and we shall, God willing, join you.

---

<sup>4</sup> What...?

Comments: No other wife of the Prophet has been dealt with harshly or stricken by the Prophet than Aisha. "O Prophet, strive against the disbelievers and the hypocrites and be harsh upon them. And their refuge is Hell, and wretched is the destination." (66:9)

#### [Tirmidhi 3878](#)

Narrated Anas [may Allah be pleased with him]:

that the Prophet (ﷺ) said: "**Sufficient for you among the women of mankind are Mariam bint 'Imran, Khadijah bint Khuwailid, Fatimah bint Muhammad and Asiyah the wife of Fir'awn.**"

#### [Bukhari 3623](#)

Narrated 'Aisha:

Once Fatima came walking and her gait resembled the gait of the Prophet . The Prophet said, "Welcome, O my daughter!" Then he made her sit on his right or on his left side, and then he told her a secret and she started weeping. I asked her, "Why are you weeping?" He again told her a secret and she started laughing. I said, "I never saw happiness so near to sadness as I saw today." I asked her what the Prophet had told her. She said, "I would never disclose the secret of Allah's Apostle ." When the Prophet died, I asked her about it. She [Fatima] replied. "*The Prophet said.*) *'Every year Gabriel used to revise the Qur'an with me once only, but this year he has done so twice. I think this portends my death, and you will be the first of my family to follow me.'* So I started weeping. **Then he said. 'Don't you [Fatima] like to be the mistress of all the ladies of Paradise or the mistress of all the lady believers? So I laughed at that.'**

Comments: It is unfortunate that on the pulpits of Sunni masjids, Aisha is talked about more and praised more than the women who the Prophet considered "sufficient". This rhetoric is only a result of Wahhabi and Salafi zealots seeking to sideline the Ahlul Bayt in order to combat Shiaism. Bibi Fatima, as established by these two narrations, is clearly better than Aisha, yet her name or her hadith are seldom ever mentioned by the Sunnis.

#### [Bukhari 6004](#)

Narrated `Aisha:

**I never felt so jealous of any woman as I did of Khadija**, though she had died three years before the Prophet married me, and that was because I heard him **mentioning her too often**, and because his Lord had ordered him to give her the glad tidings that she would have a palace in Paradise, made of Qasab and because he used to slaughter a sheep and distribute its meat among her friends.

Comments: Aisha's jealousy is well documented. Make note of the incident of Maghafir especially.

#### [Ubiquitous](#)

Narrated the Prophet (PBUH)

Fatima (as) is the leader of the Women of Paradise

#### [Bukhari 3625](#)

Narrated `Aisha:

The Prophet (ﷺ) in his fatal illness, called his daughter Fatima and told her a secret because of which she started weeping. Then he called her and told her another secret, and she started laughing. When I asked her about that, she replied, The Prophet (ﷺ) told me that he would die in his fatal illness, and so I wept, but then he secretly told me that from amongst his family, **I [Fatima] would be the first to join him**, and so I laughed."

Comments: More hadith suggesting the superiority of Bibi Fatima to all women.

#### [Bukhari 3772](#)

Narrated Abu Wail:

When 'Ali sent 'Ammar and Al-Hasan to (the people of) Kufa to urge them to fight, 'Ammar addressed them saying, "I know that she (i.e. 'Aisha) is the wife of the Prophet in this world and in the Hereafter (world to come), but Allah has put you to test, whether you will follow Him (i.e. Allah) or her."

[Bukhari 7100](#)

Narrated Abu Maryam Abdullah bin Ziyad Al-Aasadi:

When Talha, Az Zubair and 'Aisha moved to Basra, 'Ali sent 'Ammar bin Yasir and Hasan bin 'Ali who came to us at Kufa and ascended the pulpit. Al-Hasan bin 'Ali was at the top of the pulpit and 'Ammar was below Al-Hasan. We all gathered before him. I heard 'Ammar saying, "'Aisha has moved to Al-Basra. By Allah! She is the wife of your Prophet in this world and in the Hereafter. **But Allah has put you to test whether you obey Him (Allah) or her ('Aisha).**"

Comments: Aisha disobeyed the command in the Quran: "and stay in your houses" (33:33) and fought Imam Ali. Especially damning in this Hadith is the idea that Ammar said this statement under Imam Ali- that is, three of the best Sahaba (one of the Ashra Mubashira, the "Master of the Youths of Paradise" and someone whom the Prophet admitted into the Ahlul Bayt) agreed to this sentiment.

[Muslim 1453](#)

Zainab daughter of Abu Salama reported: I heard Umm Salama, the wife of Allah's Apostle (may peace be upon him), saying to 'A'isha: By Allah, I do not like to be seen by a young boy who has passed the period of fosterage, whereupon she ('A'isha) said: Why is it so? Sahla daughter of Suhail came to Allah's Messenger (Peace be upon him) and said: Allah's Messenger, I swear by Allah that I see in the face of Abu Hudhaifa (the signs of disgust) on account of entering of Salim (in the house), whereupon Allah's Messenger (Peace be upon him) said: Suckle him. She (Sahla bint Suhail) said: He has a beard. But he (again) said: Suckle him, and it would remove what is there (expression of disgust) on the face of Abu Hudhaifa. She said: (I did that) and, by Allah, I did not see (any sign of disgust) on the face of Abu Hudhaifa.

Comments: Inappropriate and haraam. This is not something the Prophet would command.

[Nasai 3955](#)

Anas said:

"The Prophet was with one of the Mothers of the Believers when another one sent a wooden bowl in which was some food. **She struck the hand of the Prophet** and the bowl fell and broke. The Prophet picked up the two pieces and put them together, then he started to gather up the food and said: 'Your mother got jealous; eat.' So they ate. He waited until she brought the wooden bowl that was in her house, then he gave the sound bowl to the messenger and left the broken bowl in the house of the one who had broken it."

Comments: Again, Aisha's jealousy is well documented.

[Muslim 78](#)

Zirr reported:

'Ali observed: By Him Who split up the seed and created something living, the Apostle (may peace and blessings be upon him) gave me a promise that **no one but a believer would love me, and none but hypocrite would nurse grudge against me.**

[Bukhari 2588](#)

Narrated Az-Zuhari: Ubaidullah bin 'Abdullah told me that 'Aisha had said, "When the Prophet became sick and his condition became serious, he requested his wives to allow him to be treated in my house, and they allowed him. He came out leaning on two men while his feet were dragging on the ground. He was walking between Al-'Abbas and another man." 'Ubaidullah said, "When I informed Ibn 'Abbas of what 'Aisha had said, he asked me whether I knew who was the second man **whom 'Aisha had not named.** I replied in the negative. He said, 'He was 'Ali bin Abi Talib."

[Tabari V.17 p224](#)

greeted as *amr*. Ibn Bakr asked, "Who is this?" and they told him, "Amr." "Then who is it that I have killed?" Told that it was Khārijah b. Ḥudhāfah, Ibn Bakr said, "By God, you wicked man (*fāsiq*)! I was sure it was you!" 'Amr b. al-ʿĀṣ replied, "You wanted me, but God wanted Khārijah!" Then he had 'Amr b. Bakr brought forward and killed him.

[3466] When Mu'āwiyah heard about that, he wrote to 'Amr b. al-ʿĀṣ:

The fate of a shaykh of Lu'ayy b. Ghālib<sup>895</sup>  
was murder, and many are the causes of death.  
Oh 'Amr, take it easy. You were his paternal uncle  
and his companion, above his male relatives.  
You escaped, but the Murādī<sup>896</sup> has moistened his sword  
(with blood) from the son of Abī Ṭālib, the shaykh of al-  
Abṭah.<sup>897</sup>  
Another like him (i.e., like Ibn Muljam) struck me with a sword,  
and this was a blow that continues to afflict us,  
While you, every day and night, in that Egypt of yours,  
speak honeyed words to fair-skinned ladies, like gazelles going  
to pasture.

When news of 'Alī's death reached 'Ā'ishah,<sup>898</sup> she said:

And she threw down her staff and settled upon her place of abode,  
like the traveler happy to return home.<sup>899</sup>

She asked who had killed him and, when told that it was a man  
of Murād, she said:

Even though he was far away, there has announced his death  
a young man (*ghulām*) in whose mouth there was no dust.<sup>900</sup>

Zaynab, the daughter of Abū Salamah,<sup>901</sup> said, "Are you saying  
this about 'Alī?" and 'Ā'ishah replied, "I am forgetful, and, if I forget,

895. That is, Khārijah.

896. That is, Ibn Muljam.

897. A name applied to several places in and around Mecca; here it is probably  
synonymous with Mecca (see *EP*, s.v. Makka).

898. The widow of the Prophet, and the opponent of 'Alī at the Camel.

899. *Ann.*, A.H. 40 §32, says that the verse is proverbial and is cited to indicate  
pleasure at something.

900. That is, he told the truth.

901. See nn. 812, 813, above.

Comments: These three narrations juxtaposed are self-explanatory.

#### Abu Bakr

#### [Tabari V.6 p85](#)

I (Muhammad ibn Sa'ad ibn Abi Waqqas) asked my father whether Abu Bakr was the first of the Muslims. He said, 'No, more than fifty people embraced Islam before Abu Bakr; but he was superior to us as a Muslim. He also writes that Umar Bin Khattab embraced Islam after forty-five men and twenty-one women. As for the foremost one in the matter of Islam and faith, it was Ali Bin Abi Talib.'

Those who say this: In Humayd-Kinana b. Jabalah- Ibrahim b. Tahman-al-Hajjaj b. al-Hajjaj-Qatadah-Salim b. Abi al-Ja'd-Muhammad b. Sad: I said to my father, "Was Abu Bakr the first of them to accept Islam?" He answered, "No, more than fifty people accepted Islam before him, but he was the best Muslim among us."

Comments: The first fabrication of Abu Bakr is that he was the first to enter Islam. Clearly, from the narrations of Sunni scholar Dhababi in *Kitab al Nubala* and another Sunni scholar's *Al-Awael*, it becomes clear that Abu Bakr was *not* the first to enter Islam. Moreover, if we look at Tabari's chain of narrators as well as the fact that this narration is speaking *praises* of Abu Bakr, it makes no sense to call this narration into question.

#### [Tirmidhi 4029](#)

Narrated Abu Sa'eed Al-Khudri:

that Abu Bakr said: "Am I not the most deserving of it among the people, am I not the first to become Muslim, am I not the person of such and such, am I not the person of such and such."

Comments: Given the evidence, this is a lie.

#### [Bukhari 4240](#)

Narrated `Aisha:

Fatima the daughter of the Prophet (ﷺ) sent someone to Abu Bakr (when he was a caliph), asking for her inheritance of what Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) had left of the property bestowed on him by Allah from the Fai (i.e. booty gained without fighting) in Medina, and Fadak, and what remained of the Khumus of the Khaibar booty. On that, Abu Bakr said, "Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) said, "Our property is not inherited. Whatever we leave, is Sadaqa, **but the family of (the Prophet) Muhammad can eat of this property.**" By Allah, I will not make any change in the state of the Sadaqa of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) and will leave it as it was during the lifetime of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ), and will dispose of it as Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) used to do." **So Abu Bakr refused to give anything of that to Fatima. So she became angry with Abu Bakr and kept away from him, and did not talk to him till she died.** She remained alive for six months after the death of the Prophet. When she died, her husband `Ali, **buried her at night without informing Abu Bakr and he said the funeral prayer by himself.** When Fatima was alive, the people used to respect `Ali much, but after her death, `Ali noticed a change in the people's attitude towards him. So `Ali sought reconciliation with Abu Bakr and gave him an oath of allegiance. `Ali had not given the oath of allegiance during those months (i.e. the period between the Prophet's death and Fatima's death). `Ali sent someone to Abu Bakr saying, "Come to us, but let nobody come with you," as he disliked that `Umar should come, `Umar said (to Abu Bakr), "No, by Allah, you shall not enter upon them alone " Abu Bakr said, "What do you think they will do to me? By Allah, I will go to them" So Abu Bakr entered upon them, and then `Ali uttered Tashah-hud and said (to Abu Bakr), "We know well your superiority and what Allah has given you, and we are not jealous of the good what Allah has bestowed upon you, but you did not consult us in the question of the rule and we thought that we have got a right in it because of our near relationship to Allah's Messenger (ﷺ)." Thereupon Abu Bakr's eyes flowed with tears. And when Abu Bakr spoke, he said, "By Him in Whose Hand my soul is to keep good relations with the relatives of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) is dearer to me than to keep good relations with my own relatives. But as for the trouble which arose between me and you about his property, I will do my best to spend it according to what is good, and will not leave any rule or regulation which I saw Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) following, in disposing of it, but I will follow." On that `Ali said to Abu Bakr, "I promise to give you the oath of allegiance in this after noon." So when Abu Bakr had offered the Zuhr prayer, he ascended the pulpit and uttered the Tashah-hud and then mentioned the story of **`Ali and his failure to give the oath of allegiance**, and excused him, accepting what excuses he had offered; Then `Ali (got up) and praying (to Allah) for forgiveness, he uttered Tashah-hud, praised Abu Bakr's right, and said, that he had not done what he had done because of jealousy of Abu Bakr or as a protest of that Allah had favored him with. `Ali added, **"But we used to consider that we too had some right in this affair (of rulership) and that he (i.e. Abu Bakr) did not consult us in this matter, and therefore caused us to feel sorry."** On that all the Muslims became happy and said, "You have done the right thing." The Muslims then became friendly with `Ali as he returned to what the people had done (i.e. giving the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr).

#### [Quran 59:7](#)

And what Allah restored to His Messenger from the people of the towns - it is for Allah and for the Messenger **and for [his] near relatives**<sup>5</sup> and orphans and the [stranded] traveler - so that it will not be a perpetual distribution among the rich from among you. And whatever the Messenger has given you - take; and what he has forbidden you - refrain from. And fear Allah ; indeed, Allah is severe in penalty.

#### [Bukhari 3714](#)

Narrated Al-Miswar bin Makhrama:

Allah's Apostle said, "Fatima is a part of me, and **he who makes her angry, makes me angry.**"<sup>6</sup>

Comments: The issue of Fadak was the source of anger for Bibi Fatima. The above hadith is self-explanatory.

#### [Abu Dawud 2978](#)

---

<sup>5</sup> In both versions of the hadith, Umar misquoted the Quran

<sup>6</sup> May not be authentic in Sunni tradition because Miswar was [born in 2AH](#)

Narrated Jubair b. Mut'im:

That he and 'Uthman b. 'Affan went to the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) talking to him about the fifth which he divided among the Banu Hisham and Abu 'Abd al-Muttalib. I said: Messenger of Allah, you have divided (the fifth) among our brethren Banu 'Abd al-Muttalib, but you have not given us anything, though our relationship to you is the same as theirs. The Prophet (ﷺ) said: The Banu Hisham and the Banu 'Abd al-Muttalib are one. Jubair said: He did not divide the fifth among the Banu 'Abd Shams and the Banu Nawfal as he divided among the Banu Hashim and the Banu 'Abd al-Muttalib. He said: Abu Bakr used to divide the fifth like the division of Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) except that he did not give the relatives of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ), as he gave them. 'Umar b. al-Khattab and 'Uthman after him used to give them (a portion) from it.

Quran 8:41

"And know that whatever thing you gain, a fifth of it is for Allah and for the Messenger and for the near of kin and the orphans and the needy and the wayfarer, if you believe in Allah."

Comments: Abu Bakr unreasonably neglected the share of Khums belonging to the Ahlul Bayt.

[Bukhari 602](#)

Narrated Abu 'Uthman:

'Abdur Rahman bin Abi Bakr said, "The Suffa Companions were poor people and the Prophet ﷺ said, 'Whoever has food for two persons should take a third one from them (Suffa companions). And whosoever has food for four persons he should take one or two from them' Abu Bakr took three men and the Prophet took ten of them." 'Abdur Rahman added, my father my mother and I were there (in the house). (The sub-narrator is in doubt whether 'Abdur Rahman also said, 'My wife and our servant who was common for both my house and Abu Bakr's house). Abu Bakr took his supper with the Prophet and remained there till the 'Isha' prayer was offered. Abu Bakr went back and stayed with the Prophet till the Prophet took his meal and then Abu Bakr returned to his house after a long portion of the night had passed. Abu Bakr's wife said, 'What detained you from your guests (or guest)?' He said, 'Have you not served them yet?' She said, 'They refused to eat until you come. The food was served for them but they refused.'" 'Abdur Rahman added, "I went away and hid myself (being afraid of Abu Bakr) and in the meantime **he (Abu Bakr) called me, 'O Ghunthar (a harsh word)!**' and also called me bad names and abused me and then said (to his family), 'Eat. No welcome for you.' Then (the supper was served). Abu Bakr took an oath that he would not eat that food. The narrator added: By Allah, whenever any one of us (myself and the guests of Suffa companions) took anything from the food, it increased from underneath. We all ate to our fill and the food was more than it was before its serving. Abu Bakr looked at it (the food) and found it as it was before serving or even more than that. He addressed his wife (saying) 'O the sister of Bani Firas! What is this?' She said, 'O the pleasure of my eyes! The food is now three times more than it was before.' Abu Bakr ate from it, and said, 'That (oath) was from Satan' meaning his oath (not to eat). Then he again took a morsel (mouthful) from it and then took the rest of it to the Prophet. So that meal was with the Prophet. There was a treaty between us and some people, and when the period of that treaty had elapsed the Prophet divided us into twelve (groups) (the Prophet's companions) each being headed by a man. Allah knows how many men were under the command of each (leader). So all of them (12 groups of men) ate of that meal."

[Tārīkh Tabarī, v 3 p 429; Tārīkh Ya'qūbī, v 2 p 137 \(Alternate Sunni Source\)](#) (2)

"Yes, I am not upset for anything in this world, except three things I have done and I wish I had not done them and three things I have not done and I wish I had done them and three things I wish I had asked the Prophet (s). **But what I wish I had not done, first is that I wish I had not invaded the house of Fatima (a) even if they closed it to me for war**, second is that I wish I had not burned Fuja'a Sullami and instead I either had killed or released him. The third is that I wish on the Day of Saqifa, I had left the caliphate on either of these two men 'Umar or Abu 'Ubayda that one of them would become the caliph and I would become his minister.

But the three things I did not do and wish I had: the first is that when Ash'as ibn Qays was brought to me in captivity, I wish I had struck his neck, because I suspect he will enforce evil wherever he finds it; and the other one is that I wish when I sent Khalid Bin Waleed to the battle of the apostates I had remained at Zil Qissah so that I could help the army if they were defeated; and the third one, I wish that when I delegated Khalid to Sham I had sent Omar to Iraq so that I had opened my two hands in the cause of God.

Calm down, may God have mercy on you, for this will only cause you a relapse in your condition. Regarding your matter, the people are [divided] between only two men, either a man who has viewed [things] as you have and is thus with you, or else a man has opposed you and thus is your adviser and companion as you like. We have not known you to desire other than the good. You have not ceased to be a righteous man and one who sets matters aright. You do not grieve for anything from this world.

Abū Bakr said,

Indeed, I do not grieve for anything from this world, except for three [things] which I did that I wish I had left aside, three that I left aside which I wish I had done, and three about which I wish I had asked God's Messenger. As for the three that I wish I had left aside, I wish that I had not thrown open the house of Fāṭimah<sup>812</sup> to reveal something, even though they had locked it with hostile intent. I wish that I had not burned al-Fujā'ah al-Sulamī<sup>813</sup> and that I had quickly killed him or forbearingly let him go. I wish, on the day of Saqīfat Banī Sā'idah,<sup>814</sup> that I had thrown the matter upon the neck of one of the two men [meaning 'Umar and Abū 'Ubaydah] so that one of them would have become the Commander [of the Faithful] and I would have been his minister (*wazīr*). As for those I left aside, I wish that on the day I was brought al-Ash'ath b. Qays<sup>815</sup> as a prisoner I had cut off

<sup>812</sup>. The daughter of the Prophet, c. 604 C.E. – 11/632. On her, see *EP*, s.v. Fāṭima. The story in question here seems to refer to the attempt to compel 'Alī and Fāṭimah to swear allegiance to Abū Bakr as caliph. What they are hiding here is not clear, however. See Tabarī, I, 1822, 1825–26; Balādhuri, *Ansāb*, I, 585–87.

<sup>813</sup>. He is Bujayrah b. Iyās b. 'Abdallāh b. 'Abd Yālil, who was burned for treason. See Tabarī, I, 1903–5; Ibn al-Kalbī, *Ġamharat*, I, 122; II, 228–29; Balādhuri, *Futūh*, 117, 123.

<sup>814</sup>. The meeting hall of the Banū Sā'idah in Medina, where Abū Bakr was acknowledged as caliph upon the death of the Prophet. On it, see Tabarī, I, 1817–25, 1837–45; Ibn Hishām, *Sīrah*, II, 656–60; Ibn Sa'd, *Ṭabaqāt*, III, 615–17; Bukhārī, *Ṣaḥīḥ*, V, 8; Balādhuri, *Ansāb*, I, 579–84, 589; Ya'qūbī, *Tārīkh*, II, 136–38. This enormously important event led to the establishment of the caliphate, with all the political and other consequences that entailed. Abū Bakr here is expressing scruples about the responsibility of government that he has borne.

<sup>815</sup>. Al-Kindī, he was an important prince in Ḥaḍramawt who embraced Islam in the Prophet's lifetime. After the latter's death, however, he rebelled and had to be sub-

Comments: This narration corroborates the incident of the door after Saqifa.

### [Muslim 1823](#)

It has been reported on the authority of Ibn 'Umar who said:

I entered the apartment of (my sister) Hafsa. She said: Do you know that your father is not going to nominate his successor? I said: He will not do that (ie he would nominate). She said: He is going to do that. The narrator said: I took an oat that I will talk to him about the matter. I kept quiet until the next morning, still I did not talk to him, and I felt as if I were carrying a mountain on my right hand. At last I came to him and entered his apartment. (Seeing me) he began to ask me about the condition of the people, and I informed him (about them). Then I said to him: I heard something from the people and took an oat that I will communicate it to you. They presume that you are not going to nominate a successor. If a grave of camels and sheep that you had indicated comes back to you leaving the cattle, you will (certainly) think that the cattle are lost. To look after the people is more serious and grave. (The dying Caliph) was moved at my words. He bent his head in a thoughtful mood for some time and raised it to me and said: God will doubtlessly protect his religion. If I do not nominate a successor (I have a precedent before me), for the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) did not nominate his successor. And if I nominate one (I have a precedent), for Abu Bakr did nominate. The narrator (Ibn Umar) said: By God, when he mentioned the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and **Abu Bakr, I (at once) understood that he would not place anyone at a par with the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and would not nominate anyone.** He bent his head in a thoughtful mood for some time and raised it to me and said: God will doubtlessly protect his religion. If I do not nominate a successor (I have a precedent before me), for the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) did not nominate his successor. And if I nominate one (I have a precedent), for Abu Bakr did nominate. The narrator (Ibn Umar) said: By God, when he mentioned the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and **Abu Bakr, I (at once) understood that he would not place anyone at a par with the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and would not nominate anyone.** He bent his head in a thoughtful mood for some time and raised it to me and said:



God will doubtlessly protect his religion. If I do not nominate a successor (I have a precedent before me), for the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) did not nominate his successor. And if I nominate one (I have a precedent), for Abu Bakr did nominate. The narrator (Ibn Umar) said: By God, when he mentioned the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and Abu Bakr, I (at once) understood that he would not place anyone at a par with the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and would not nominate anyone. The narrator (Ibn Umar) said: By God, when he mentioned the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and Abu Bakr, I (at once) understood that he would not place anyone at a par with the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and would not nominate anyone. The narrator (Ibn Umar) said: By God, when he mentioned the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and Abu Bakr, I (at once) understood that he would not place anyone at a par with the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and would not nominate anyone.

#### [Quran 33:36](#)

It is not for a believing man or a believing woman, when Allah and His Messenger have decided a matter, that they should [thereafter] have any choice about their affair. And whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger has certainly strayed into clear error.

Comments: The Sunni narrative may sometimes suggest that Abu Bakr was implicitly appointed, but clearly the narration suggests no appointment was made. Of course, Ghadeer was the appointment of Imam Ali.

#### [Bukhari 6830](#)

Narrated Ibn `Abbas:

I used to teach (the Qur'an to) some people of the Muhajirun (emigrants), among whom there was `Abdur Rahman bin `Auf. While I was in his house at Mina, and he was with `Umar bin Al-Khattab during `Umar's last Hajj, `Abdur-Rahman came to me and said, "Would that you had seen the man who came today to the Chief of the Believers (`Umar), saying, 'O Chief of the Believers! What do you think about so-and-so who says, **'If `Umar should die, I will give the pledge of allegiance to such-and such person, as by Allah, the pledge of allegiance to Abu Bakr was nothing but a prompt sudden action which got established afterwards.'** `Umar became angry and then said, **'Allah willing, I will stand before the people tonight and warn them against those people who want to deprive the others of their rights (the question of rulership).** `Abdur-Rahman said, "I said, 'O Chief of the believers! Do not do that, for the *season of Hajj gathers the riff-raff and the rubble, and it will be they who will gather around you when you stand to address the people. And I am afraid that you will get up and say something, and some people will spread your statement and may not say what you have actually said and may not understand its meaning, and may interpret it incorrectly, so you should wait till you reach Medina, as it is the place of emigration and the place of Prophet's Traditions, and there you can come in touch with the learned and noble people, and tell them your ideas with confidence*; and the learned people will understand your statement and put it in its proper place.' On that, `Umar said, 'By Allah! Allah willing, I will do this in the first speech I will deliver before the people in Medina." Ibn `Abbas added: We reached Medina by the end of the month of Dhul-Hijja, and when it was Friday, we went quickly (to the mosque) as soon as the sun had declined, and I saw Sa`id bin Zaid bin `Amr bin Nufail sitting at the corner of the pulpit, and I too sat close to him so that my knee was touching his knee, and after a short while `Umar bin Al-Khattab came out, and when I saw him coming towards us, I said to Sa`id bin Zaid bin `Amr bin Nufail "Today `Umar will say such a thing as he has never said since he was chosen as Caliph." Sa`id denied my statement with astonishment and said, "What thing do you expect `Umar to say the like of which he has never said before?" In the meantime, `Umar sat on the pulpit and when the callmakers for the prayer had finished their call, `Umar stood up, and having glorified and praised Allah as He deserved, he said, "Now then, I am going to tell you something which (Allah) has written for me to say. I do not know; perhaps it portends my death, so whoever understands and remembers it, must narrate it to the others wherever his mount takes him, but if somebody is afraid that he does not understand it, then it is unlawful for him to tell lies about me. Allah sent Muhammad with the Truth and revealed the Holy Book to him, and among what Allah revealed, was the Verse of the Rajam (the stoning of married person (male & female) who commits illegal sexual intercourse, and we did recite this Verse and understood and memorized it. Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) did carry out the punishment of stoning and so did we after him. I am afraid that after a long time has passed, somebody will say, 'By Allah, we do not find the Verse of the Rajam in Allah's Book,' and thus they will go astray by leaving an obligation which Allah has revealed. And the punishment of the Rajam is to be inflicted on any married person (male & female), who commits illegal sexual intercourse, if the required evidence is available or there is conception or confession. And then we used to recite among the Verses in Allah's Book: 'O people! Do not claim to be the offspring of other than your fathers, as it is disbelief (unthankfulness) on your part that you claim to be the offspring of other than your real father.' Then Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) said, 'Do not praise me excessively as Jesus, son of Mary was praised, but call me Allah's Slave and His Apostles.' (O people!) I have been informed that a speaker amongst you says, 'By

Allah, if `Umar should die, I will give the pledge of allegiance to such-and-such person.' **One should not deceive oneself by saying that the pledge of allegiance given to Abu Bakr was given suddenly and it was successful. No doubt, it was like that, but Allah saved (the people) from its evil, and there is none among you who has the qualities of Abu Bakr. Remember that whoever gives the pledge of allegiance to anybody among you without consulting the other Muslims, neither that person, nor the person to whom the pledge of allegiance was given, are to be supported, lest they both should be killed. And no doubt after the death of the Prophet (ﷺ) we were informed that the Ansar disagreed with us and gathered in the shed of Bani Sa`da. `Ali and Zubair and whoever was with them, opposed us, while the emigrants gathered with Abu Bakr. I said to Abu Bakr, 'Let's go to these Ansari brothers of ours.' So we set out seeking them, and when we approached them, two pious men of theirs met us and informed us of the final decision of the Ansar, and said, 'O group of Muhajirin (emigrants)! Where are you going?' We replied, 'We are going to these Ansari brothers of ours.' They said to us, 'You shouldn't go near them. Carry out whatever we have already decided.'** I said, 'By Allah, we will go to them.' And so we proceeded until we reached them at the shed of Bani Sa`da. Behold! There was a man sitting amongst them and wrapped in something. I asked, 'Who is that man?' They said, 'He is Sa`d bin `Ubada.' I asked, 'What is wrong with him?' They said, 'He is sick.' After we sat for a while, the Ansar's speaker said, 'None has the right to be worshipped but Allah,' and praising Allah as He deserved, he added, 'To proceed, we are Allah's Ansar (helpers) and the majority of the Muslim army, while you, the emigrants, are a small group and some people among you came with the intention of preventing us from practicing this matter (of caliphate) and depriving us of it.' When the speaker had finished, I intended to speak as I had prepared a speech which I liked and which I wanted to deliver in the presence of Abu Bakr, and I used to avoid provoking him. So, when I wanted to speak, Abu Bakr said, 'Wait a while.' I disliked making him angry. So Abu Bakr himself gave a speech, and he was wiser and more patient than I. By Allah, he never missed a sentence that I liked in my own prepared speech, but he said the like of it or better than it spontaneously. After a pause he said, 'O Ansar! You deserve all (the qualities that you have attributed to yourselves, but this question (of Caliphate) is only for the Quraish as they are the best of the Arabs as regards descent and home, and I am pleased to suggest that you choose either of these two men, so take the oath of allegiance to either of them as you wish. And then Abu Bakr held my hand and Abu Ubaida bin al-Jarrah's hand who was sitting amongst us. I hated nothing of what he had said except that proposal, for by Allah, I would rather have my neck chopped off as expiator for a sin than become the ruler of a nation, one of whose members is Abu Bakr, unless at the time of my death my own-self suggests something I don't feel at present.' And then one of the Ansar said, 'I am the pillar on which the camel with a skin disease (eczema) rubs itself to satisfy the itching (i.e., I am a noble), and I am as a high class palm tree! O Quraish. There should be one ruler from us and one from you.' Then there was a hue and cry among the gathering and their voices rose so that I was afraid there might be great disagreement, so I said, 'O Abu Bakr! Hold your hand out.' **He held his hand out and I pledged allegiance to him,** and then all the emigrants gave the Pledge of allegiance and so did the Ansar afterwards. And so we became victorious over Sa`d bin Ubada (whom Al-Ansar wanted to make a ruler). **One of the Ansar said, 'You have killed Sa`d bin Ubada.' I replied, 'Allah has killed Sa`d bin Ubada.'** `Umar added, "By Allah, apart from the great tragedy that had happened to us (i.e. the death of the Prophet), there was no greater problem than the allegiance pledged to Abu Bakr because we were afraid that if we left the people, they might give the Pledge of allegiance after us to one of their men, in which case we would have given them our consent for something against our real wish, or would have opposed them and caused great trouble. So if any person gives the Pledge of allegiance to somebody (to become a Caliph) without consulting the other Muslims, then the one he has selected should not be granted allegiance, lest both of them should be killed."

Comments: In this narration, Umar admits Saqifa was evil and should not have been done that way. Imam Ali's disagreement and Bibi Fatima's lack of bay'ah discount the authority of Abu Bakr as a result. In other words, this narration is a direct admission of the illegitimacy of Abu Bakr. Moreover the comment about the riff-raff gathering at Mecca shows that Ghadeer-Khumm was a superior location to Arafah on the Hajj for delivering the message. The Farewell Sermon did not contain anything controversial- hence Arafah was an appropriate location for it. However, Ghadeer was far more controversial, and hence the pond was a superior location.

#### [Muwatta al Malik 72](#)

Yahya related to me from Malik from Ibn Shihab from Abbad ibn Ziyad, a descendant of al-Mughira ibn Shuba from his father from al Mughira ibn Shuba that the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, went to relieve himself during the expedition of Tabuk. Mughira said, "I went with him, taking water. Then the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, came back and I poured out the water for him. He washed his hands and then went to push his hands out of the sleeves of his garment, but could not do so because of their narrowness. So he brought them out from underneath his garment. Then he washed his arms, wiped his head and wiped over his leather socks. The Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, returned and **Abdar Rahman ibn Awf was leading**

**the people in prayer, and he had already finished one raka with them. The Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, prayed the remaining raka with them to everyone's concern. When the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, finished he said, 'You have acted correctly.'** "

Comments: The merit of leading prayers where the Prophet followed is not unique to Abu Bakr, and this cannot be said to be an appointment even if Abu Bakr leading the prayers was an authentic narrative. Even Umm Maktoum, the blind sahaba, led Friday prayers. How then, can the leading of prayers be brought as definitive and implicit appointment *even if* it can be proven to be true.

Uthman

[Muslim 1223c](#)

Sa'id b. al-Musayyab reported that 'Ali and 'Uthman (Allah be pleased with them) met at 'Ufsan; and Uthman used to forbid (people) from performing Tamattu' and 'Umra (during the period of Hajj), whereupon 'Ali said:

What is your opinion about a matter which the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) did but you forbid it? Thereupon Uthman said: You leave us alone, whereupon he ('Ali) said: I cannot leave you alone. When 'Ali saw this, he put on Ihram for both of them together (both for Hajj and 'Umra).

Comments: Just as how Umar banned mutah and introduced tarawih, Uthman banned Tamattu- and this too against the wishes of Imam Ali.

[Bukhari 1082](#)

Narrated `Abdullah bin `Umar:

I offered the prayer with the **Prophet, Abu Bakr and `Umar at Mina and it was of two rak`at.** `Uthman in the early days of his caliphate did the same, but **later on he started praying the full prayer.**

[Bukhari 1090](#)

Narrated `Aisha:

"When the prayers **were first enjoined they were of two rak`at each. Later the prayer in a journey was kept as it was but the prayers for non-travelers were completed.**" Az-Zuhri said, "I asked `Urwa what made Aisha pray the full prayers (in journey)." He replied, "**She did the same as `Uthman did.**"

Comments: [The root of the word bid'ah in Arabic means initiating something without any precedent](#)

Fadak

[Abu Dawud 2972<sup>7</sup>](#)

Narrated Umar ibn AbdulAziz:

Al-Mughirah (ibn Shu'bah) said: Umar ibn AbdulAziz gathered the family of Marwan when he was made caliph, and he said: Fadak belonged to the Messenger of Allah ﷺ, and he made contributions from it, showing repeated kindness to the poor of the Banu Hashim from it, and supplying from it the cost of marriage for those who were unmarried. **Fatimah asked him to give it to her, but he refused. That is how matters stood during the lifetime of the Messenger of Allah ﷺ till he passed on** (i.e. died).

When AbuBakr was made ruler he administered it as the Prophet ﷺ had done in his lifetime till he passed on. Then when Umar ibn al-Khattab was made ruler he administered it as they had done till he passed on. Then it was given to Marwan as a fief, and it afterwards came to Umar ibn AbdulAziz.

---

<sup>7</sup> The [chain](#) has fully strong narrators by Sunni standards- the hadith is weakened because it is mursal, not because of its isnad. Otherwise, all narrators are considered Sahih. [Umar b. Abdul Aziz](#), [al-Mughira ibn Shu'ba](#), [Jarir bin 'Abdul Hameed al-Razi](#). Therefore, the contradiction with this needs to be argued properly.

Umar ibn AbdulAziz said: I consider I have no right to something which the Messenger of Allah ﷺ refused to Fatimah, and I call you to witness that I have restored it to its former condition; meaning in the time of the Messenger of Allah ﷺ.

Abu Dawud said: When 'Umar b. 'Abd al-'Aziz was made caliph its revenue was forty thousand dinars, and when he died its revenue was four hundred dinars. Had he remained alive, it would have been less than it.

Comments: This Hadith holds that Bibi Fatima knew that Fadak did not belong to her since she asked about it. The following Hadith will show the problem if this accepted.

#### [Bukhari 6725](#)

Narrated `Aisha:

**Fatima and Al `Abbas came to Abu Bakr, seeking their share from the property of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) and at that time, they were asking for their land at Fadak and their share from Khaibar. Abu Bakr said to them, "I have heard from Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) saying, 'Our property cannot be inherited, and whatever we leave is to be spent in charity, but the family of Muhammad may take their provisions from this property.'" Abu Bakr added, "By Allah, I will not leave the procedure I saw Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) following during his lifetime concerning this property." **Therefore Fatima left Abu Bakr and did not speak to him till she died.****

#### [Bukhari 4240](#)

Narrated `Aisha:

Fatima the daughter of the Prophet (ﷺ) sent someone to Abu Bakr (when he was a caliph), asking for her inheritance of what Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) had left of the property bestowed on him by Allah from the Fai (ie booty gained without fighting) in Medina, and Fadak... **"So Abu Bakr refused to give anything of that to Fatima. So she became angry with Abu Bakr and kept away from him, and did not talk to him until she died. She remained alive for six months after the death of the Prophet. When she died, her husband `Ali, buried her at night without informing Abu Bakr and he said the funeral prayer by himself.**

#### [Muslim 1759](#)

It is narrated on the authority of Urwa b. Zubair who narrated from A'isha that she informed him that Fatima, daughter of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ), sent someone to Abu Bakr to demand from him her share of the legacy left by the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) from what Allah had bestowed upon him at Medina and Fadak and what was left from one-fifth of the income (annually received) from Khaibar. Abu Bakr said:

The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "We (prophets) do not have any heirs; what we leave behind is (to be given in) charity." The household of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) will live on the income from these properties, but, by Allah, I will not change the charity of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) from the condition in which it was in his own time. I will do the same with it as the Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him) himself used to do. So Abu Bakr refused to hand over anything from it to **Fatima who got angry with Abu Bakr for this reason. She forsook him and did not talk to him until the end of her life. She lived for six months after the death of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ). When she died, her husband, 'Ali b. Abu Talib, buried her at night. He did not inform Abu Bakr about her death and offered the funeral prayer over her himself.**

Comments: These Hadith show that Bibi Fatima had asked about Fadak from Abu Bakr. There are only two options here: either Bibi Fatima was ignorant of the inheritance or she knew about her inheritance. If she knew about her inheritance, either she knew Fadak was hers, or she knew it was not. If the Hadith of Abu Dawud is accepted, then it means Bibi Fatima is aware Fadak does not belong to her. If she is aware of this, then it means she is attempting to underhandedly take Fadak from her father. Even if this Hadith is rejected, it does not make sense that both Imam Ali and Bibi Fatima were unaware of their own father's inheritance, thus the argument that they were ignorant of the Prophet's will does not make sense. In fact, the [Prophet spoke with Bibi Fatima about his death](#), and even [mentioned his death at Ghadeer](#), and was in constant contact with his family. So how can it be possible that the Prophet left alone a matter as important as his own post-mortem will? Secondly, say for the sake of argument, Abu Bakr were truthful, then one must accept Bibi Fatima is angry for petty reasons since she would not accept the decision of her own father. One version even suggested that she [repeatedly insisted](#) on obtaining Fadak, which makes the aforementioned even more problematic. Even more severe is to accuse Bibi Fatima of having done the crime of [unlawfully shunning](#) a Muslim. If she did not talk to Abu Bakr after this, then she did not pay the oath of allegiance (this is evidenced by [Imam Ali paying it after her death](#)), thus [she died a death of jahiliyya](#) especially since she [separated from the main body of Muslims on this matter](#). The only way out of this bind, is to admit

wrongdoing on the part of Abu Bakr. This is certainly true, since [Umar himself admitted](#) the proceedings of Saqifa were evil; Bibi Fatima was only expressing her disappointment at the illegitimacy of Abu Bakr and his policy.

Such a result would be significant. If it is proven that Abu Bakr was incorrect- then his, Umar's and Aisha' authenticity is called into question. Abu Bakr is held in doubt for duplicity, and the latter two are held in doubt for implicit approval, and Aisha especially for putting the story favorably for herself. How then can they be considered as reliable narrators of Hadith?<sup>8</sup>

#### [Muslim 1757](#)

It is reported by Zuhri that this tradition was narrated to him by Malik b. Aus who said:

Umar b. al-Khattab sent for me and I came to him when the day had advanced. I found him in his house sitting on his bare bed-stead, reclining on a leather pillow. He said (to me): Malik, some people of your tribe have hastened to me (with a request for help). I have ordered a little money for them. Take it and distribute it among them. I said: I wish you had ordered somebody else to do this job. He said: Malik, take it (and do what you have been told). At this moment (his man-servant) Yarfa 'came in and said: Commander of the Faithful, what do you say about Uthman, Abd al-Rabman b. 'Auf, Zubair and Sa'd (who have come to seek an audience with you)? He said: Yes, and permitted them. so they entered. Then he (Yarfa ') came again and said: What do you say about 'Ali and Abbas (who are present at the door)? He said: Yes, and permitted them to enter. Abbas said: Commander of the Faithful, decide (the dispute) between me and this sinful, treacherous, dishonest liar. The people (who were present) also said: Yes. Commander of the Faithful, do decide (the dispute) and have mercy on them. Malik b. Aus said: I could well imagine that they had sent them in advance for this purpose (by 'Ali and Abbas). 'Umar said: Wait and be patient. I adjure you by Allah by Whose order the heavens and the earth are sustained, don't you know that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "We (prophets) do not have any heirs; what we leave behind is (to be given in) charity"? They said: Yes. Then he turned to Abbas and 'Ali and said: I adjure you both by Allah by Whose order the heavens and earth are sustained, Don't you know that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "We do not have any heirs; what we leave behind is (to be given in) charity"? They (too) said: Yes. (Then) Umar said: Allah, the Glorious and Exalted, had done to His Messenger (ﷺ) a special favor that He has not done to anyone else except him. He quoted the Qur'anic verse: "What Allah has bestowed upon His Apostle from (the properties) of the people of township is for Allah and His Messenger". The narrator said: I do not know whether he also recited the previous verse or not. Umar continued: The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) distributed among you the properties abandoned by Banu Nadir. By Allah, he never preferred himself over you and never appropriated anything to your exclusion. (After a fair distribution in this way) this property was left over. The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) would meet from its income his annual expenditure, and what remained would be deposited in the Bait-ul-Mal. (Continuing further) he said: I adjure you by Allah by Whose order the heavens and the earth are sustained. Do you know this? They said: Yes. Then he adjourned Abbas and 'All as he had adjourned the other persons and asked: Do you both know this? They said: Yes. He said: When the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) passed away, Abu Bakr said: "I am the successor of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ)." Both of you came to demand your shares from the property (left behind by the Messenger of Allah). (Referring to Hadrat 'Abbas), he said: You demanded your share from the property of your nephew, and he (referring to 'Ali) demanded a share on behalf of his wife from the property of her father. Abu Bakr (Allah be pleased with him) said: The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) had said: "We do not have any heirs; what we leave behind is (to be given in) charity." So both of you thought him to be a liar, sinful, treacherous and dishonest. And Allah knows that he was true, virtuous, well-guided and a follower of truth. When Abu Bakr passed away and (I have become) the successor of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and Abu Bakr (Allah be pleased with him), you thought me to be a liar, sinful, treacherous and dishonest. And Allah knows that I am true, virtuous, well-guided and a follower of truth. I became the guardian of this property. Then you as well as he came to me. Both of you have come and your purpose is identical. You said: Entrust the property to us. I said: If you wish that I should entrust it to you, It will be on the condition that both of you will undertake to abide by a pledge made with Allah that you will use it in the same way as the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) used it. So both of you got it. He said: Wasn't it like this? They said: Yes. He said: Then you have (again) come to me with the request that I should adjudge between you. No, by Allah. I will not give any

---

<sup>8</sup> [Ahmad b. Hanbal](#) was asked regarding the conflict between 'Ali and 'A'isha ~, and he replied, "Those are a people who have passed away. Theirs is what they earned, and yours is what you earn. And you will not be asked regarding what they did" (Qur'an 2:134)

Clearly this position is incorrect- if we are taking our Hadith from these people, we must know about them. If we simply assert their universal goodness and ignore the bad, then the argument that they are all good becomes circular since the appeal to their goodness comes from the hadith. If it is argued that the appeal to the universal goodness of the sahaba comes from the Quran, then the interpretation thereof must still come from hadith and history. Thus, the argument still remains circular if questioning of the actions of sahaba is not allowed. Therefore, one must not trivialize the actions of the sahaba if they would commit a transgression.

other judgment except this until the arrival of the Doomsday. If you are unable to hold the property on this condition, return it to me. I will not give any other judgment except this until the arrival of the Doomsday. If you are unable to hold the property on this condition, return it to me. I will not give any other judgment except this until the arrival of the Doomsday. If you are unable to hold the property on this condition, return it to me.

Comments: Same issue as the last segment. Does this Hadith mean that Imam Ali is attempting to underhandedly take Fadak? Here it is clearly important that Imam Ali considered Abu Bakr a sinful, treacherous liar. So again, we are left with having to decide who is more truthful and who would be more likely to know where the inheritance of the Prophet should go. Does it make more sense that family members should know about the inheritance of their father? Or does it make sense that unrelated men know more than the father's own children on that matter? Both Imam Ali and Bibi Fatima count as two witnesses against Abu Bakr and Umar here. To deny both of them as being truthful becomes problematic even for Sunnis

(Sunnis argue that we must take the whole Hadith when we argue with this. They point out that Abbas considered Imam Ali a liar. But, Abbas is also not in any way a masum, and he can certainly make such errors. Therefore, his opinion is not a hujjah on us- if Abbas considered Imam Ali a liar, it doesn't change our stance on this narration, since we believe Imam Ali was doing what was the most correct thing in this situation anyway.)

Who are the Ahlul Bayt (as)?

[Tirmidhi 4158](#)

Narrated Ibn 'Abbas:

that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "Love Allah for what He nourishes you with of His Blessings, love me due to the love of Allah, and love the people of my house due to love of me."

[Muslim 2404](#)

Amir b. Sa'd b. Abi Waqqas reported on the authority of his father that Muawiya b. Abi Sufyan appointed Sa'd as the Governor and said:

What prevents you from abusing Turab (Hadrat 'Ali), whereupon he said: It is because of three things which I remember Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) having said about him that I would not abuse him and even if I find one of those three things for me, it would be more dear to me than the red camels. I heard Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) say about 'Ali as he left him behind in one of his campaigns (that was Tabuk). 'Ali said to him: Allah's Messenger, you leave me behind along with women and children. Thereupon Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) said to him: **Aren't you satisfied with being unto me what Aaron was unto Moses but with this exception that there is no prophethood after me**<sup>9</sup>. And I (also) heard him say on the Day of Khaibar: I would certainly give this standard to a person who loves Allah and his Messenger, and Allah and his Messenger love him too. He (the narrator) said: We had been anxiously waiting for it, when he (the Holy Prophet) said: **Call 'Ali. He was called and his eyes were inflamed. He applied saliva to his eyes and handed over the standard to him**, and Allah gave him victory. (The third occasion is this) when the (following) verse was revealed: "**Let us summon our children and your children." Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) called 'Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husain and said: O Allah, they are my family.**

[Tirmidhi 2999](#)

Narrated 'Amir bin Sa'd bin Abi Waqqas:

from his father who said: "When this Ayah was revealed: 'Come, let us call our sons and your sons, our women and your women... (3:61)' the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) called '**Ali, Fatimah, Hasan and Husain and said: 'O Allah! This is my family.'**"

[Quran 3:61](#)

---

<sup>9</sup> [Kitāb al-Sunnah, by Ibn Abī 'Asim, Page 565, Hadith 1188:](#)

[Rasūl Allah said to 'Alī:](#)

["Your position for me, is like the position of Hārūn \[Aaron\] for Mūsā \[Moses\], except that there are no prophets after me, and you \(O' 'Alī!\) are my successor \[khalifati\] for every believer \[mu'meen\] after me \(my death\)."](#)

[Below: Its Isnād is hasan \(good\); its narrators are thaqāt \(trustworthy\), and they are \(some of\) the narrators of al-shaykhāin \(Bukhāri and Muslim\).](#)

Then whoever argues with you about it after [this] knowledge has come to you - say, "Come, let us call our sons and your sons, our women and your women, ourselves and yourselves, then supplicate earnestly [together] and invoke the curse of Allah upon the liars [among us]."

Comments: This narration shows that the family only includes the Ahle-Kisa, thus 33:33 does not include the wives

#### [Tirmidhi 4245](#)

Narrated Umm Salamah:

"The Prophet (ﷺ) put a garment over Al-Hasan, Al-Hussain, 'Ali and Fatimah, then he said: 'O Allah, these are the people of my house and the close ones, so remove the Rijs from them and purify them thoroughly.' So Umm Salamah said: 'And am I with them, O Messenger of Allah?' He said: "You are upon good."

#### [Tirmidhi 4156](#)

Narrated 'Umar bin Abi Salamah - the step-son of the Prophet (ﷺ):

"When these Ayat were revealed to the Prophet (ﷺ): 'Allah only wishes to remove the Rijs from you, O members of the family, and to purify you with a thorough purification ...' (33:33) in the home of Umm Salamah, he called for Fatimah, Hasan, Husain, and wrapped him in the cloak, then he said: 'O Allah! These are the people of my house, so remove the Rijs from them, and purify them with a thorough purification . ' So Umm Salamah said: 'And am I with them O Messenger of Allah?' He said: 'You are in your place, and you are more virtuous to me.'"

Comments: The wives are not part of the Ahlul Bayt. If they were, this Hadith couldn't exist. The last sentence of the second version is incorrectly added because there are other narrations establishing Bibi Fatima above Umm Salamah.

#### [Ibn Majah 126](#)

It was narrated that Sa`d bin Waqqas said:

"Mu`awiyah came on one of his pilgrimages and Sa`d entered upon him. **They mentioned `Ali, and Mu`awiyah criticized him.** Sa`d became angry and said: 'Are you saying this of a man of whom I heard the Messenger of Allah (Peace be upon him) say: "If I am a person's [Mawla], `Ali is also his [Mawla]."' And I heard him say: "You are to me like Harun was to Musa, except that there will be no Prophet after me." And I heard him say: "I will give the banner today to a man who loves Allah and His Messenger."

#### [Muslim 78](#)

Zirr reported:

'Ali observed: By Him Who split up the seed and created something living, the Apostle (may peace and blessings be upon him) gave me a promise that **no one but a believer would love me, and none but hypocrite would nurse grudge against me**<sup>10</sup>.

#### [Ibn Majah 117](#)

It was narrated that 'Abdur-Rahman bin Abu laila said:

"Abu Laila used to travel with 'Ali, and he used to wear summer clothes in winter and winter clothes in summer. He said: "The Messenger of Allah sent for me and my eyes were sore, on the Day of Khaibar. I said: 'O Messenger of Allah, my eyes are sore.' He put some spittle into my eyes, then he said: 'O Allah, take heat and cold away from him.' I never felt hot or cold again after that day. He (the Prophet) said: 'I will send a man who loves Allah and His Messenger, and whatever Allah and His Messenger love, and he is not one who flees from the battlefield.' The people craned their necks to see, and he sent for 'Ali and gave it (the banner) to him. "

#### [Tirmidhi 4077](#)

Narrated 'Imran bin Husain:

that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) dispatched an army and he put 'Ali bin Abi Talib in charge of it. He left on the expedition and he entered upon a female slave. So four of the Companions of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) scolded him, and they made a pact saying: "[If] we meet the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) we will inform him of what 'Ali did." When the

---

<sup>10</sup> Narrated al-A`izār bin Ḥurayth, from al-Nu`mān bin Bashīr, he said: When Abū Bakr wanted to get permission to enter to the Prophet, he heard A`isha shouting, saying: "By God, I've known that 'Ali is more beloved to you than my father and I!" and she repeated it two or three times. After Abū Bakr entered, he pounced at A`isha and said: "O daughter of fulana, do I hear you raising your voice over the Prophet?!" (Musnad Aḥmad bin Ḥanbal ḥadīth 18333 (ṣaḥīḥ))

Muslims returned from the journey, they would begin with the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and give him Salam, then they would go to their homes. So when the expedition arrived, they gave Salam to the Prophet (ﷺ), and one of the four stood saying: "O Messenger of Allah! Do you see that 'Ali bin Abi Talib did such and such." The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) turned away from him. Then the second one stood and said as he said, and he turned away from him. Then the third stood before him, and said as he said, and he turned away from him. Then the fourth stood and said as they had said. The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) faced him, and the anger was visible on his face, he said: **"What do you want from 'Ali?! What do you want from 'Ali?! Indeed 'Ali is from me, and I am from him, and he is the ally of every believer after me."**

#### [Tirmidhi 4078](#)

Narrated Abu Sariyah, or Zaid bin Arqam - Shu'bah had doubt:  
from the Prophet (ﷺ): **"For whomever I am his Mawla then 'Ali is his Mawla."**

#### [Ibn Majah 114](#)

It was narrated that 'Ali said:  
"The Unlettered Prophet informed me (saying) that **none but a believer would love me and none but a hypocrite would hate me.**"

#### [Adab Al Mufrad 1152](#)

Abu Hurayra said, "The Prophet, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, went out in the heat of the day. He did not speak to me nor did I speak to him until he came to the market of Qaynuqa'. He sat in the courtyard of Fatima's house and asked, 'Is the little one here? Is the little one here?' Fatima held her son back for a short time. I think that she was putting a necklace on him or washing him. Then he came running and he hugged him and kissed him. He said, 'O Allah, love him and love those who love him.'"

#### [Ibn Majah 125](#)

It was narrated that 'Abbad bin' Abdullah said:  
"Ali said: 'I am the slave of Allah and the brother of His Messenger. I am the greatest caller of the truth (Siddiq Akbar), and no one will say this after me except a liar. I prayed seven years before the people. "

Comments: Even though this hadith is weak in Ibn Majah, it is also narrated in Musnad Ahmad v.1, Tabari v.6, and Mustadrak v.3 (Keep in mind Mustadrak is a book that narrates by the standards of Bukhari and Muslim) from a different chains corroborating this narration in its exact wording.

#### [Bukhari 2699](#)

When the Prophet (ﷺ) intended to perform `Umra in the month of Dhul-Qadah, the people of Mecca did not let him enter Mecca till he settled the matter with them by promising to stay in it for three days only. When the document of treaty was written, the following was mentioned: 'These are the terms on which Muhammad, Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) agreed (to make peace).' They said, "We will not agree to this, for if we believed that you are Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) we would not prevent you, but you are Muhammad bin `Abdullah." The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "I am Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) and also Muhammad bin `Abdullah." Then he said to `Ali, "Rub off (the words) 'Allah's Messenger (ﷺ)' ", but `Ali said, "No, by Allah, I will never rub off your name." So, Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) took the document and wrote, "This is what Muhammad bin `Abdullah has agreed upon: No arms will be brought into Mecca except in their cases, and nobody from the people of Mecca will be allowed to go with him (i.e. the Prophet (ﷺ)) even if he wished to follow him and he (the Prophet (ﷺ)) will not prevent any of his companions from staying in Mecca if the latter wants to stay.' When the Prophet (ﷺ) entered Mecca and the time limit passed, the Meccans went to `Ali and said, "Tell your Friend (i.e. the Prophet (ﷺ)) to go out, as the period (agreed to) has passed." So, the Prophet (ﷺ) went out of Mecca. The daughter of Hamza ran after them (i.e. the Prophet (ﷺ) and his companions), calling, "O Uncle! O Uncle!" `Ali received her and led her by the hand and said to Fatima, "Take your uncle's daughter." Zaid and Ja`far quarreled about her. `Ali said, "I have more right to her as she is my uncle's daughter." Ja`far said, "She is my uncle's daughter, and her aunt is my wife." Zaid said, "She is my brother's daughter." The Prophet (ﷺ) judged that she should be given to her aunt, and said that the aunt was like the mother. He then said to 'Ali, **"You are from me and I am from you"**, and said to Ja`far, "You resemble me both in character and appearance", and said to Zaid, "You are our brother (in faith) and our freed slave."

Comments: These Hadith are praises of the Ahlul Bayt

#### [Muslim 2424](#)



'A'isha reported that Allah's Apostle (ﷺ) went out one morning wearing a striped cloak of the black camel's hair that there came Hasan b. 'Ali. He wrapped him under it, then came Husain and he wrapped him under it along with the other one (Hasan). Then came Fatima and he took her under it, then came 'Ali and he also took him under it and then said:

**Allah only desires to take away any uncleanness from you, O people of the household, and purify you (thorough purifying)**

[Tirmidhi 3511](#)

Narrated Anas bin Malik:

"For six months, the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) would pass by the door of Fatimah when going to the Fajr prayer saying: 'As-Salat O People of the house! Allah only wishes to remove the Rijs from you, O members of the family, and to purify you with thorough purification (33:33).'"

Comments: Again, these show 33:33 was revealed specifically for the Ahle Kisa

[Bukhari 3751](#)

Narrated Ibn 'Umar:

Abu Bakr used to say, "**Please Muhammad (i.e. the Prophet) by doing good to his family.**"

[Ibn Majah 145](#)

It was narrated that Zaid bin Arqam said:

**"The Messenger of Allah said to 'Ali, Fatimah, Hasan and Husain:' I am peace for those with what you make peace, and I am war for those with what you make war. ""<sup>11</sup>**

Comments: Further evidence of the Ahle Kisa being the reference of 33:33, as well as a denouncement of the enemies of them.

[Ibn Majah 118](#)

It was narrated that Ibn 'Umar said:

"The Messenger of Allah said: 'Hasan and Husain will be the leaders of the youth of Paradise, and their father is better than them.'"

[Ibn Majah 143](#)

It was narrated that Abu Hurairah said:

"The Messenger of Allah said: 'Who loves Hasan and Husain, loves me; and who hates them, hates me.'"

[Bukhari 3746](#)

Narrated Abu Bakra:

I heard the Prophet talking at the pulpit while Al-Hasan was sitting beside him, and he (i.e. the Prophet) was once looking at the people and at another time Al-Hasan, and saying, "This son of mine is a Saiyid (i.e. chief) and perhaps Allah will bring about an agreement between two sects of the Muslims through him."

[Muslim Book 1821](#)

It has been narrated on the authority of Jabir b. Samura who said:

I joined the company of the Prophet (ﷺ) with my father and I heard him say: **This Caliphate will not end until there have been twelve Caliphs among them.** The narrator said: Then he (the Holy Prophet) said something that I could not follow. I said to my father: What did he say? He said: He has said: All of them will be from the Quraish.

Comments: This tawatur narration shows the number 12 is not simply a concocted number by the Shias.

Addendum: Since a number of Sunni polemicists have attacked this narration, and claimed that it has nothing to do with the twelve Imams (as), I have written a response here.

---

<sup>11</sup> This is da'if, but the main idea is strengthened by narrations about [Bibi Fatima](#), [Imam Hasan](#), Imam Hussain, and [Imam Ali](#) individually saying the same idea.

#### [Ibn Majah 146](#)

It was narrated that 'Ali bin Abu Talib said:

"I was sitting with the Prophet, and 'Ammar bin Yasir asked permission to enter. The Prophet said: ' Let him in, welcome to the good and the purified. "'

Comments: This shows the status of the excellent Sahaba, Ammar b Yasir. [Albani](#) marks this Hadith as Sahih.

#### [Intercession](#)

#### [Bukhari 1010](#)

Narrated Anas: Whenever drought threatened them, 'Umar bin Al-Khattab, used to ask Al-Abbas bin 'Abdul Muttalib to invoke Allah for rain. He used to say, "O Allah! We used to ask our Prophet to invoke You for rain, and You would bless us with rain, and now we ask his uncle to invoke You for rain. O Allah ! Bless us with rain."(1) And so it would rain.

#### [Ibn Majah 1448](#)

It was narrated from 'Uthman bin Hunaif that a blind man came to the Prophet (ﷺ) and said:

"Pray to Allah to heal me." He said: "If you wish to store your reward for the Hereafter, that is better, or if you wish, I will supplicate for you." He said: "Supplicate." So he told him to perform ablution and do it well, and to pray two Rak'ah, and to say this supplication: "Allahumma inni as'aluka wa atawajjahu ilaika bimuhammadin nabiyyir-rahmah. Ya Muhammadu inni qad tawajjahtu bika ila rabbi fi hajati hadhihi lituqda. Allahumma fashaffi'hu fiya (O Allah, I ask of **You and I turn my face towards You by virtue of the intercession of Muhammad the Prophet of mercy.** O Muhammad, I have turned to my Lord by virtue of your intercession concerning this need of mine so that it may be met. O Allah, accept his intercession concerning me) ".

Comments: Requesting the Dua of a saint is not shirk. These two hadith sidestep the argument of "why not ask Allah directly?" since asking through a saint is permissible and, as can be seen in the following narrations, clearly commendable.

#### [Abu Dawud 5132](#)

Narrated Mu'awiyah:

Make intercession, you will be rewarded, for I purposely delay a matter so that you intercede and then you are rewarded. The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: If you make intercession, you will be rewarded.

#### [Abu Dawud 5131](#)

Abu Musa reported the Messenger of Allah (May peace be upon him) as saying:

Make intercession to me, you will be rewarded, for Allah decrees what he wishes **by the tongue of his prophet.**

Comments: Intercession is praiseworthy

#### [Tirmidhi 3430](#)

Narrated Abu Hurairah:

regarding Allah's saying: "It may be that your Lord will raise you to a praised station (17:79)" that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) was asked about it and he said: "It is the intercession."

Comments: Allah raises the status of someone through making them a means of intercession

#### [Bukhari 1370](#)

Narrated Ibn `Umar:

The Prophet (ﷺ) looked at the people of the well (the well in which the bodies of the pagans killed in the Battle of Badr were thrown) and said, "Have you found true what your Lord promised you?" Somebody said to him, "You are addressing dead people." He replied, "**You do not hear better than them but they cannot reply.**"

#### [Nasai 2075](#)

It was narrated that Anas said:

"During the night, the Muslims heard the Messenger of Allah standing and calling out at the well of badr; 'O Abu Jahl bin Hisham! O Shaaibh bin Rabiah! O' Utbah bin Rabiah! O Umayyah bin Khalaf! Have you found what your Lord promised to

be true? For I have found what my Lord promised me to be true. ' **They said: 'O Messenger of Allah, are you calling out to people who have turned into rotten corpses?'** He said: 'You do not hear what I say any better than they do, but they cannot answer.' "

#### [Muwatta al Malik 547](#)

Yahya related to me from Malik from Nafi that Abdullah ibn Umar, **when he prayed over the dead**, would say, "Peace be upon you" loud enough for whoever was near to him to hear.

#### [Bukhari 1338](#)

Narrated Anas:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "**When a human being is laid in his grave and his companions return and he even hears their foot steps**, two angels come to him and make him sit and ask him: What did you use to say about this man, Muhammad? He will say: I testify that he is Allah's slave and His Apostle. Then it will be said to him, 'Look at your place in the Hell-Fire. Allah has given you a place in Paradise instead of it. ' "The Prophet (ﷺ) added, " The dead person will see both his places. But a non-believer or a hypocrite will say to the angels, 'I do not know, but I used to say what the people used to say! It will be said to him, 'Neither did you know nor did you take the guidance (by reciting the Qur'an).' Then he will be hit with an iron hammer between his two ears,

Comments: The dead do hear our duas. Speaking and doing dua at graves is not shirk. Secondly, since asking intercession while someone is alive is not a violation of Tawhid, nor is it shirk, then the burden of proof is on the objector to show how asking the dead is shirk. It needs to be proven that there's any real, or significant difference between someone being dead or alive physically, or, if there is one, why it matters to the point where it becomes an act of shirk to address them in the same way as if they were alive. There is no evidence of this dichotomy making a difference.

#### [Abu Dawud 1047](#)

Narrated Aws ibn Aws:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said: Among the most excellent of your days is Friday; on it Adam was created, on it he died, on it the last trumpet will be blown, and on it the shout will be made, so invoke more blessings on me that day, for your blessings will be submitted to me. **The people asked: Messenger of Allah, how can it be that our blessings will be submitted to you while your body is decayed?** He replied: Allah, the Exalted, has prohibited the earth from consuming the bodies of Prophets.

#### [Riyadh As-Saliheen 1401](#)

Abu Hurairah (May Allah be pleased with him) reported:

The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said, "Do not make my grave a place of festivity, and supplicate Allah for me, for your supplication **reaches me wherever you are.**"

#### [Riyadh As-Saliheen 1402](#)

Abu Hurairah (May Allah be pleased with him) reported:

The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said, "Whenever someone greets me, Allah returns the soul to my body (in the grave) and I return his greeting."

Comments: Sending salawat reaches the Prophet even after his death, from any location. Hence performing tawassul even from away from gravesites is permissible.

#### [Nasai 1296](#)

It was narrated from Abu Hurairah that:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said: "Whoever sends salah upon me once, Allah (SWT) will send salah upon him tenfold."

Comments: Even sending prayers upon the Prophet (i.e. the reward therein) is permissible

#### [Riyadh As-Saliheen 1:444](#)

Abu Sa'id Al-Khudri (May Allah be pleased with him) reported:

Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said, "When a dead body is placed on a bier and men carry it on their shoulders, if the deceased was pious, it (**the corpse**) will say: 'Take me in haste'; but if he was not, it will say (to its bearers): 'Woe to it. Where are you taking it?' Everything except man hears its voice. Had a human being heard its voice, he would have surely died. "

Comments: Dead people can even speak

#### [Shama'il Muhammadiyah 2:15](#)

Saa-ib bin Yazid (Radiallahu anhu) said:

"My (maternal) aunt took me to the Holy Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) and said to him, this nephew of mine is ill. Rasulullah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) wiped his holy hand over my head and made barakah for me. (According to some Ulama, Rasulullah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) wiped his hand over his head, meaning that Sayyidina Saa-ib bin Yazid (Radiallahu anhu) had a pain in the head. The opinion of this weak and humble servant is that it is better if this is taken to mean that the Holy Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) wiped his hands in kindness on the head of Sayyidina Saa-ib bin Yazid (Radiallahu anhu). Sayyidina Saa-ib bin Yazid (Radiallahu anhu) was born in the second year Hijri, and at the time of the Holy Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam)'s death, his age was not more than 8 or 9 years. That is why the Holy Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) wiped his Holy hand in kindness, as is the custom of the great personalities. The Holy Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) also gave him the water of wudu to drink as a cure, as will be stated further, or he may have prescribed another remedy, especially when we learn also in a narration in Bukhari that he Sayyidina Saa-ib bin Yazid (Radiallahu anhu) was suffering from pain in his leg). When the Holy Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) performed Wudu, I drank the water of that wudu. (The Holy Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) may have performed wudu for some reason, but here it is clear that the **Holy Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) performed wudu so that the water could be used as a remedy and medicine**). I saw the seal of Prophethood, which was like the knot on a mosquito net or bedstead." (Which is the size of a pigeon's egg in roundness). The Ulama differ in the translation of this word. Some have translated it in another manner. Imam Nawawi, the famous commentator of Sahih Muslim, preferred the translation I have chosen).

#### [Quran 12:93](#)

""Take this, my shirt, and cast it over the face of my father; he will become seeing. And bring me your family, all together.""

#### [Abu Dawud 3895](#)

'A'ishah said:

When a man complained of pain the Prophet (ﷺ) said to him **pointing to his saliva** and mixing it with dust: (This is) the dust of our earth, mixed with saliva of us, so that our sick is remedied with the permission of our lord.

#### [Bukhari 3009](#)

Narrated Sahl:

On the day (of the battle) of Khaibar the Prophet (ﷺ) said, "Tomorrow I will give the flag to somebody who will be given victory (by Allah) and who loves Allah and His Apostle and is loved by Allah and His Apostle . " So, the people wondered all that night as to who would receive the flag and in the morning everyone hoped that he would be that person. Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) asked, "Where is `Ali? " He was told that `Ali was suffering from eye-trouble, so he applied saliva to his eyes and invoked Allah to cure him. He at once got cured as if he had no ailment. The Prophet (ﷺ) gave him the flag. `Ali said, "Should I fight them till they become like us (ie Muslim)? " The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "Go to them patiently and calmly till you enter the land. Then, invite them to Islam

Comments: It is neither supernatural nor shirk to seek help from the objects associated with saints and holy people.

#### [Turbah](#)

#### [Bukhari 379](#)

Narrates 'Abdullah bin Shaddad:

Maimuna said, "Allah's Apostle was praying while I was in my menses, sitting beside him and sometimes his clothes would touch me during his prostration." Maimuna added, "He prayed on a Khumra (a small mat sufficient just for the face and the hands while prostrating during prayers).

[Bukhari 836](#)

Narrated Abu Said Al-Khudri:

I saw Allah's Apostle prostrating in mud and water and saw the mark of mud on his forehead.

[Tirmidhi 381](#)

Umm Salamah narrated:

"The Prophet (S) saw a boy of ours - called Aflah - blowing when he prostrated. So he said: 'O Aflah! Put your face in the dirt.'"

Comments: Prostration on mud/dirt is not bid'ah.<sup>12</sup>

Wahhabis

[Ibn Majah 168](#)

It was narrated that 'Abdullah bin Mas'ud said:

"The Messenger of Allah said: 'At the end of time there will appear a people with new teeth (ie, young in age), with foolish minds. They will speak the best words ever uttered by mankind and they will recite the Qur'an, but it will not go any deeper than their collarbones. They will pass through Islam like an arrow passes through its target. Whoever meets them, let him kill them, for killing them will bring a reward from Allah for those who kill them. "

[Ibn Majah 173](#)

It was narrated that Ibn Awfa said:

"The Messenger of Allah said: 'The Khawarij are the dogs of Hell.'"

[Ibn Majah 174](#)

It was narrated from Ibn 'Umar that:

The Messenger of Allah said: "There will emerge people who will recite the Qur'an but it will not go any deeper than their collarbones. Whenever a group of them appears, they should be cut off (ie killed)." Ibn 'Umar said: "I heard the Messenger of Allah say: '**Whenever a group of them appears, they should be killed '- (he said it) more than twenty times- ' until Dajjal emerges among them. '**"

[Bukhari 3753](#)

Narrated Ibn Abi Nu'm:

A person asked 'Abdullah bin 'Umar whether a Muslim could kill flies. I heard him saying (in reply). "**The people of Iraq are asking about the killing of flies while they themselves murdered the son of the daughter of Allah's Apostle**"<sup>13</sup>. The Prophet said, They (i.e. Hasan and Husain) are my two sweet basils in this world."

Comments: Always be suspicious of those Muslims who are obsessively concerned with the outward aspects of the religion and the mundane fiqh practices over the ethical and philosophical aspects. Wahhabism and Salafism has no other fruit than people like these.

Sahaba

[Bukhari 3764](#)

Narrated Ibn Abu Mulaika:

Muawiya offered one rak'a with prayer after the 'Isha prayer, and at that time a freed slave of Ibn 'Abbas was present. He (ie the slave) went to Ibn 'Abbas (and told him that Muawiya offered one rak'a with prayer). **Ibn 'Abbas said, " Leave him, for he was in the company of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ). "**

---

<sup>12</sup> Ighaathat ul-Lahfan fi Masaa'id Ash-Shaytaan: "[and the Prophet \(sawa\) never prayed on any rug, and no one gave him any rug to pray. And he did sujud on Earth, stones, or soil. "](#)

<sup>13</sup> "Brother is gelatin haram?" "Brother what is the penalty for looking at a girl on a bus by accident?"

Comments: It appears that the Salaf us Saliheen's opinion regarding the Sahaba has been that they are righteous and not to be questioned. To this day, this has remained the standard opinion.<sup>14</sup> If there is wrong among them, it is the case that they have become less upon the right, and not the case that they can ever enter into the realm of wrong.

#### [Quran 6:116](#)

And if you obey most of those upon the earth, they will mislead you from the way of Allah. They follow not except assumption, and they are not but falsifying

#### [Quran 36:7](#)

Already the word has come into effect upon most of them, so they do not believe.

Comments: The typical rhetoric is that most of the people were converted and all of them were righteous. Rather, the Quran says not to follow the path of the majority, and that truth is with the small minority. Moreover, it says *most* of the Quraish did not believe.

#### [Bukhari 7048](#)

Narrated Asma':

The Prophet said, "I will be at my Lake-Fount (Kauthar) waiting for whoever will come to me. Then some people will be taken away from me whereupon I will say, '**My followers!**' It will be said, '**You do not know they turned Apostates as renegades (deserted their religion).**'" (Ibn Abi Mulaika said, "Allah, we seek refuge with You from turning on our heels from the (Islamic) religion and from being put to trial").

#### [Bukhari 4625](#)

Narrated Ibn `Abbas:

Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) delivered a sermon and said, "O people! You will be gathered before Allah barefooted, naked and not circumcised." Then (quoting Qur'an) he said: - "As We began the first creation, We shall repeat it. A promise We have undertaken: Truly we shall do it .." (21.104) The Prophet (ﷺ) then said, "The first of the human beings to be dressed on the Day of Resurrection, will be Abraham. Lo! **Some men from my followers** will be brought and then (the angels) will drive them to the left side (Hell-Fire). 'O my Lord! (They are) **my companions!**' Then a reply will come (from Almighty), 'You do not know what they did after you.' I will say as the pious slave (the Prophet (ﷺ) Jesus) said: And I was a witness over them while I dwelt amongst them. You were the Watcher over them and You are a Witness to all things. ' (5.117) Then it will be said, "**These people have continued to be apostates since you left them.**"

#### [Bukhari 6587](#)

Narrated Abu Huraira:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "While I was sleeping, a group (of my followers were brought close to me), and when I recognized them, a man (an angel) came out from amongst (us) me and them, he said (to them), 'Come along.' I asked, 'Where?' He said, 'To the (Hell) Fire, by Allah' I asked, 'what is wrong with them' He said, 'They turned apostate as renegades after you left.' Then behold! (Another) group (of my followers) were brought close to me, and when I recognized them, a man (an angel) came out from (me and them) he said (to them); 'Come along.' I asked, 'Where?' He said, 'To the (Hell) Fire, by Allah.' I asked, 'What is wrong with them?' He said, 'They turned apostate as renegades after you left. So I did not see anyone of them escaping **except a few** who were like camels without a shepherd."

---

<sup>14</sup> [Abu Hanifa says](#): This means that the view of the Ahl al-Sunna wa 'l-Jama'a is to attest to the honor and integrity of all the Companions and to praise them just as Allah Most High and His Messenger have praised them. Whatever occurred between 'Ali and Mu'awiya proceeded from personal inference (ijtihad). This is stated in Ihya' 'Ulam ai-Din. It is related by 'Umar ~ that the Messenger of Allah .I; said, "Honor my Companions, for they are the best among you, followed by those after them, followed by those after them, after which untruth will appear" (Tirmidh~ "al-Fitan," 2091). This is from Al-Masabih

[Barbahari says](#): "From the Sunnah is clinging to the Jamaa'ah. Whoever desires other than the Jamaa'ah and departs from it then he has thrown off the yoke of Islaam from his neck and he is astray, leading others astray... So he who contradicts the Companions of Allaah's Messenger sallallahu alaihiwasallam in any of the affairs of the Religion, then he has fallen into disbelief."

Comments: These tawatur narrations should not be disregarded when discussing the Adalat of the Sahaba<sup>15</sup>.

#### [Tirmidhi 2193](#)

Ibn 'Abbas narrated that the Messenger of Allah(s.a.w) said:  
"Do not revert to disbelief after me, some of you striking the necks of others."

#### [Bukhari 7077](#)

Narrated Ibn `Umar:

I heard the Prophet (ﷺ) saying, "Do not revert to disbelief after me by striking (cutting) the necks of one another."

Comments: The Battle of Jamal, Siffin, and Nahrawan are the fulfillment of these prophecies. Excusing these as the products of Khawarij is an incoherent argument. Only Nahrawan can be said to have been perpetrated specifically by the Khawarij, whereas for Jamal and Siffin the evidence is inconclusive and only employed to save face<sup>16</sup>.

#### [Bukhari 3456](#)

Narrated Abu Sa`id:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "You will follow the wrong ways, of your predecessors so completely and literally that if they should go into the hole of a mastigure, you too will go there." We said, "O Allah's Messenger (ﷺ)! Do you mean the Jews and the Christians?" He replied, "Whom else?" (Meaning, of course, the Jews and the Christians.)

#### [Tirmidhi 2640](#)

Narrated Abu Hurairah:

that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "The Jews split into seventy-one sects, or seventy-two sects, and the Christians similarly, and my Ummah will split into seventy-three sects."

#### [Tirmidhi 2641](#)

Narrated 'Abdullah bin 'Amr:

that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "What befell the children of Isra'il will befall my Ummah, step by step, such that if there was one who had intercourse with his mother in the open, then there would be someone from my Ummah who would do that. Indeed the children of Isra'il split into seventy-two sects, and my Ummah will split into seventy-three sects. All of them are in the Fire Except one sect." He said: "And which is it O Messenger of Allah?" He said: "What I am upon and my Companions."

Comments: I included two versions of this Hadith. The second one is false, the first is certain. The second is false by virtue of the two Hadith above these two. Fighting and following the innovations of the Ahlul Kitab is not purity and stability, and therefore, the religion cannot be based on all of the Companions.

#### [Bukhari 4845](#)

Narrated Ibn Abi Mulaika:

The two righteous persons were about to be ruined. They were Abu Bakr and `Umar who raised their voices in the presence of the Prophet (ﷺ) when a mission from Bani Tamim came to him. One of the two recommended Al-Aqra 'bin Habeas, the brother of Bani Mujashi (to be their governor) while the other recommended somebody else. (Nafi`, the sub-narrator said, I do not remember his name). Abu Bakr said to `Umar, 'You wanted nothing but to oppose me!' `Umar said, 'I did not intend to oppose you.' Their voices grow loud in that argument, so Allah revealed: **'O you who believe! Raise not your voices above the voice of the Prophet. ' (49.2)** Ibn Az-Zubair said, "Since the revelation of this Verse, 'Umar used to speak in such a low tone that the Prophet (ﷺ) had to ask him to repeat his statements."

---

<sup>15</sup> "But it was not like this for Ali, for **a lot of the Sahaba and followers hated him and cursed him and fought him**" (1)(2)

<sup>16</sup> Here is a nuanced point. An objection Farid raises regarding the Battle of Jamal was that the sides were not clearly defined and neither was either army in appropriate control of its soldiers. These [Hadiths \(2\) \(3\)](#) show that there were defined sides to this fight. If there were not, then how could it be that Imam Ali is enlisting an army against Aisha? If this is the case, then there is a clear belligerent and a clear innocent party, since no battle is fought except in confusion or deliberately, and the former is not the case.

#### [Bukhari 4468](#)

Narrated Ibn `Umar:

**Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) appointed Usama bin Zaid as the commander of some people. Those people criticized his leadership.** The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "If you speak ill of his leadership, you have already spoken ill of his father's leadership before. By Allah, he deserved to be a Commander, and he was one of the most beloved persons to me and now this (ie Usama) is one of the most beloved persons to me after him.

#### [Bukhari 4469](#)

The dispatch of Usama bin Zaid by the Prophet (saws) during his fatal illness

Narrated `Abdullah bin `Umar:

**Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) sent troops appointed Usama bin Zaid as their commander. The people criticized his leadership.** Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) got up and said, "If you (people) are criticizing his (ie Usama's) leadership you used to criticize the leadership of his father before. By Allah, he (ie Zaid) deserved the leadership indeed, and he used to be one of the most beloved persons to me, and now this (ie his son, Usama) is one of the most beloved persons to me after him. "

Comments: These three Hadith of the Shaykhain show that they were admonished by the Quran and Prophet. The latter two are significant because of the closeness of this disobedience to the Prophet's death. Saqifa *could not* have taken place *had the Shaykhain obeyed the Prophet* and left with Usama. This is indefensible, since the reasoning the sahaba showed was not concern for the Prophet, but rather that they doubted the Prophet's choice and decision in making Usama the commander. So the Hadith of the Pen that followed cannot be said to be out of concern for the Prophet.

#### [Bukhari 7189](#)

Narrated Ibn `Umar:

The Prophet (ﷺ) sent (an army unit under the command of) Khalid bin Al-Walid to fight against the tribe of Bani Jadhima and those people could not express themselves by saying, "Aslamna," but they said, "Saba'na! Saba'na!" Khalid kept on killing some of them and taking some others as captives, and he gave a captive to everyone of us and ordered everyone of us to kill his captive. I said, "By Allah, I shall not kill my captive and none of my companions shall kill his captive!" Then we mentioned that to the Prophet (ﷺ) and he said, "**O Allah! I am free from what Khalid bin Al-Walid has done,**" and repeated it twice.

#### [Muslim 1757](#)

It is reported by Zuhri that this tradition was narrated to him by Malik b. Aus who said:

Umar b. al-Khattab sent for me and I came to him when the day had advanced. I found him in his house sitting on his bare bedstead, reclining on a leather pillow. He said (to me): Malik, some people of your tribe have hastened to me (with a request for help). I have ordered a little money for them. Take it and distribute it among them. I said: I wish you had ordered somebody else to do this job. He said: Malik, take it (and do what you have been told). At this moment (his man-servant) Yarfa' came in and said: Commander of the Faithful, what do you say about Uthman, Abd al-Rahman b. 'Auf, Zubair and Sa'd (who have come to seek an audience with you)? He said: Yes, and allowed them. so they entered. Then he (Yarfa' ) came again and said: What do you say about 'Ali and Abbas (who are present at the door)? He said: Yes, and allowed them to enter. Abbas said: Commander of the Faithful, **decide (the dispute) between me and this sinful, treacherous, dishonest liar.** The people (who were present) also said: Yes. Commander of the Faithful, do decide (the dispute) and have mercy on them. Malik b. Aus said: I could well imagine that they had sent them in advance for this purpose (by 'Ali and Abbas). 'Umar said: Wait and be patient. I adjure you by Allah by Whose order the heavens and the earth are sustained, do not you know that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "We (prophets) do not have any heirs; what we leave behind is (to be given in) charity"? They said: Yes. Then he turned to Abbas and 'Ali and said: I adjure you both by Allah by Whose order the heavens and earth are sustained, do not you know that the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: "We do not have any heirs; what we leave behind is (to be given in) charity)? They (too) said: Yes. (Then) Umar said: Allah, the Glorious and Exalted, had done to His Messenger (ﷺ) a special favor that he has not done to anyone else except him. He quoted the Qur'anic verse: "**What Allah has bestowed upon His Apostle from (the properties) of the people of township is for Allah and His Messenger**". The narrator said: I do not know whether he also recited the previous verse or not. Umar continued: The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) distrusted amongst you



the properties abandoned by Banu Nadir. By Allah, he never preferred himself over you and never accepted anything to your exclusion. (After a fair distribution in this way) this property was left over. The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) would meet from its income his annual expenditure, and what remained would be deposited in the Bait-ul-Mal. (Continuing further) he said: I adjure you by Allah by Whose order the heavens and the earth are sustained. Do you know this? They said: Yes. Then he adjured Abbas and 'All as he had adjured the other persons and asked: Do you both know this? They said: Yes. He said: When the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) passed away, Abu Bakr said: "I am the successor of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ)." Both of you came to demand your shares from the property (left behind by the Messenger of Allah). (Referring to Hadrat 'Abbas), he said: You demanded your share from the property of your nephew, and he (referring to 'Ali) demanded a share on behalf of his wife from the property of her father. Abu Bakr (Allah be pleased with him) said: The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) had said: "We do not have any heirs; what we leave behind is (to be given in) charity." **So both of you thought him to be a liar, sinful, treacherous and dishonest.** And Allah knows that he was true, virtuous, well-guided and a follower of truth. When Abu Bakr passed away and (I have become) the successor of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and Abu Bakr (Allah be pleased with him), **you thought me to be a liar, sinful, treacherous and dishonest.** And Allah knows that I am true, virtuous, well-guided and a follower of truth. I became the guardian of this property. Then you as well as he came to me. Both of you have come and your purpose is identical. You said: Entrust the property to us. I said: If you wish that I should entrust it to you, it will be on the condition that both of you will undertake to abide by a pledge made with Allah that you will use it in the same way as the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) used it. So both of you got it. He said: Was not it like this? They said: Yes. He said: Then you have (again) come to me with the request that I should adjudge between you. No, by Allah. I will not give any other judgment except this until the arrival of the Doomsday. If you are unable to hold the property on this condition, return it to me. I will not give any other judgment except this until the arrival of the Doomsday. If you are unable to hold the property on this condition, return it to me. I will not give any other judgment except this until the arrival of the Doomsday. If you are unable to hold the property on this condition, return it to me.

Comments: The Sahaba clearly had arguments.

#### [Bukhari 530](#)

Narrated Az-Zuhri that he visited Anas bin Malik at Damascus and found him weeping and asked him why he was weeping. He replied, "I do not know anything which I used to know during the life-time of Allah's Apostle except this prayer which is being lost (not offered as it should be)."

Comments: Apparently the Sunnah is not preserved by the Ummah properly by the Sahaba

#### [Umayyad Political Play](#)

#### [Bukhari 711](#)

Narrated Nafi`:

When the people of Medina dethroned Yazid bin Muawiya, Ibn `Umar gathered his special friends and children and said, "I heard the Prophet (ﷺ) saying, 'A flag will be fixed for every betrayer on the Day of Resurrection,' and we have given the oath of allegiance to this person (Yazid) in accordance with the conditions enjoined by Allah and His Apostle and **I do not know of anything more faithless than fighting a person who has been given the oath of allegiance** in accordance with the conditions enjoined by Allah and His Apostle, and if ever I learn that any person among you has **agreed to dethrone Yazid**, by giving the oath of allegiance (to somebody else) then there will be separation between him and me. "

#### [Tirmidhi 3842](#)

Narrated 'Abdur-Rahman bin Abu 'Umairah - and he was one of the Companions of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ):

from the Prophet (ﷺ), that he said to **Mu'awiyah**: "O Allah, make him a guiding one, and guide (others) by him."

#### [Muslim 1847](#)

It has been narrated through a different chain of transmitters, on the authority of Hudhaifa b. al-Yaman who said: Messenger of Allah, no doubt, we had an evil time (i. e. the days of Jahiliyya or ignorance) and God brought us a good time (i. e. Islamic period) through which we are now living Will there be a bad time after this good time? He (the Holy Prophet) said: Yes. I said: Will there be a good time after this bad time? He said: Yes. I said: Will there be a bad time after good time? He said: Yes. I said: How? Whereupon he said: **There will be leaders who will not be led by my guidance**

**and who will not adopt my ways? There will be among them men who will have the hearts of devils in the bodies of human beings. I said: What should I do. Messenger of Allah, if I (happen) to live in that time? He replied: You will listen to the Amir and carry out his orders; even if your back is flogged and your wealth is snatched, you should listen and obey.**

[Riyadh As-Saliheen 1:330](#)

Abu Abdullah 'Amr bin Al-'as (May Allah be pleased with them) said:

I heard Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) saying openly not secretly, "**The family of so-and-so (ie, Abu Talib) are not my supporters.** kinship (Rahm) with whom I will maintain good the ties of kinship "

[Abu Dawud 5132](#)

Narrated Mu'awiyah:

Make intercession, you will be rewarded, for I purposely delay a matter so that you intercede and then you are rewarded. The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said: If you make intercession, you will be rewarded.

[Bukhari 612](#)

Narrated `Isa bin Talha:

That he had heard **Muawiya** repeating the words of Adhan up to "Wa ash-hadu anna Muhammadan rasulul-lah (and I testify that Muhammad is Allah's Messenger (ﷺ).)"

[Bukhari 3641](#)

Narrated **Muawiya**:

I heard the Prophet (ﷺ) saying, "A group of people amongst my followers will remain obedient to Allah's orders and they will not be harmed by anyone who will not help them or who will oppose them, till Allah's Order (the Last Day) comes upon them while they are still on the right path. "

Comments: Nasb and Umayyad propaganda have found their ways into the books of the Sahiheen. Muawiya is an indefensible character yet he is *repeatedly* used as a narrator of hadith within the two most authentic Sunni books.

[Muslim 2603](#)

Anas b. Malik reported that there was an orphan girl with Umm Sulaim (who was the mother of Anas). Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) saw that orphan girl and said:

O, it is you; you have grown young. May you not advance in years! That slave-girl returned to Umm Sulaim weeping. Umm Sulaim said: O daughter, what is the matter with you? She said: Allah's Apostle (ﷺ) has invoked curse upon me that I should not grow in age and thus I would never grow in age, or she said, in my (length) of life. Umm Sulaim went out wrapping her head-dress hurriedly until she met Allah's Messenger (ﷺ). He said to her: Umm Sulaim, what is the matter with you? She said: Allah's Apostle, you invoked curse upon my orphan girl. He said: Umm Sulaim, what is that? She said: She (the orphan girl) states you have cursed her saying that she might not grow in age or grow in life. Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) smiled and then said: Umm Sulaim, don't you know that I have made this term with my Lord...

(Continued in H. 6296) Jabir b. Abdullah reported Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) as saying:

I am a human being and I have made this term with my Lord, the Exalted and Glorious: For any servant amongst Muslims whom I curse or scold, make that a source of purity and reward. This hadith has been narrated on the authority of Ibn Juraj with the same chain of transmitters.

[Muslim 2604](#)

Ibn Abbas reported:

I was playing with children that Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) happened to pass by (us). I hid myself behind the door. He (the Prophet) came and patted my shoulders and said: Go and call Mu'awiya. I returned and said: He is busy in taking food. He again asked me to go and call Mu'awiya to him. I went (and came back) and said that he was busy in taking food, whereupon he said: May Allah not fill his belly! Ibn Muthanna, said: I asked Umm Umayya what he meant by the word Hatani. He said: It means "he patted my shoulders.

Comments: These hadith were found in the chapter called: “**Whomever Is Cursed, Reviled Or Prayed Against By The Prophet (SAW) When He Does Not Deserve That, It Will Be Purification, Reward And Mercy For Him**”. This proves Muslim had positive views of Muawiya, or else he would not attempt to Ta'wil this hadith by placing it in this chapter. This means that the Sahih Al-Sittah hadith corpus is going to reflect these pro-Umayyad views. Since ultimately, Muslim is a human being (and thus by nature biased), they will be more prone to accepting hadith that align with their world views and rejecting ones that do not. Since they defend Muawiya, we can discern a lot of information about the status of the corpus as a whole<sup>17</sup>.

#### Tahrif

##### [Ibn Majah 1944](#)

It was narrated that 'Aishah said:

"The Verse of stoning and of breastfeeding an adult ten times was revealed 1 , and the paper was with me under my pillow. When the Messenger of Allah died, we were preoccupied with his death, and a tame sheep came in and ate it. "

1 : These verses were abrogated in recitation but not ruling. Other ahadith establish the number for fosterage to be 5.

##### [Muslim 1452](#)

'A'isha (Allah be pleased with, her) reported that it had been revealed in the Holy Qur'an that ten clear sucklings make the marriage unlawful, then it was abrogated (and substituted) by five sucklings and Allah's Apostle (ﷺ) died and it was before that time (found) in the Holy Qur'an (and recited by the Muslims).

##### [Bukhari 6830](#)

“Allah sent Muhammad with the Truth and revealed the Holy Book to him, and among what Allah revealed, was the Verse of the Rajam (the stoning of married person (male & female) who commits illegal sexual intercourse, and we did recite this Verse and understood and memorized it. Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) did carry out the punishment of stoning and so did we after him. I am afraid that after a long time has passed, somebody will say, 'By Allah, we do not find the Verse of the Rajam in Allah's Book,' and thus they will go astray by leaving an obligation which Allah has revealed. And the punishment of the Rajam is to be inflicted to any married person (male & female), who commits illegal sexual intercourse, if the required evidence is available or there is conception or confession. And then we used to recite among the Verses in Allah's Book”

Comments: These are ridiculous Hadith, all of which are deemed Sahih.

#### Muawiya

##### [Nasai 3009](#)<sup>18</sup>

It was narrated that Saeed bin Jubair said:

"I was with Ibn Abbas in Arafat and he said: 'Why do I not hear the people reciting Talbiyah?' I said: They are afraid of Muawiyah.' So Ibn Abbas went out of his tent and said: "Labbaik Allahumma Labbaik, Labbaik! **They are only forsaking the Sunnah out of hatred for Ali.**"<sup>19</sup>"

---

<sup>17</sup> One case to consider is whether it is appropriate to add Imam Ali when serially listing who is the best sahaba. Many Hadith [\(1\)](#) [\(2\)](#) [\(3\)](#) [\(4\)](#) [\(5\)](#) ... include Abu Bakr and Umar and Uthman without including Imam Ali. Oddly enough, Sahih Muslim [includes Imam Ali](#) but not the Bukhari version. This isn't the first instance of Bukhari neutering Hadith however. This example in particular makes you question the framework and ideas Bukhari was working with that he had to cut out this portion of the Hadith. In any case, the exclusion of Imam Ali seems to be the opinion of many major scholars including Ahmad b Hanbal. Someone can bring up the objection that Imam Ali is mentioned in some Hadith as well (such as the one in Sahih Muslim), but this is an insolvent claim. The Hadith [\(2\)](#) clearly states "we used to say." Either Bukhari has excised the Hadith or Ibn 'Umar is getting his Hadith wrong. Neither case is good, but, the neglect of Imam Ali has always been the case in this corpus.

<sup>18</sup> Albani considers this [Sahih](#)

<sup>19</sup> "And it is known that Allah made love for the Sahaba in the Muslims, especially for the Khulafa', may Allah be pleased with them, especially for Abu Bakr and Omar, for the general Sahaba and followers love them, and they were the best of centuries. But it was not like this for Ali, for a lot of the Sahaba and followers hated him and cursed him and fought him. And Abu Bakr and Umar, may Allah be pleased with them, were cursed and insulted by the Rafidha and the Nasiria and the Ghalia and the Ismailis, but it is known those who loved them are better and greater, and the ones who hated them are further from Islam and less, the opposite of Ali, for the ones who hated him and cursed him are better than the ones who hated and cursed Abu Bakr and Umar, yes, the Shia of Uthman who loved him and hated Ali, even if they were oppressive innovators, for the Shia of Ali who love him and hate Uthman are more deficient than them (the Shia of Uthman) in Deen,

#### [Muslim 2404](#)

Amir b. Sa'd b. Abi Waqqas reported on the authority of his father that Muawiya b. Abi Sufyan appointed Sa'd as the Governor and said:

**What prevents you from abusing Abu Turab (Hadrat 'Ali)[?]**

#### [Ibn Majah 120](#)

It was narrated that Sa'd bin Waqqas said:

"Mu'awiyah came on one of his pilgrimages and Sa'd entered upon him. **They mentioned `Ali, and Mu`awiyah criticized him.**

#### [Ibn Majah 114](#)

It was narrated that 'Ali said:

"The Unlettered Prophet informed me (saying) that **none but a believer would love me and none but a hypocrite would hate me.**"

Comments: Muawiya was a Sahaba yet he clearly had quarrels with and disliked Imam Ali. Umayyad propaganda is especially clear in the hadith from Nasai.

#### [Imam Mahdi \(atfs, as\)](#)

#### [Abu Dawud 4284](#)

Narrated Umm Salamah, Ummul Mu'minin:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said: **The Mahdi will be of my family, of the descendants of Fatimah.** Abdullah ibn Ja'far said: I heard AbulMalih praising Ali ibn Nufayl and describing his good qualities.

#### [Ibn Majah 4086](#)

It was narrated that Sa'eed bin Musayyab said:

"We were with Umm Salamah and we were discussing Mahdi. She said: 'I heard the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) say:" **Mahdi will be one of the descendents of Fatimah.** "

#### [Abu Dawud 4282](#)

Narrated Abdullah ibn Mas'ud:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said: If only one day of this world remained. Allah would lengthen that day (according to the version of Za'idah), till He raised up in it a man who belongs to me or to my family whose father's name is the same as my father's, who will fill the earth with equity and justice as it has been filled with oppression and tyranny (according to the version of Fitr). Sufyan's version says: The world will not pass away before the Arabs are ruled by a man of my family whose name will be the same as mine.

Abu Dawud said: The version of 'Umar and Abu Bakr is the same as that of Sufyan.

#### [Abu Dawud 4283](#)

Narrated Ali ibn AbuTalib:

The Prophet (ﷺ) said: **If only one day of this time (world) remained, Allah would raise up a man from my family who would fill this earth with justice as it has been filled with oppression.**

#### [Muslim 1821](#)

It has been narrated on the authority of Jabir b. Samura who said:

---

and greater than them in ignorance and oppression. So it has become known that love for the three is greater. And if it is said that Ali has been chosen and it is a holy and prophetic. Say: You have don't takfir of all the Kharijites, and have hated the Marwaniyah. These people are better than the Rafidha who insult Abu Bakr and Umar, may Allah be pleased with them, and better than the Ghalia"

[Minhaj As Sunnah Vol. 7 \(2\)](#)

I joined the company of the Prophet (ﷺ) with my father and I heard him say: **This Caliphate will not end until there have been twelve Caliphs among them.** The narrator said: Then he (the Holy Prophet) said something that I could not follow. I said to my father: What did he say? He said: He has said: All of them will be from the Quraish.

#### [Jaami al-Sagheer 5796](#)

"The mutawaatir reports from the Prophet (Peace & Blessings of Allaah be upon Him) describing the Mahdi are very many. They state that the Mahdi will be of his family, that he will rule for seven years, that he will fill the earth with justice, that Eesaa ibn Maryam will emerge and help him to kill the Dajjal, and that he will lead this ummah in prayer and 'Isa will pray behind him."

Al-Albaani said it is sahih

Al-Allaamah al-Mujtahid al-Shawkaani said: "The ahaadeeth that we have come across that speak of the awaited Mahdi reach the level of tawaatur, including fifty saheeh, hasan and daeef munjabar ahaadeeth. There are mutawaatir without a doubt; indeed they are more mutawaatir than others, according to all the standards of usool. There are also many reports from the Sahaabah that speak about the Mahdi and that reach the level of marfoo, so there is no room for individual opinions in such an issue."

#### Mutah

#### [Muwatta Al Malik 1137](#)

Yahya related to me from Malik from Ibn Shihab from Urwa ibn az- Zubayr that Khawla ibn Hakim came to Umar ibn al-Khattab and said, " Rabia ibn Umayya made a temporary marriage with a woman and she is pregnant by him. " Umar ibn al-Khattab went out in dismay dragging his cloak, saying, "**This temporary marriage, had I come across it, I would have ordered stoning and done away with it!**"

#### [Muslim 1405](#)

Abu Nadra reported:

While I was in the company of Jabir b. Abdullah, a person came to him and said that **Ibn 'Abbas and Ibn Zubair** differed on the two types of Mut'as (Tamattu' of Hajj 1846 and Tamattu 'with women), whereupon Jabir said: We used to do these two during the lifetime of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ). Umar then forbade us to do them, and **so we did not revert to them.**

#### [Muslim 1406k](#)

Allah has made blind the hearts of some people as He has deprived them of eyesight that they give religious verdict in favour of temporary marriage, while he was alluding to a person (Ibn 'Abbas). **Ibn Abbas called him and said: You are an uncouth person, devoid of sense. By my life, Mut'a was practised during the lifetime of the leader of the pious** (he meant Allah's Messenger, may peace be upon him), and Ibn Zubair said to him: just do it yourselves, and by Allah, if you do that I will stone you with your stones. Ibn Shihab said. Khalid b. Muhajir b. Saifullah informed me: While I was sitting in the company of a person, a person came to him and he asked for a religious verdict about Mut'a and he permitted him to do it. Ibn Abu 'Amrah al-Ansari (Allah be pleased with him) said to him: Be gentle. It was permitted in- the early days of Islam, (for one) who was driven to it under the stress of necessity just as (the eating of) carrion and the blood and flesh of swine and then Allah intensified (the commands of) His religion and prohibited it (altogether). Ibn Shihab reported: Rabi' b. Sabra told me that his father (Sabra) said: I contracted temporary marriage with a woman of Banu 'Amir for two cloaks during the lifetime of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ); then he forbade us to do Mut'a. Ibn Shihab said: I heard Rabi' b. Sabra narrating it to Umar b. 'Abd al-'Aziz and I was sitting there.

#### [Muslim 1224c](#)

Abu Dharr (Allah be pleased with him) said:

Two are the Mut'as which were not permissible **but only for us**, ie temporary marriage with women and Tamattu 'in Hajj.

#### [Muslim 1405d](#)

We contracted temporary marriage giving a handful of (tales or flour as a dower during the lifetime of Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) **and during the time of Abu Bakr** until 'Umar forbade it in the case of 'Amr b. Huraith.

#### [Bukhari 4518](#)

Narrated `Imran bin Husain:

The Verse of [mutah]<sup>20</sup> was revealed in Allah's Book, so we performed it with Allah's Messenger (ﷺ), and nothing was revealed in Qur'an to make it illegal, nor did the Prophet (ﷺ) prohibit it till he died . But the man (who regarded it illegal) just expressed what his own mind suggested.

#### [Bukhari 5117](#)

Narrated Jabir bin `Abdullah and Salama bin Al-Akwa`:

While we were in an army, Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) came to us and said, "You have been allowed to do the Mut'a (marriage), so do it."

Comments: The Shia narrative suggests `Umar himself forbade mutah (the Hadith from Imran bin Hussain suggests that maybe even some sahaba thought this as well) and that it is still legal. In any case, to ridicule mutah would be a mistake, as it would be ridiculing the laws of Allah (and according to Imran bin Hussain- even ridiculing a verse of the Quran), even if they were allegedly abrogated. However the H. 1405 is very interesting, since it implies that Ibn Abbas and Ibn Zubair (two very prominent companions) used to consider mutah permissible all the way until Umar forbade it. Abu Dharr's hadith implies that he had not considered it prohibited, but only for the generations following. So the issue is not as clear cut as some Sunnis may paint it out to be in their own books.

#### [An Odd Objection](#)

##### [Muwatta Al Malik 55](#)

Yahya related to me from Malik from Abu Nuaym Wahb ibn Kaysan that he heard Jabir ibn Abdullah al-Ansari saying, "I saw Abu Bakr as- Siddiq eat meat and then pray without doing wudu."

Comments: One of the odd objections is that Shias consider the actions of the Holy *A'imma* to be hadith in themselves. In reality, this is done by Sunnis as well. This cannot be an objection to the argument that Shias consider extra-Prophetic sources, since the Shia believe that the A'imma only act in accordance with the Prophetic Sunnah<sup>21</sup>

Abu Dawud 3527

Narrated Umar ibn al-Khattab:

reported the Prophet (ﷺ) as saying: **There are people from the servants of Allah who are neither prophets nor martyrs; the prophets and martyrs will envy them on the Day of Resurrection for their rank from Allah, the Most High.**

They (the people) asked: Tell us, Messenger of Allah, who are they? He replied: They are people who love one another for the spirit of Allah (i.e. the Qur'an), without having any mutual kinship and giving property to one. I swear by Allah, their faces will glow and they will be (sitting) in (pulpits of) light. They will have no fear (on the Day) when the people will have fear, and they will not grieve when the people will grieve.

He then recited the following Qur'anic verse: "Behold! Verily for the friends of Allah there is no fear, nor shall they grieve."

##### [Tafsir Al Ayyashi](#)

'Amir-ul-Momineen said: 'Indeed! The friends of Allah, there would neither be fear upon them nor would they be grieving [10:62]'. Then he said: 'Do you all know who the friends of Allah are?' They said, 'Who are they, O Amir-Al-Momineen?' So he said: '**They are us, and the ones who follow us. So the ones who follow us from after us** (Shias to be born later) beatitude is for us all and beatitude is for them, and their beatitude is higher than our beatitude'.

---

<sup>20</sup> See the Arabic. Why they changed the translation to "Hajj Al Tamattu" is beyond dishonest- the Arabic very explicitly and clearly says mutah.

<sup>21</sup> "Once we heard abu `AbdAllah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, saying, 'My Hadith is the Hadith of my father. The Hadith of my father is the Hadith of my grandfather. The Hadith of my grandfather is the Hadith of Imam Husayn. The Hadith of Imam al-Husayn is the Hadith of Imam al- Hassan. The Hadith of Imam al-Hassan is the Hadith of Imam Ali, recipient of divine supreme covenant. The Hadith of Imam Ali is the Hadith of the Holy Prophet, recipient of divine supreme covenant. The Hadith of the Holy Prophet is the words of Allah, the Majestic, the Glorious.'" (Al-Kafi v. 1)

Comments: One thing that is commonly objected is, how can it be possible for the A'imma to reach a rank higher than Prophets? We do not need to ask how, since this Hadith tells us, as a matter of fact, there are people who will be higher. It is also important to note that this verse is in the tafsir of the Ahlul Bayt, as referring to the Ahlul Bayt.

### Taqiyyah

#### [Bukhari 6930](#)

Narrated `Ali:

Whenever I tell you a narration from Allah's Messenger (ﷺ), by Allah, I would rather fall down from the sky than ascribe a false statement to him, but if I tell you something between me and you (not a Hadith) then it was indeed a trick (i.e., I may say things just to cheat my enemy). No doubt I heard Allah's Apostle saying, "During the last days there will appear some young foolish people who will say the best words but their faith will not go beyond their throats (i.e. they will have no faith) and will go out from (leave) their religion as an arrow goes out of the game. So, where-ever you find them, kill them, for who-ever kills them shall have reward on the Day of Resurrection."

Comments: This is quite literally, Imam Ali's self admission of using taqiyyah. So if he was forced to give allegiance, it could have happened out of taqiyyah (to preserve the greater good of the unity of the weakened ummah after the Prophet's demise), and there would be no problem.