West Asian sources of the Eurasian component in Ethiopians: a reassessment

Ludovica Molinaro^{1*}, Francesco Montinaro¹, Toomas Kivisild^{1,2}, Luca Pagani^{1,3*}

¹Estonian Biocentre, Institute of Genomics, University of Tartu, Estonia ²Department of Human Genetics, KU Leuven, Leuven, Belgium ³Department of Biology, University of Padova, Italy

*To whom correspondence may be addressed: lu.molinaro8@gmail.com; lp.lucapagani@gmail.com

Summary

Previous genome-scale studies of populations living today in Ethiopia have found evidence of 1 recent gene flow from an Eurasian source, dating to the last 3,000 years^{1,2,3,4}. Haplotype¹ 2 and genotype data based analyses of $modern^{2,4}$ and ancient data $(aDNA)^{3,5}$ have considered Sardinia-like proxy², broadly Levantine^{1,4} or Neolithic Levantine³ populations as a range of possible sources for this gene flow. Given the ancient nature of this gene flow and the extent 5 of population movements and replacements that affected West Asia in the last 3000 years, 6 aDNA evidence would seem as the best proxy for determining the putative population source. We demonstrate, however, that the deeply divergent, autochthonous African component which 8 accounts for $\sim 50\%$ of most contemporary Ethiopian genomes, affects the overall allele frequency 9 spectrum to an extent that makes it hard to control for it and, at once, to discern between 10 subtly different, yet important, Eurasian sources (such as Anatolian or Levant Neolithic ones). 11 Here we re-assess pattern of allele sharing between the Eurasian component of Ethiopians (here 12 called "NAF" for Non African) and ancient and modern proxies area after having extracted NAF 13 from Ethiopians through ancestry deconvolution, and unveil a genomic signature compatible 14 with population movements that affected the Mediterranean area and the Levant after the fall 15 of the Minoan civilization. 16

17 Results and Discussion

¹⁸ To determine the most likely source of the Eurasian gene flow into the ancestral gene pool of ¹⁹ present-day Ethiopians we have used a combination of ancestry deconvolution (AD) and allele ²⁰ sharing methods⁶. AD refers to analyses that determine the likeliest ancestry composition of ²¹ genomes of individuals with mixed ancestry at fine haplotype resolution. These methods have

allowed us to i) exploit high quality modern data and ii) harness the power of allele sharing 22 tools on genetic fractions with no or reduced African contributions. Such a strategy, while 23 potentially beneficial, introduce a novel source of bias which we aimed to explore here. Par-24 ticularly, after AD of 120 Ethiopian genomes⁷, we assigned each genomic SNP into one of the 25 following four categories based on the method likelihoods (see Methods for further details): 1) 26 confidently non African (NAF); 2) low confidence non African (X); 3) low confidence African 27 (Y) and 4) confidently African (AF, consistently filtered out from our analyses). While basing 28 our inference on the NAF component alone, we here demonstrate that the component X does 29 account for a minority of the genome and, when analysed together with NAF does not quali-30 tatively change the results. Furthermore, when joining together the NAF and AF confidently 31 assigned components (to create "Joint" components) we recapitulate the signals of the global 32 population (prior to ancestry deconvolution), showing that the X and Y components are not 33 holding a considerable or peculiar genetic signature and hence ruling out, in this study, the role 34 of ancestry deconvolution as a potential source of artifacts. For the sake of clarity, out of the 35 four admixed Ethiopian populations available from Pagani et al. 2015 (Amhara, Oromo, So-36 mali, Wolayta), we report results only on the NAF component of Amhara. Comparable results 37 for the other three populations, which we chose not to lump into a heterogeneous Ethiopian 38 super-population to emphasize potential population-specific peculiarities, are provided in Sup-39 plementary Information. 40

A preliminary exploration of the NAF genomes through ADMIXTURE (Figure S5) and pro-41 jected PCA showed them to fall within the range of Eurasian populations, close to ancient 42 populations with a high Anatolian Neolithic component (e.g. Anatolia N and Minoans) (Fig-43 ure 1 and S1-S4). Notably, several Jewish populations from North Africa cluster with NAF 44 as well. The affinity between Anatolian Neolithic and NAF was further highlighted by f3 out-45 group statistic, in contrast to results obtained with the genomes before ancestry deconvolution 46 (Supplementary Figure S6). Overall, whole-genome sequences of all the Ethiopian populations 47 appear closer to ancient Near Eastern populations such as: Minoans, Natufian, Levant Neolithic 48 and Anatolian Neolithic. On the other hand, their NAF components appear closer to popula-49 tions with a high Anatolian rather than Levantine (such as Minoans, Sardinians and Anatolia 50 Neolithic) component. The highest genetic affinity to the NAF components was observed among 51 North African (Tunisian, Libyan and Moroccan) Jews (See Figure S6), as already seen in the 52 PCA clustering (See Figures 1, S1-S4). 53

We further dissected the observed affinity between NAF and Anatolian Neolithic-like popula-54 tions through a set of f_4 tests aimed at refining through more and more stringent comparisons 55 the best proxy population for the Eurasian layer (Figure 2). The whole-genomes, with both 56 African and Non-African component, are significantly closer to a Levantine ancestry rather than 57 Anatolian (Z-Score 2.98), with them being closer to Levant ChL individuals than Levant N. 58 On the other hand, NAF is shown to be closer to a Neolithic ancestry from Anatolia rather 59 than any Levantine one (Z-score -2.847) and, among Levantine populations, notably closer to 60 Levantine Chalcholitic than to Bronze Age groups or contemporary Lebanese. We further com-61 pare the best proxies for the Non African component using the top scoring populations from 62 Outgroup f3 analyses. Minoans appear to be as close to NAF as Anatolian Neolithic individuals 63 (Z-Scores < 1). When we delved into the North African Jews signals, they broadly show affinity 64 with NAF with particular reference to Jews from Tunisian. Similar trends were observed for 65

all other Ethiopian populations (Figure S7 and Table S1) and did not change when considering 66 alternative combinations of deconvoluted components (Figure 2). Given that our ability to pinpoint the actual source of the NAF component is inherently limited by the availability of 68 ancient and modern populations, we used qpGraph (Supplementary Figures S8.S9 and S10) and 69 qpAdm to model NAF as a mixture of the major axes of genetic diversity that best described 70 the Mediterranean area at the time of the studied event, following Lazaridis et al. 2016. When 71 looking at the global genomes, our qpAdm results replicate a Levant N origin for the Eurasian 72 component of Ethiopians³ (Figure 3, left column). For further results on the other Ethiopian 73 populations see Table S2 and Supplementary Figure S11. In sum, similarly to Minoan and 74 Tunisian Jewish populations, the non African component of Ethiopian populations can be best 75 modelled as a mixture of $\sim 85\%$ Anatolian N and $\sim 15\%$ CHG composition of ancestries (Figure 76 3, columns 2, 3, 4).77 While this mixed ancestry component likely reached Ethiopia only within the last 3,000 years, 78

these results should not be interpreted as involving a direct connection or descent line between 79 Neolithic Anatolia and Ethiopia. Instead, these results can potentially be seen as informative 80 for the identification of candidates among the available ancient and modern populations which, 81 following geographic and chronological considerations, may be suitable proxies for one or more 82 populations that mediated the Eurasian gene flow to East Africa. Of the ones analyzed here, 83 Minoans and Tunisian Jews seem to provide the two closest matches to NAF, adding on top 84 of the genetic evidence a criteria of space/time compatibility. A tentative links between these 85 three groups may be provided by the maritime trade routes connecting Crete (home to the 86 Minoan culture) to the Levant^{8,9,10} and by the shuffling role played by a horde of nomads who 87 navigated throughout the Mediterranean Sea 3 kya: the Sea People. These tribes left traces of 88 their passage both in Crete, in Anatolia, when they fought the Hittite Empire and in Egypt 89 and the Levant, and are told to have settled in the land of Canaan, known also as Palestine¹¹. 90 Interestingly, among those tribes that settled in Palestine there were: Denven, Tjeker and 91 Peleset. Although there are different theories around the origin of each of the tribes, there are 92 suggestions that link the Denyen with the tribe of Dan, from which Jews from Ethiopia have 93 been said to descend and Peleset to their neighboring Philistines¹². The role of Sea People 94 may therefore be crucial in explaining a temporary presence of a Minoan-like ancestry in the 95 Levant, bringing Anatolian-like components to levels as high as 85%. A pulse of populations 96 with Anatolian-rich ancestry has just been recently detected in Iron Age Levant, appearing 97 and disappearing from the archaeological record within a range of few centuries¹³. Our results 98 offer a solution to this disappearance, given that their signal may have become erased as a 99 consequence of major warfare after 1000 BCE¹⁴, bringing these genetic components towards 100 Ethiopia and North Africa. 101

In conclusion, our work shows that when the mixing components are deeply differentiated, such as in the case of contemporary Ethiopians, ancestry deconvolution increases the sensitivity of allele sharing tests and enables to fully exploit the high quality of modern genomes.

105 Acknowledgments

- 106 The authors would like to thank Dr. Doron Behar and Dr. Iosif Lazaridis for fruitful discussion
- on an early version of this manuscript. This work was supported by the European Union through
 the European Regional Development Fund Project No. 2014-2020.4.01.16-0024, MOBTT53
- 109 (LM, LP).



Figure 1: Principal component analysis of modern West Eurasian populations used as a scaffold (grey points) on which we projected ancient and ancestry deconvoluted genomes. To highlight the populations studied we coloured European hunther-gatheres, ancient genomes from Anatolia and Levant areas, Jews from North Africa and Amhara whole and NAF genomes. Variance explained by PC1 is 0.9% and PC2 is 0.3%



Figure 2: f_4 statistic test on Amhara in form of (PopA,PopB;Test,Mbuti) to assess genetic similarity between Amhara and respective NAF genomes to pairs of several Near Eastern populations. A and B populations are listed in the left and right side of the plot, respectively. Values in x axis indicate the Z-Scores, we draw two lines to highlight |z-Scores|=2 and 3. Points with |z-Score|>3 indicate a clear affinity of the test population towards one of the other population. Amhara's segments tested: Amhara whole-genome (Amhara, in blue), the Non African component (Amhara NAF, in yellow), Amhara African and Non African components together (Amhara Joint, in violet) and Amhara NAF with X component (Amhara NAF+X, in orange).



Figure 3: Modelling Amhara, Amhara_NAF, Minoans and Jews from Tunisia as a mix of Mota and Near Eastern populations, with 2 and 3 ways admixtures. Violet indicates the Levantine component, pink the Caucasus Hunter-Gatherers, light green the African component and light blue highlights the Anatolian ancestry. The left side of the graph lists the sources used to model the populations in the x axis; unfilled boxes indicate unfeasible results or p-value < 0.01.

STAR Methods

¹¹¹ Dataset and Samples

We merged different datasets available containing both ancient and modern DNA, African 112 and Eurasian populations from the following publications^{15,16,17,3,18,19,20,21,5,22,23,24,25,26,27,28} 113 Northeast African populations whole-genome sequences were taken from Pagani 2015⁷, and 114 included 5 modern Ethiopian populations: Amhara, Gumuz, Oromo, Somali and Wolayta. We 115 chose to focus on the whole genome sequence data rather than on SNP arrays¹ to increase the 116 number of available SNPs to be compared with aDNA and other references. To maximize the 117 number of individuals typed at each SNP, we downsampled the dataset to 1037084 markers to 118 match the ones of Human Origin Array on which most of the ancient DNA samples were typed. 119 For ease of exposition we chose Amhara, the population with the highest Eurasian fraction 120 among the available ones⁷, to represent all main results. We provide full description of all other 121 Ethiopian populations in Supplementary Material. Similarly, we chose not to group all the 122 available samples within a single "Ethiopian" population, to allow for group-specific stories to 123 emerge. 124

125 Ancestry Deconvolution

126 Subsetting Modern Genomes

From phased genomes, we refined the ancestral components identification in Eastern Africans 127 individuals provided by Pagani 2015 with PCAdmix²⁹. For every 20 SNPs window of the 128 genome, there is a probability for the window to have a source of African (AF) ancestry or 129 Non African (NAF) ancestry (in which case the probability is 1 - AF), which is given by fbk 130 values and refined with Viterbi algorithm³⁰. We set a fbk threshold of 0.9 probability in order 131 to assign every window to either one layer of ancestry or the other. If a window did not 132 reach the threshold for any component, it would have been labeled as unassigned. CEU (Utah 133 residents with ancestry from northern and western Europe) were used as a proxy for the Non 134 African component, and Gumuz (the Ethiopian population showing minimal introgression) were 135 used as a proxy for the African component following Pagani et al. 2015. Once the ancestral 136 components were detected, we created the "Genomes Subsets" using the windows that reached 137 the threshold. The "Genomes Subsets" are genomes in which for every haplotype only the 138 confidently assigned African or Non African component is retained, while the rest is assigned as 139 "missing data". Therefore, they are partial genomes in which only the sequences derived from a 140 specific ancestry (either African or Non African) are present (see Yelmen et al. 2019 for further details). The ancestry deconvolution process has been applied to East African populations 142 only from Pagani 2015 populations, namely: Amhara, Gumuz, Oromo, Ethiopian Somali and 143 Wolayta. 144

¹⁴⁵ Sifting through all possible ancestry fractions

To test for possible biases introduced by using CEU as proxy for the Non African component, 146 we further divided the deconvolution results into different segments to investigate specifically 147 the parts of the genome that were not assigned to either ancestry. We retrieved the different 148 components from the fbk values alone, without refining them with the Viterbi algorithm, to 149 maintain all possible segments information. For each of the two ancestries we obtained two 150 components: X and Y, which held the sequences assigned with 51-90% and 10-50% respectively, 151 representing the unassigned sequences in the masking process. The component X is made 152 of sequences that were not assigned to NAF, representing the unassigned segments that we 153 expect to be Eurasian traces along with spurious African ones; the component Y is made of 154 segments which we expect to be characterized mainly by African traces. The X and Y segments 155 correspond each for 7% of the genome, and we expect their contribution to the final the results 156 to be minimal. 157

¹⁵⁸ Principal Component and ADMIXTURE Analyses

We performed PCA as an initial screening method on the dataset with smartpca from EIGEN-159 SOFT^{31,32}, using the lsqproject option and autoshrink:YES. We used modern European and 160 Near Eastern populations with minimal missingness (-geno 0.1 with PLINK³³) to compute 161 PCs and projected the rest of the samples included the ancient samples and the Ethiopian 162 NAF genomes. We used ADMIXTURE³⁴ software to perform supervised clustering of ancient 163 and decolvoluted genomes using as reference modern European and Near Eastern genomes along 164 with Yoruba as African, Gumuz as East African and Han as East Asian. We used R and ggplot2 165 package for visualization 35,36 . 166

¹⁶⁷ Frequency-Based Allele-Sharing Analyses

We used POPSTATS³⁷ to calculate Outgroup f3 statistic in the form of f3 (Test, A, Mbuti) 168 with Test being the Ethiopian whole-genome sequences and the NAF individuals, and A being 169 the same set of all possible chronological and geographical proxies for the admixture. To further 170 infer the Non-African component we used Admixtools 4.1^{26} . We performed f_4 analyses using 171 qpDstat along with the option F4:YES with this format: A,B;Test,O. As Test populations 172 we used Ethiopian populations with non-zero contribution from the Non-African component 173 (namely: Amhara, Somali, Wolayta and Oromo). With Admixtools we performed qpWave and 174 qpAdm with the set of Right populations firstly defined by Lazaridis 2016, with the exception 175 of Onge, which is not present in our analyses. Right populations used: Ust Ishim, Kostenki14, 176 MA1, Han, Papuan, Chukchi, Karitiana, EHG, Natufian, Switzerland HG, WHG, We reported 177 qpAdm results that show significance < 0.001 in qpWave, which was performed with the set 178 of Left populations, without the Test population. We used for every analysis a custom list of 179 Left populations to test a two-ways or a three-ways admixture. The Left populations used to 180 perform qpAdm were selected in this order: the Test population, A and Mota for the two-ways 181

admixture; the Test population, A, B and Mota for the three-ways admixture. Where A stands for the top scoring populations in the Outgroup f3 analyses and B for CHG. We reported both significative and non significative results as they might be both indicative for the purpose of our analyses. We set our threshold to accept a result as significant at 0.01. We then used the information gathered from qpAdm to build a qpGraph model. We proceeded modelling qpGraph tree starting from a simple tree topology, then adding populations of interest at each step and modifying the topology to minimize the f2 and f4 Z-Score values.

189 Bias Testing

We performed further analyses in order to detect in the unassigned sequences (X and Y com-190 ponents) whether important signal were lost in the deconvolution process. We compared our 191 test populations with the f_4 statistic using this format: A,B,Test,O. As Test populations we 192 used: Ethiopians whole genome sequences, NAF genomes, Ethiopians J, where "J" stands 193 for "Joint". The Joint individuals, created for each ethnic group with Eurasian contribution 194 (Amhara, Oromo, Somali and Wolayta), are build as a synthetic population made of the NAF 195 and AF sequences refined by the Viterbi algorithm that passed the fbk 90% threshold, and thus not yielding the unassigned segments. To the NAF and the Ethiopians J individuals, we 197 added the X segments, to test if the unassigned component would give different results from 198 the Non-African component NAF alone, which would indicate presence of biases in the decon-199 volution step. To the Ethiopians J individuals along with the X component we then added the 200 Y component as well to mimic the whole-genome. As A and B we used the possible proxy pop-201 ulations that may have contributed to the admixture: Levant N, Anatolia N, Levant ChL. 202 We modelled the NAF along the X component with qpAdm, using the same Left and Right 203 populations used for the main analyses to investigate how the X component can be modelled and if the NAF with the addition of X could be modelled as the Non African component, which 205 could indicate no bias. 206

207 References

- Pagani, Luca et al. (2012). "Ethiopian genetic diversity reveals linguistic stratification and complex influences on the Ethiopian gene pool". In: American Journal of Human Genetics 91.1, pp. 83–96. DOI: 10.1016/j.ajhg.2012.05.015.
- Pickrell, Joseph K. et al. (2014). "Ancient west Eurasian ancestry in southern and eastern
 Africa". In: Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America
 111.7, pp. 2632–2637. DOI: 10.1073/pnas.1313787111.
- Lazaridis, Iosif et al. (2016). "Genomic insights into the origin of farming in the ancient Near East". In: *Nature* 536.7617, pp. 419–424. DOI: 10.1038/nature19310.

Hodgson, Jason A. et al. (2014). "Early Back-to-Africa Migration into the Horn of Africa". In:
 PLoS Genetics 10.6, e1004393. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pgen.1004393.

- Harney, Éadaoin et al. (2018). "Ancient DNA from Chalcolithic Israel reveals the role of population mixture in cultural transformation". In: *Nature Communications* 9.1, p. 3336. DOI: 10.1038/s41467-018-05649-9.
- Yelmen, Burak et al. (2019). "Ancestry-specific analyses reveal differential demographic histories
 and opposite selective pressures in modern South Asian populations". In: *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, pp. 1–15. DOI: 10.1093/molbev/msz037.
- Pagani, Luca et al. (2015). "Tracing the Route of Modern Humans out of Africa by Using
 225 Human Genome Sequences from Ethiopians and Egyptians". In: American Journal of
 Human Genetics 96.6, pp. 986–991. DOI: 10.1016/j.ajhg.2015.04.019.
- Moore, Frank and Lawrence E Stager (2006). "Cypro-Minoan Inscriptions Found in Ashkelon".
 In: Israel Exploration Journal 56.2, pp. 129–159.
- David Ben-Shlomo, Eleni Nodarou, and Jeremy B. Rutter (2011). "Transport Stirrup Jars from the Southern Levant: New Light on Commodity Exchange in the Eastern Mediterranean".
 In: American Journal of Archaeology 115.3, p. 329. DOI: 10.3764/aja.115.3.0329.
- Rüden, Constance von (2013). "Beyond the East-West Dichotomy in Syrian and Levantine
 Wall Paintings". In: Critical Approaches to Ancient Near Eastern Art Taraqji 1999. DOI:
 10.1515/9781614510352.55.
- Bryce, Trevor (2005). The Kingdom of the Hittites. New Edition. Oxford University Press. ISBN:
 ISBN 0-19-928132-7.
- D'Amato, Raffaele and Andrea Salimbeti (2015). Sea Peoples of the Bronze Age Mediterranean
 c.1400 BC-1000 BC. Osprey Publishing. ISBN: ISBN 978-1472806816.
- Feldman, Michal et al. (2019). "Ancient DNA sheds light on the genetic origins of early Iron
 Age Philistines". In: Science Advances 5.7. DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.aax0061.
- Hayes, John H. and Jeffrey K. Kuan (1991). "The Final Years of Samaria (730-720 BC)". In:
 Biblica 72.2, pp. 153–181.
- Behar, Doron M. et al. (2010). "The genome-wide structure of the Jewish people". In: Nature 466.7303, pp. 238–242. DOI: 10.1038/nature09103.
- Behar, Doron M. et al. (2013). "No Evidence from Genome-Wide Data of a Khazar Origin for
 the Ashkenazi Jews". In: *Human Biology* 85.6, pp. 859–900. DOI: 10.3378/027.085.0604.
- Lazaridis, Iosif et al. (2014). "Ancient human genomes suggest three ancestral populations for present-day Europeans". In: *Nature* 513.7518, pp. 409–413. DOI: 10.1038/nature13673.

Haber, Marc et al. (2017). "Continuity and Admixture in the Last Five Millennia of Levantine
History from Ancient Canaanite and Present-Day Lebanese Genome Sequences". In: Amer-

ican Journal of Human Genetics 101.2, pp. 274–282. DOI: 10.1016/j.ajhg.2017.06.013.
 Lazaridis, Iosif et al. (2017). "Genetic origins of the Minoans and Mycenaeans". In: Nature 548.7666, pp. 214–218. DOI: 10.1038/nature23310.

- Mathieson, Iain et al. (2015). "Genome-wide patterns of selection in 230 ancient Eurasians". In:
 Nature 528.7583, pp. 499-503. DOI: 10.1038/nature16152.
- The 1000 Genomes Project Consortium (2015). "A global reference for human genetic variation".
 In: Nature 526.7571, pp. 68–74. DOI: 10.1038/nature15393.
- Fu, Qiaomei et al. (2016). "The genetic history of Ice Age Europe". In: *Nature* 534.7606, pp. 200–205. DOI: 10.1038/nature17993.
- Haak, Wolfgang et al. (2015). "Massive migration from the steppe was a source for Indo European languages in Europe". In: *Nature* 522.7555, pp. 207–211. DOI: 10.1038/nature14317.
- Mallick, Swapan et al. (2016). "The Simons Genome Diversity Project: 300 genomes from 142
 diverse populations". In: *Nature* 538, p. 201.

Lipson, Mark et al. (2017). "Parallel palaeogenomic transects reveal complex genetic history of
 early European farmers". In: *Nature* 551, p. 368.

- Patterson, Nick et al. (2012). "Ancient admixture in human history". In: *Genetics* 192.3, pp. 1065–1093. DOI: 10.1534/genetics.112.145037.
- Raghavan, Maanasa et al. (2013). "Upper Palaeolithic Siberian genome reveals dual ancestry
 of Native Americans". In: *Nature* 505, p. 87.
- Jones, Eppie R et al. (2015). "Upper Palaeolithic genomes reveal deep roots of modern Eurasians".
 In: Nature Communications 6, p. 8912.
- Brisbin, Abra et al. (2012). "PCAdmix: Principal Components-Based Assignment of Ancestry
 Along Each Chromosome in Individuals with Admixed Ancestry from Two or More Populations". In: Human Biology 84.4, pp. 343–364. DOI: 10.3378/027.084.0401.
- Ryan, Matthew S. and Graham R. Nudd (1993). The Viterbi Algorithm. Tech. rep. Coventry,
 UK, UK.
- Patterson, Nick, Alkes L Price, and David Reich (2006). "Population structure and eigenanalysis." In: *PLoS genetics* 2.12, e190. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pgen.0020190.
- Price, Alkes L. et al. (2006). "Principal components analysis corrects for stratification in genomewide association studies". In: *Nature Genetics* 38.8, pp. 904–909. DOI: 10.1038/ng1847.
- Purcell, Shaun et al. (2007). "PLINK: a tool set for whole-genome association and populationbased linkage analyses." In: American journal of human genetics 81.3, pp. 559–75. DOI:
 10.1086/519795.
- Alexander, D H, J Novembre, and K Lange (2009). "Fast model-based estimation of ancestry
 in unrelated individuals". In: *Genome Research* 19.9, pp. 1655–1664. DOI: 10.1101/gr.
 094052.109.
- Wickham, Hadley (2016). ggplot2: Elegant Graphics for Data Analysis. Springer-Verlag New York. ISBN: 978-3-319-24277-4.
- R Development Core Team (2008). R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing.
 ISBN 3-900051-07-0. R Foundation for Statistical Computing. Vienna, Austria.
- Skoglund, Pontus et al. (2015). "Genetic evidence for two founding populations of the Americas".
 In: Nature 525.7567, pp. 104–108. DOI: 10.1038/nature14895.